

THE PRODUCTION OF A LULA-DILMA CO-PRESENCE EFFECT IN THE POLITICAL MEDIA DISCOURSE IN BRAZILIAN WEEKLY MAGAZINES FROM 2010

Elaine de Moraes SANTOS*
Edson Carlos ROMUALDO**

- **ABSTRACT:** Foregrounded by the theoretical and methodological framework of the French Discourse Analysis, the current study embodies the Foucauldian idea of History as a discontinuous set of temporalities and recovers the discourse of the most important event in Brazil during 2010, when Dilma Rousseff was indicated as the presidential candidate of the Workers' Party (PT), as the successor of Luis Inácio Lula da Silva. Facts and events that constituted the conditions of possibility for the presidential race during the period are discussed, while the power relations that delineate the political and media discourse are problematized, as our paper analyzes the regularities/dispersions that guide Dilma's and Lula's discourses within a 208-issues archive of the weekly magazines *CartaCapital*, *Época*, *IstoÉ* and *Veja* published during the election year. Results show the production of a discursive effect of a Lula-Dilma co-presence, which, in three of the magazines, show a lack of qualification of the candidate's image, as a product manufactured for electoral purposes. On the other hand, in *CartaCapital*, as dispersion, the discursive effect highlights the partnership of the two subjects as essential for the continuity of the Worker's Party policy.
- **KEYWORDS:** Co-presence. Regularities. Political and social media discourse. History.

Introduction

Michael Foucault (2008, p. 293) wrote that history is not a single time space, but “a multiplicity of time spans that entangle and envelop one another”. This assumption explains the analytical movements we propose in this text. Our view at the multiplicity mentioned by the author evokes here the discursive threads of a singular political event in the Brazilian context in 2010 – the repercussion of the nomination of Dilma Vana Rousseff as presidential candidate for the Worker's Party (PT) found in printed weekly magazines.

* Federal University of Mato Grosso do Sul (UFMT), Faculty of Arts, Letters and Communication, Campo Grande – MT – Brazil. Doctor of Letters. proflainemoraes@gmail.com.

** State University of Maringá (UEM), Center for Human Sciences Languages and Arts, Maringá – PR – Brazil. Teacher of Department of Linguistic and Literary Theories. ecromualdo@uol.com.br.

In a historical reading, in the tangle of facts and events that make up the *conditions of possibility* (FOUCAULT, 2010a) of the presidential run of the period, the understanding of our object includes the problematization of various aspects: the emergence of a candidate without electoral experience, for the succession of a highly popular government; the power relations that are depicted in contemporary society as a hybrid discourse, marked by the coexistence of different spheres - the politico-media complex; and the *regularities/dispersions* (FOUCAULT, 2010b) that guide the discourses regarding the subjects Dilma and Lula in the pages of the *discursive practices* (FOUCAULT, 2010b) under analysis.

In order to enter the *risky order of discourse* (FOUCAULT, 2010a, p. 7) composing the described scenario, we gathered, as *archive* (FOUCAULT, 2010b) for investigation, the 208 editions of the magazines *CartaCapital*, *Época*, *IstoÉ* and *Veja*, published in 2010. In possession of this material, we adopted the theoretical and methodological principles of the Discourse Analysis from the French school, especially regarding the thoughts of the aforementioned French philosopher. Moreover, we selected the enunciative series that promote a regularity of the discursive effect of a Lula-Dilma co-presence expressed in media, also focusing on the dispersion of the produced meanings.

This process, as part of a larger research, is organized in three parts in this article. In the first one, we discuss what constitutes media, politics and the political media discourse category. In the second section, we outline the notion of co-presence as a discursive effect in order to explore, in the last part of this paper, the conditions for the emergence of this effect on the regularity of our archive of elections. With this path, we try to echo the words of the French philosopher, through the realization of a reading of history “[...] not as a great continuity underneath an apparent discontinuity, but as a tangle of superimposed discontinuities.” (FOUCAULT, 2008, p. 293).¹

Historical (dis)continuities and the political media discourse

When reflecting on contemporary sociability and measuring the re-signification of the ways of political interaction, the power relations that permeate many of the movements caused in humanity by the arrival of the third millennium are undeniable. The unstable interaction *a priori* of two distinct domains - media and politics – has generated several doubts in a humanity suspicious of the new discursive order, which presents itself within the discontinuity of history that marks the relation between the strategies of publicity of the public speech and the supremacy of discourses considered as eminently political.

On the list of common questions about the role of media, are those related to the cases in which media enters the political universe, that could be related either to the

¹ The original fragment reads the following: “[...] não como uma grande continuidade sob uma descontinuidade aparente, mas como um emaranhado de descontinuidades sobrepostas.” (FOUCAULT, 2008, p. 293).

government, to an electoral campaign, or to politicians' image management that occupy relevant positions in the Executive and Legislative powers. For Rubim (2000, p. 11), "[...] social scientists and politicians tend to oscillate between silence and attribution of a stigma of subalternity to communication in its interlocution with politics."²

In the context of the dispute that separates political scientists from social communicators, there is still a strong belief that the conjunction of media and politics is responsible for a depoliticization of the logic and essence of the second: "The insertion of politics in the reasoning of the commercial communication – the one of short, simple and "dialogued" messages – produces as one of its main effects, the deletion of the political debate" (BARONAS, 2005, p. 101)³.

For Lima (2004), a public event with the dimension of a presidential run can no longer be operationalized without the intervention of media. In fact, according to the author, the notion of 'public event' acquires a differentiated status with the advent of the media:

[...] before its development, a 'public event' implied sharing a common place (space); co-presence; seeing, hearing, visual appearance, spoken word; dialogue. After the advent of the media, a 'public event' is not restricted to a shared space. The "public" might be distant in time and space. This way, the media complements the traditional constitution of 'public', but also extends, transforms and replaces it. The 'public' is now mediatized. (LIMA, 2004, p. 51)⁴.

The media field is defined by Rodrigues (1997, p. 152) as a mediation institution comprising diverse instruments (formally and informally organized), with the main purpose of constructing legitimate values (to a certain extent, divergent from those of Institutions), "[...] which acquire in modern societies the right to autonomously mobilize the public space, in order to pursue its objectives and regarding its interests."⁵. Miguel (2002, p. 163), in turn, addresses this conflict with a reflection that we consider quite pertinent, since the author considers that the focus of many questions about

² The original fragment reads the following: "[...] os cientistas sociais e políticos majoritariamente tendem a oscilar entre o silêncio e a atribuição de um estigma de subalternidade à comunicação em sua interlocução com a política." (RUBIM, 2000, p. 11).

³ The original fragment reads the following: "A inserção da política na lógica da comunicação comercial – a de mensagens breves, simples e 'dialogadas' – produz como um de seus principais efeitos o apagamento do debate político." (BARONAS, 2005, p. 101).

⁴ The original fragment reads the following: [...] antes de seu desenvolvimento, um 'evento público' implicava compartilhamento de um lugar (espaço) comum; co-presença; visão, audição, aparência visual, palavra falada; diálogo. Depois do desenvolvimento da mídia, um evento para ser 'evento público' não está limitado à partilha de um lugar comum. O "público" pode estar distante no tempo e no espaço. Dessa forma, a mídia suplementa a forma tradicional de constituição do 'público' mas também a estende, transforma e substitui. O 'público' agora é midiaticizado. (LIMA, 2004, p. 51).

⁵ The original fragment reads the following: "[...] que adquirem nas sociedades modernas o direito a mobilizarem autonomamente o espaço público, em ordem à persecução dos seus objetivos e ao respeito dos seus interesses." (RODRIGUES, 1997, p. 152).

the role played by the media revolves around not what it specifically shows, but what is silenced on the subjects published, considering that “[...] the problem is that the discourses it conveys do not include the plurality of perspectives and interests present in society.”⁶

Beyond this two-way perspective, in which each of the two domains influence and is concomitantly constituted, we believe that it is extremely relevant to focus on the political field as a rather unstable social space. In Bourdieu’s (1989) sociological perspective, the so-called *political field* is described as a field of forces and of struggles, through which agents, in the name of power relations, remain in constant conflict.

Our understanding of this perspective already perceives a marketing nature in the products and political strategies inherent to this field. With or without media vehicles, the driving force of politics is guaranteed in the constant construction of public opinion given certain political discourse. According to Berger (1997, p. 7), in the relationship between the *Journalistic Field* and the *Political Field*, the first finds its material in the second, in a privileged way. In the author’s words:

[...] the homology between the Political Field and the Journalistic Field is made through the correspondence between the events produced by a subgroup of the Political Field which, through spectacularization, appear on the agenda of the newspapers and, thus, dialogue with the agents of their own field. The symbolic power of politicians is to make people believe, because their capital is also credibility. But this credibility needs the support of the press, because, when informing, it is recognizing some to the detriment of others, and thus acclaiming them⁷.

In the search for understanding the ways through which this acclamation takes place in the discursive practices of the weekly magazines in our archive of the elections, our first step, after addressing the perception of these two fields and how this relationship occurs, is to delimit our work in this area as the reading of a political event as a media product; so the analysis we undertake in this research is related to an object that we understand to be of a compound nature: a *political media discourse*.

To indicate the action that the media develops with the political facts that are published in their vehicles, Weber (1999) explains that the political media discourse arises from the relation between the media vehicles, the politics itself and the subjects, and that it

⁶ The original fragment reads the following: “[...] o problema é que os discursos que ela veicula não esgotam a pluralidade de perspectivas e interesses presente na sociedade.” (MIGUEL, 2002, p. 163).

⁷ The original fragment reads the following: “[...] a homologia entre o Campo Político e o Campo do Jornalismo se faz através da correspondência entre os acontecimentos produzidos por um subgrupo do Campo Político para, pela espetacularização, constarem da pauta do jornal e, assim, dialogar com os agentes do seu próprio campo. O poder simbólico dos políticos é fazer crer, pois o seu capital é também a credibilidade. Mas esta credibilidade necessita do aval da imprensa, pois, informando, ela está reconhecendo uns em detrimento de outros e, assim, consagrando-os. (BERGER, 1997, p. 7).

[...] alludes to a complex and interdependent configuration of power, as besides including the game of passions brought by the subject, it also excludes the complacent discourse of media supremacy over politics, or the discourse that admits the independence of politics from the media. (WEBER, 1999, p. 2)⁸.

In most studies, however, we find a movement contrary to Weber's, with hypotheses that support the idea that politics is depoliticized when media interferes by publicizing its events or when politics resorts to advertising resources to promote their discourses. Parallel to this idea of "contamination" of the public speech by marketing practices, which are recognized as common in media vehicles, there is still the current question about what is the true role of media – dissemination of information/communication or the common practice of shaping opinions.

In fact, this discussion leads to questioning the objectivity or impartiality of the media in relation to the content it disseminates, as media also acts symbolically as a tool of political discourse according to its engagement, and therefore interferes directly or indirectly in the (formation of) public opinion.

Once we determined the way our research comprehends media, politics and their relationship regarding political events such as presidential elections, in the next section, we present the notion of co-presence as a discourse effect inherent in the political media discourse that we focus on.

Co-presence as a discourse effect

The notion of co-presence, of corporeal nature, appears in the writings of Goffman (2010, 2012, 2013), Giddens (2009) and Merleau-Ponty (1999), in reference to face-to-face interactions in which individuals perceive and react to a mutual presence, consisting, more specifically, of the ways through which the subjects become accessible to others, in immediate situations that favor the physical contact between interlocutors.

Parallel to this view are the assumptions that conceive the sensation or the so-called sense of presence of individuals, with the communication process achieved through the mediation of electronic vehicles, for example. According to Zhao (2002), one of the great problems in the present forms of conceptualizing presence lies in the fact that there is an equalization between the concepts of presence and sense of presence.

With the intention of avoiding confusion, the author introduces the concept of *mode of presence*, which structures the physical relationships between individuals, while

⁸ The original fragment reads the following: [...] remete a uma configuração de poder complexo e interdependente, pois além de incluir o jogo de paixões interposto pelo sujeito, exclui o confortável discurso da supremacia da mídia sobre a política, ou aquele que admite a independência da política em relação às mídias. (WEBER, 1999, p. 2).

the *sense of presence* constitutes the subjective experience that allows an individual to perceive the other in a given environment. *Sense of presence* is, therefore, the subjective experience of being present in a specific environment outside one's body, which is produced through the impinging of external sensory stimuli upon the sense organs of the perceiver.

In the analysis carried out by Dias (2008) the notion-concept of "*corpografia*"⁹ appears as an element arising from the materiality of digital media. Gallo and Romão (2011), in turn, analyze the role played by the individuals who surf the internet and use the artifacts of this technology to "shape their emergence in social media and to make their body speak through the letters (language)" (GALLO; ROMÃO, 2011, p. 14)¹⁰.

For the authors, "[...] the body is discursively an effect of constant presence originated by the impossibility of being there at all times [...]" (GALLO; ROMÃO, 2011, p. 16)¹¹. The presence of the individuals they call "surfing-subjects" can be understood as an effect of discourse in the situations in which they enter the universe of possibilities, which is inherent to all technological-digital machinery of contemporaneity, and present their body in the language/discourse.

Santaella (2007, p. 236) also discusses the notions of presence-absence based on the relation of the media with the cyberspace, explaining that in the virtual space, both the presence and the lack of presence - the absence - interchange and overlap in the same environment, "[...] generating the experience of ubiquity: to be there, from where they call me, and to be here, where I am called, at the same time."¹²

On that subject, the author explains how, in radio and television, for example, a "light ubiquity" is created, meaning that "[...] listening about or seeing images of an event is a kind of mental transportation that generates the illusion of being in the event witnessing the facts." (SANTAELLA, 2007, p. 236)¹³. Although not using the term co-presence, in the text "The present body", Cardoso (1999, p. 47) also talks about the inventive creations of electronic correspondences, which use new codes to represent corporal expression and seek to "bring back the intensity of the physical presence and the carnality of communication."¹⁴

⁹ The author created this term to express how the body (*corpo*) could be a relevant tool to understand the doings of discourse and enunciation through graphic (*grafia*) representations.

¹⁰ The original fragment reads the following: "dar corpo à sua emergência na rede e para fazer falar o (seu) corpo presentificado nas letras" (GALLO; ROMÃO, 2011, p. 14).

¹¹ The original fragment reads the following: "[...] corpo é discursivamente um efeito de presença constante furado pelo impossível estar lá a todo tempo [...]" (GALLO; ROMÃO, 2011, p. 16).

¹² The original fragment reads the following: "[...] gerando a vivência da ubiquidade: estar lá, de onde me chamam, e estar aqui, onde sou chamado, ao mesmo tempo." (SANTAELLA, 2007, p. 236).

¹³ The original fragment reads the following: "[...] ouvir sobre ou ver imagens de um acontecimento é uma espécie de transporte mental que gera a ilusão de estarmos dentro do acontecimento como testemunha dos fatos." (SANTAELLA, 2007, p. 236).

¹⁴ The original fragment reads the following: "trazer de volta a intensidade da presença física e das marcas carnisais de comunicação." (CARDOSO, 1999, p. 47).

The immersion in our archive of the 2010 presidential elections in Brazil shows that, especially through the discourses of political subjects in images printed on weekly magazines, the historicity of the political media discourse favors the creation of an illusion in the reader, such as pointed by the authors mentioned above. The illusion aspect found in the weekly magazines that we analyze, however, instead of making readers feel present in the scenes and facts about the candidates, creates an effect of presence and/or co-presence of the subjects, understanding and considering as reality the discourses of events portrayed through the lens of the media.

Regarding the role played by images, Le Breton (2001, p. 31) explains that, in different social universes, they “attempt to culturally reduce the mystery of the body”¹⁵. For him, “[...] a myriad of unusual images delineate the dotted presence of an inapprehensible transient object, but still apparently undeniable.”¹⁶ Knowing the communicative potential of the image, the displacement of the notion of co-presence that we propose consists, therefore, in focusing on the communicative situations established visually or verbally (by the presentation of images or through what can be said about them) as discursive events proper to the printed media. In the case of the communication printed in weekly magazines, the use of photographs is undoubtedly the element that favors the representation of empirical objects as theoretical objects, and therefore, produces the effects that mark the bodily presence in the discourse.

In this process, we also investigate the discursive scenes in which the co-presence of political subjects are identified through photo collages and/or verbal references of isolated images of the two subjects that present their bodily coexistence through enunciation, producing a symbolic effect of co-presence of one of them or both. In the coverage of the 2010 presidential elections by the weekly magazines that compose our archive, the popularity of the government of Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva’s configures an “apparently undeniable” “dotted presence” that transfers visibility of a strong public figure to his candidate, which is required to win the election.

Thus, based on the Foucauldian premise that “no event is immaterial; it is always at the level of materiality that it takes effect, that it is an effect” (FOUCAULT, 2010b, p.57)¹⁷, our understanding of co-presence as a discursive effect comprehends the presence/co-presence of political subjects as the result of the production of meanings through the materialities of discursive spaces (politics and media) that are constructed and sold as informational. Destabilizing the effects of evidence created in these discourses is a pertinent tool for reading the fragments of reality that circulate the printed communication vehicles of the country, especially in campaigns and electoral disputes.

¹⁵ The original fragment reads the following: “tentam reduzir culturalmente o mistério do corpo se sucedem”. (LE BRETON, 2001, p. 31).

¹⁶ The original fragment reads the following: “[...] uma miríade de imagens insólitas delinea a presença em pontilhado de um objeto fugaz inapreensível e, no entanto, aparentemente incontestável.” (LE BRETON, 2001, p. 31).

¹⁷ The original fragment reads the following: “nenhum o acontecimento é imaterial; é sempre ao nível da materialidade que ele adquire efeito, que ele é efeito” (FOUCAULT, 2010b, p. 57).

The Lula-Dilma co-presence effect in weekly magazines: regularities and dispersions

Through a perspective aligned with Foucault, analyzing any domains or objects as discursive is to “[...] look at the ways in which the discourse plays a role inside the strategical system in which the power is involved, for which power is working.” (FOUCAULT, 2010c, p. 253).¹⁸ When it comes to doing so in the compound field of what is political and mediatic, this relationship with the power of discourses is even clearer.

Aware of the power relations within this movement, our understanding of the 2010 electoral year through the archive of Brazilian weekly magazines takes the bundle of discourses produced as a series of events “[...] differing in amplitude, chronological breadth, and capacity to produce effects.” (FOUCAULT, 1979, p. 5).¹⁹ For the French philosopher, “[...] an utterance is always an event that neither the language (*langue*) nor meaning can quite exhaust.” (FOUCAULT, 2010a, p. 31).²⁰

When presenting the relation between this unit of analysis, the enunciative function and man, his main object of study, the author allows us to enter into historicity through the relation that a statement maintains with others, its repeatable materiality, but also through its rarity, considering that the enunciative function never repeats itself. We must also consider that, although there is a repeatable materiality of utterances, it arises as a singular event within an archive, materialized by a subject inscribed in a historical and social context.

Thinking about a political media archive within this perspective is to see it as “a practice that causes a multiplicity of statements to emerge as so many regular events” (FOUCAULT, 2010b, p. 147).²¹ In this sense, our investigation of the mechanisms of construction of these discourses in the electoral year is not premised by temporal notions related to the origin of facts. On the contrary, we address the discursive regularities of the electoral year with the boundaries of chronology lying only in the weekly magazines published between January and December 2010, since it is not possible to limit the historicity of facts and movements only to the researched period.

Therefore, we understand *discursive regularity* as “the set of conditions in which the enunciative function operates, and which guarantees and defines its existence”

¹⁸ The original fragment reads the following: “[...] é examinar as diferentes maneiras pelas quais o discurso desempenha um papel no interior do sistema estratégico em que o poder está implicado, e para o qual o poder funciona.” (FOUCAULT, 2010c, p. 253).

¹⁹ The original fragment reads the following: “[...] que não têm o mesmo alcance, a mesma amplitude cronológica, nem a mesma capacidade de produzir efeitos.” (FOUCAULT, 1979, p. 5).

²⁰ The original fragment reads the following: “[...] um enunciado é sempre um acontecimento que nem a língua nem o sentido podem esgotar inteiramente.” (FOUCAULT, 2010a, p. 31).

²¹ The original fragment reads the following: “sistema que rege o acontecimento dos enunciados como acontecimentos regulares” (2010b, p. 147).

(FOUCAULT, 2010b, p. 163)²². In its historical discontinuity, the regular enunciative sequences in the treatment that Dilma, Lula and the Worker's Party received in the 2010 weekly magazines explain a singular discursive movement by which the president was constantly remembered in co-presence with his possible successor.

In the editions published over the period and according to the analyzed media, this process was carried out by the use of distinct designations/marks, but, in general, the statements of the three media vehicles with the largest circulation in 2010²³ questioned the competence of the Worker's Party candidate, highlighting the transformations in her appearance and posture as an artificial product manufactured by the campaign marketers. Within the discourse about these changes, Lula's shadow becomes a presence in the texts and/or images published, as we will see in the enunciative sequences and in the figures we selected in this text.

In *Veja* magazine, for example, a photograph of the image of the candidate's body, with a forced smile on her face, along with an ironic verbal statement, denounces the "new" sympathetic tone of Dilma Rousseff as a result of the guidance of President Lula, who, co-present in the campaign movements, would have taught his candidate on how to be nice to the Brazilian electorate, as we can see in the Enunciative Sequence 1 (ES1): "Apprentice candidate. Time to smile. Dilma: Professor Lula's lessons on how to be nice to the voter" (VEJA, 2010b, p. 32)²⁴.

In the verbal statements that accompany the mentioned image, the relationship of teaching and learning in the art of political communication is shown metaphorically by the attribution of well-defined roles. President Lula is addressed as the (co)present teacher, the one who holds the power to teach his student the appropriate time to smile and how sympathy should emanate from a candidate. Dilma Rousseff, on the other hand, receives the role of pupil of the sympathy techniques - "apprentice candidate". By calling her "apprentice", the magazine depicts her as inexperienced, and also endorses an image of lack of spontaneity in the Worker's Party candidate.

In another edition of *Veja* magazine, the shallowness of PT's candidate is attributed to the humor and facial expression with which Dilma participated in public events, interviews and debates:

S2: Dilma Rousseff, Chief of Staff of Lula's government, was finally appointed as the candidate for the Presidency of the Republic [...]. With a superficial sense of humor that is easily soured and endowed with irrefutable, almost hieratic opinions on the most arcane technical themes,

²² The original fragment reads the following: "o conjunto das condições nas quais se exerce a função enunciativa que assegura e define sua existência" (FOUCAULT, 2010b, p. 163).

²³ In the reports provided by the Circulation Verifier Institute (IVC), in 2010, *Veja* ranked first in the ranking of national magazines, with an average circulation of 1,086,191 copies. Occupying the 2nd position, *Época* magazine had an average of 408,110 copies. In third place, *IstoÉ* magazine ranked with an average of 338,681 copies, and, occupying the 30th position in the ranking, *CartaCapital* magazine with an average circulation of 30,703 copies.

²⁴ The original fragment reads the following: "Aprendiz de candidata. Hora de sorrir. Dilma: lições do professor Lula de como ser simpática com o eleitor." (VEJA, 2010b, p. 32).

she will have to reciprocate the most stupid comments with artificial smiles on the podiums. (VEJA, 2010a, p. 52).²⁵

In sequence 2, the lack of political savvy is again subject to the judgment of the printed media, along with her inexperience in “electoral disputes”. Due to this lack of political practice, the magazine highlights in the rest of the article the work of PT’s advisers and marketers, responsible for the campaign to take off and, on the other hand, the role that president’s Lula popularity exercises on the candidate he “invented” for the continuity of his government in Brazil.

In several editions of the magazine *Época*, the statements that promoted the association of Lula’s support for Dilma’s candidacy were also regular, but these were mainly based on the use of specific names to this relation. Considered as a “Lula’s creature”, in 2010 the PT’s candidate behavior was addressed mainly from two points of view in this magazine. a) critics of her performance when not in the presence of her “creator” (according to ES3 and ES4); and b) discourses suggestive of a shallowness of the candidate’s image, expressing this identity with the metaphor of a piece of clothing changed according to the requirements of each public situation (figure 1).

In the following sequence (ES3) the condition of candidate chosen for the succession of Lula is questioned by magazine *Época*, in reference to the fact that Dilma is “unknown to the public” and has “no familiarity” with politics. In the midst of this interrogation, Lula’s co-presence is rescued by the lexicon itself, “pupil” and “guided by Lula”, as a possible omnipresence in the former minister’s government, should she win the election.

ES3: President Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva’s choice of Dilma Rousseff’s as presidency candidate for the *Palácio do Planalto*²⁶ has raised doubts since it was revealed, just over two years ago. Unknown to the public and with no familiarity with the political world, Dilma entered the electoral race guided by Lula, who has a popularity close to 80%. Lula outlined the strategy of federal and state alliances, indicated the main members of the campaign, and challenged electoral legislation to make his pupil known. Lula’s apparent ascendancy over Dilma produced the suspicion that if elected, she would remain dependent on the political guidance of her ex-boss. The movements made in recent weeks have reinforced the impression that, even outside *Planalto*, Lula will have a strong influence on an eventual Dilma government. (ÉPOCA, 2010c, p. 48).²⁷

²⁵ The original fragment reads the following: “S2: Dilma Rousseff, ministra-chefe da Casa Civil do governo Lula, foi finalmente apontada como a candidata à Presidência da República [...]. Com um humor superficial facilmente azedável e dona de opiniões incontrastáveis, quase hieráticas, sobre os temas técnicos mais arcanos, ela vai ter de retribuir com sorrisos artificiais nos palanques os comentários mais estúpidos.” (VEJA, 2010a, p. 52).

²⁶ *Palácio do Planalto* is the name of the building where the President of Brazil live and work.

²⁷ The original fragment reads the following: “SE3: A escolha pelo presidente Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva do nome de Dilma Rousseff como candidata do governo ao Palácio do Planalto despertou dúvidas desde que foi revelada,

In the ES4, Dilma Rousseff, in the condition of former minister, therefore “out of captivity” from the Ministry, no longer counts with the possibility of going to government events, such as inaugurations, accompanying President Lula. This liberating solitude allows PT’s candidate to adopt a more personal profile, that is, not graceful. According to the magazine, contradicting any image based on a sensitive femininity that the party had “sold” at the beginning of the electoral year, the so-called “Lula’s creature”, without him, trades “barbs and put-downs”, showing that she is not a “little girl”, she is “manlier” than any of her political opponents.

SE3: Dilma has entered the game, now in non-governmental version. Or paragonmental. In her first week as a former minister, Lula’s creature proved to be much more resourceful when out of captivity. She came out trading barbs and put-downs, making it clear that tenderness is a little girl’s thing. The aspirant for the first female president of the Republic seems determined to show that no one is manlier than she is. (ÉPOCA, 2010d, p.56).²⁸

The same masculinity exposed by the media as a device of vigilant power is also highlighted in her change process. In a cartoon published in the same magazine, Dilma as a “man” is finally replaced by the adoption of a very feminine posture: the use of Lula’s Fashion, with colorful outfits destined to the diverse identities that the “creature” of PT had to incorporate during the campaign:

há pouco mais de dois anos. Desconhecida do público e sem intimidade com o mundo político, Dilma entrou na corrida eleitoral guiada por Lula, dono de uma popularidade próxima a 80%. Lula traçou a estratégia de alianças federais e estaduais, indicou os principais integrantes do comando de campanha e desafiou a legislação eleitoral para tornar sua pupila conhecida. A evidente ascendência de Lula sobre Dilma produziu a suspeita de que, se eleita, ela continuaria dependente da atuação política do ex-chefe. Os movimentos feitos nas últimas semanas reforçaram a impressão de que, mesmo fora do Planalto, Lula exercerá forte influência em um eventual governo Dilma.” (ÉPOCA, 2010c, p. 48).

²⁸ The original fragment reads the following: “SE3: Dilma entrou em campo, agora em versão não governamental. Ou paragonmental. Em sua primeira semana como ex-ministra, a criatura de Lula mostrou-se muito mais desenvolvida fora do cativeiro. Saiu distribuindo farpas e caneladas, deixando claro que delicadeza é coisa de mulherzinha. A aspirante a primeira “presidenta” da República parece decidida a mostrar que ninguém é mais homem do que ela.” (ÉPOCA, 2010d, p. 56).

Figure 1 – “Lula’s Fashion”²⁹



Source: *Época* (2010d, p. 6).

In Fig. 1, in addition to the body image represented as a cartoon, with all the meanings that caricaturization brings in itself, the character Dilma is represented in front of four different possibilities to attend the orientations to “change her outfits”. In the outfits available to her, the colors (white, blue, lilac and red) are defined by the ideological order of events in the campaign trajectory. In the first clothing option, for example, the title “*sambando com gari*” refers to the visit that the presidential candidate made to the Rio de Janeiro sambadrome³⁰ on February 14th, 2010, when the candidate danced with a gari (trash man).

At the heart of all the occurrences of this discursive practice in media, there was the emergence of criticism, both because Lula had chosen an unknown candidate with no electoral experience for his succession and because he used his prestige as president to build Dilma’s image as a political personality similar to his.

In *Editora Três* weekly magazine, the candidate’s personal care with her body appears on the agenda (plastic surgery, hairstyle, aesthetic interventions). The modifications are presented in the media discourse as prior to the beginning of the campaign - which reinforces the idea that they are aimed at building an image of a disciplined Dilma in the presidential race. The questioning tone concerning these changes is created around question-statements, which point to the creation of a theatrical identity that would not correspond to what the candidate really is, as we can see in ES5:

²⁹ Dilma changes her outfits after presidential advice. Outfits description: 1. *Sambando com gari* 2. Basic Lilac 3. Prussian Blue 4. Bolivarian Red

³⁰ This is where Brazilians celebrate *Carnaval*, a great Brazilian party.

ES5: Why is it that Dilma, on the eve of the election, is still searching for her role as a character? Or, putting it in another way, why isn't she happy being herself? Before the campaign, Dilma underwent several aesthetic interventions. She got plastic surgery and changed her hairstyle - which is commendable, since every woman has the right to vanity. But there are too many busybodies gravitating around the candidate. Some say that she must be spontaneous like Lula - and in her first attempt, when speaking to truck drivers, Dilma said that Brazil, in the era of FHC, was following a policy of 'stuck wheels'. (ISTOÉ, 2010, p. 41).³¹

In *IstoÉ* magazine the references to the candidate's lack of linguistic ability are treated addressing the preparation that Dilma, like her predecessor and mentor, had to receive in order to be able to speak in public and participate in debates/interviews. The difference is that while Lula received classes in 2002 to make less grammatical deviations in spoken language, the "lessons" for Dilma focus mainly on the need for a linguistic-discursive simplification. In this magazine, the reference to Dilma's lack of political experience is related to a lack of charisma and a lack of political savvy. These absences are shown through the comparison of the presidential candidate with Lula's political profile, in a movement that also recovers the presence of the president to characterize his candidate for succession.

The regularities presented in the magazines arise from the focus on the changes in the body, face, gestures and discourse of Dilma Rousseff, as transformations implemented by her, guided by Lula's presence and aimed at achieving victory at the polls; in addition to this, discourses that focused specifically on the co-presence of the two political subjects during the campaign were also regular.

An example of this process is Fig. 2, published by *Época* magazine, in which Lula-Dilma's co-presence is represented in a satirical cartoon. As in other editions of the magazine, through this illustration, the magazine implies that PT tried to attach the image of the president to the unknown and inexperienced candidate. In the discourse presented in this text, the notion of mirroring suggests a movement that implies a continuity of the eight years of public power exercised by Luiz Inácio in the political future of Dilma, if she were elected.

³¹ The original fragment reads the following: "SE5: Por que será que Dilma, às vésperas da eleição, ainda segue em busca de um personagem? Ou, dito de outra maneira, por que não se contenta em ser ela própria? Antes da campanha, Dilma se submeteu a várias intervenções estéticas. Fez plásticas e mudou o penteado - o que é louvável, pois toda mulher tem direito à vaidade. Mas há palpiteiros demais gravitando ao redor da candidata. Uns dizem que ela deve ser espontânea como Lula - e na primeira tentativa, ao falar para caminhoneiros, Dilma disse que o Brasil, na era FHC, seguia uma política de 'roda presa'." (ISTOÉ, 2010, p.41).

Figure 2 - “Mirror”



Source: Época (2010a, p. 39).

The sequence ES6 points out that, after the end of the partnership period, while the two political subjects hold their public offices in Lula’s government, Dilma Rousseff’s change, here referred to as “metamorphosis”, may be put to the test in order to identify if it is a complete transformation or restricted merely to the visual aspect. To support the suspicion as to the veracity of the candidate’s change, the opposition of “queen of PowerPoint” (reminder of the idea of minister/administrator) versus “politician craving for the podium” once again alludes to the inexperience of the candidate in electoral matters.

In another edition of the same magazine, instead of addressing Lula’s political support for his succession candidate, the magazine explains the PT’s partnership attributing to the president an image of ghost in the campaign and in the decisions of an inexperienced Dilma:

ES6: Without a single vote in the curriculum, without political savvy, calling the refrigerator a “white line” and using highfaluting words, Dilma has not yet competed with Serra, but with the ghost of her electoral leader: the ubiquitous president, who doesn’t get off her back. And who lectures her for not being straightforward and for highfalutin’ talk. Lula claims that the minister of the pre-salt layer, transformed into a candidate by his own imposition, represents the continuity of his government. Dilma projects the image of a manager who is tough but lacks flexibility, sensitivity and team spirit. Qualities associated with the feminine style of leadership, fairly or unfairly. (ÉPOCA, 2010b, p. 130).³²

³² The original fragment reads the following: “SE6: Sem voto no currículo, sem traquejo de palanque, chamando geladeira de “linha branca” e falando em “técniquês”, Dilma até agora não tem competido com Serra, mas com o fantasma de seu cabo eleitoral: o presidente onipresente, que não larga de seu pé. E que a repreende por ser pouco objetiva e por “falar difícil”. Lula apregoa que a ministra do pré-sal, transformada em candidata por imposição sua, representa a continuidade de seu governo. Dilma projeta a imagem de uma gerenta que pisa forte, mas carece de flexibilidade,

In the inexperience attributed to the PT's candidate, the characterization promoted by *Época* highlights the lack of votes in her curriculum, the lack of eloquence traditionally required for the speeches of politicians and the use of a more technical language. Attributing this amateur profile to Dilma, the magazine relates her performance in the presidential race to an internal battle, that is, against "the ghost of her electoral leader" (Lula) and not against her PSDB opponent. In this veiled parties' dispute, the problem of the PT's candidate lies in the judgment and reprimand given by the president, omnipresent at every step of the campaign, especially for her usage of a very objective and difficult language.

In three magazines (*Época*, *IstoÉ e Veja*), the discursive effect of co-presence, when not presented by the use of the image of the political subjects, brings, in the enunciative sequences, the convocation of Lula and Dilma, creating distinct space/times and addressing this coexistence as an instrument of public power. The emergence of this co-participation as a means of guaranteeing the maintenance of power for the Worker's Party for another four years of government is as much in the report of these discursive practices as in the illegality of this partnership in advanced campaign, fomented by public resources in the writing of these political media discourses.

As the fourth bestselling magazine in circulation in the country (*CartaCapital*), the enunciation creates an interdiscursivity, addressing the discourses of the other magazines (*Época*, *IstoÉ e Veja*), seeking to deconstruct not the co-presence of the two political subjects, but the negative value that is attributed by these magazines to this process. In *CartaCapital* magazine, therefore, the same co-presence effect exhibits dispersion, since it is produced in a discursive orientation that questions the negative direction of the discourses of the other weekly magazines and presents the profile of Dilma as the necessary to continue the politics of the Worker's Party.

Committed to the Worker's Party, *CartaCapital* points to the fact that a lack of preparation and a lack of political savvy are features that the press itself attributed to Dilma in an approach of strategic opposition. Thus, it is in the process of denying the position of the other weekly magazines that the magazine of the *Editora Confiança* produces the effect of a Lula-Dilma co-presence: ES7: "With the support of the media, the opposition tries to pin in Dilma Rousseff the image of lack of preparation and lack of political savvy." (CARTACAPITAL, 2010c, p. 26)³³.

Despite the adoption of a more defensive discourse, Dilma's profile as "newcomer" in the electoral race as well as her need to adapt her linguistic style (aimed at appearing in media vehicles) also appears in *CartaCapital*, but in a discourse that highlights the condition of "ex-minister" of the candidate, depicting her as a political subject who was already engaged in the party's way of governing. In Fig. 3, the femininity of the Worker's Party candidate is linked to strength and to an ideal that does not exclude

sensibilidade e espírito de equipe. Qualidades associadas ao estilo feminino de liderança, justa ou injustamente." (ÉPOCA, 2010b, p. 130).

³³ The original fragment reads the following: SE7: "Com o apoio da mídia, a oposição tenta colar em Dilma Rousseff a imagem de despreparo e falta de trato político." (CARTACAPITAL, 2010c, p. 26).

her ideological position. In the photograph that reinforces this idea, the discourse of Dilma's corporeal existence is represented by Lula-Dilma's co-presence, evoking the image of the president, who appears as the background of his candidate: woman, strong, ethical:

Figure 3 – “Being a woman. The feminine look is not excluding”



Source: CartaCapital (2010b, p. 26-27).

In a movement contrary to the photographs in the other magazines of our archive, *CartaCapital* does not publish a smiling Dilma in fig. 3, nor does it present a metamorphosed face, but it explores a strong expression as a mark of what “being a woman” represents, socially and politically. With the shoulders tilted, the finger pointed and face in alert, the Worker’s Party pre-candidate has the space to speak out and show herself as the ideal political personality to continue the evolution experienced by Brazil in Lula’s government.

Although supported by the image of the president, the body of Dilma Rousseff appears endowed with its own vanity. If in the co-presence portrayed in the picture in the background of figure 3 the image of Dilma smiles, when she is alone on the scene and the co-presence with Lula is different, the main image already shows the energetic and serious side of the candidate. Lula’s image is equally pertinent, especially since this kind of discourse was common in 2002 in the other weekly magazines that showed an aggressive Lula, who presented himself as docile to win the elections.

In figure 4, we illustrate a discourse that was common in several editions of *CartaCapital*. The magazine of *editora Confiança*, unlike the others, brought the photograph of Dilma Rousseff in discourses in which the image of President Lula was in the background. In this magazine, however, the texts did not mention this partnership or this political support with statements that would direct this reading.

Figure 4 – “The activist Dilma and the archives”



Source: CartaCapital (2010a, p. 38-39).

The production of meanings in these discourses, in our view, comes from the reader's own identification of Lula's support and what he symbolizes in the campaign, in the history as activist of the Workers' Party candidate and in the production of an imaginary about how would Dilma's government be. In figure 4, the moderate gesture of the candidate with her corporeal presence and the simple and spontaneous smile relates to the image that shines on the background - the mark of the popularity of the president the candidate wants to succeed.

As it can be seen, through the non-verbal communication plan, *CartaCapital* ratifies the co-presence and induces an understanding that associates the political proposals of Dilma and Lula, as a way of supporting the Worker's Party candidate; in the verbal messages, most of the statements published in *Editora Confiança's* magazine do not express any negative value regarding the co-presence of the subjects, and still seeks to produce a combative movement to the critics on this aspect.

Contrary to the process developed in the other printed media, the circulation of the political image of Dilma, Lula and both of them in *CartaCapital* maintained a discourse exhibiting dispersion. In this magazine, the co-presence is perceived in the enunciation but not explicitly highlighted, and it acquires a discursive orientation that questions the negative direction of the discourses of the other weekly magazines and presents the profile of Dilma as necessary to continue the politics of the Worker's Party.

Final Considerations

In this text, based on the sayings and writings of Michel Foucault, and thinking about history in its multiplicity, we looked for the indication of Dilma as the Worker's Party presidential candidate for the 2010 elections in the discursive threads of the coverage that the Brazilian weekly magazines carried out that year. In order to do so, we adopted the principles of the French DA to analyze the historicity in a political

media archive consisting of 208 issues of the magazines *CartaCapital*, *Época*, *IstoÉ* and *Veja*, published that year.

When we cross the conditions of possibility of the electoral dispute with the regular enunciative sequences in the printed media, considering the power relations in the hybridity of politics and media, our analytical procedure showed the production of a discursive effect of a Lula-Dilma co-presence. Three of the assessed magazines explicitly disqualify the image of the Worker's Party candidate, denouncing it as an artificial body-product, manufactured to circulate during PT's campaign. As dispersion, in *CartaCapital*, the discourse produced meanings orientated to highlight the partnership of the two subjects as relevant to the continuity of the politics of the party.

In all these cases, these are distinct enunciative strategies, which promoted different Lula-Dilma presence/co-presence effects and portrayed different forms of interaction of the two subjects. Thinking co-presence as an effect of discourse, based on this heterogeneity, presupposes the understanding that the meanings emerged from this situation are constructed in a specific type of interaction, which has its own duration and occurs between Lula and Dilma, through forged scenes, simulating their interaction through images.

Therefore, this format of co-presence is associated with meanings that occur within an act, as in the direct transmissions. The understanding of the different modes of presence in the textual manifestations is motivated by a discourse in which the text and the image of the body compose the plot of the production of meanings on Dilma and on her relation with Lula in those elections. Moreover, the way in which this constitution is given is subject to the historical moment of this political event.

This way, the presence or co-presence, as effects of discourse, maintain a direct connection with an enunciative time and space, established in the very act of its textual impression. In this printed nature, therefore, dimensions, which are semantic and material on the one hand, and discursive and mundane on the other, exist concomitantly.

SANTOS, E.; ROMUALDO, E. A produção de um efeito de copresença Lula-Dilma no discurso político-midiático de semanários brasileiros em 2010. *Alfa*, São Paulo, v.61, n.2, p.367-387, 2017.

- *RESUMO: Com base nos pressupostos teórico-metodológicos da Análise do Discurso (AD) de linha francesa, este artigo assume a concepção foucaultiana de história, como um conjunto descontínuo de temporalidades, e recupera os fios discursivos de um acontecimento singular no contexto brasileiro de 2010 – a indicação de Dilma Rousseff como candidata pelo Partido dos Trabalhadores (PT), para sucessão de Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva. Tomando o emaranhado de fatos e eventos que compuseram as condições de possibilidade da corrida presidencial do período e problematizando as relações de força que delineiam na contemporaneidade um discurso político-midiático, o presente trabalho busca analisar as regularidades/dispersões que orientam a discursivização de Dilma e Lula em um arquivo formado pelas 208 edições*

dos semanários CartaCapital, Época, IstoÉ e Veja, que foram publicados no ano eleitoral. Os resultados mostram a produção de um efeito discursivo de copresença Lula-Dilma, o qual, em três das mídias analisadas, explicita uma desqualificação da imagem da petista, como produto criado com fins eleitorais. Enquanto dispersão, na CartaCapital, o efeito discursivo destaca a parceria dos dois sujeitos como essencial à continuidade da política empreendida pelo partido.

- **PALAVRAS-CHAVE:** Copresença. Regularidades. Discurso político-midiático. História.

REFERENCES

BARONAS, R. L. Notas sobre o amargo da língua política: eleições municipais cuiabanas 2004. **Revista ECOS**, Cáceres, v.3, n.2, p.99-106, 2005. Available in: <http://www.unemat.br/revistas/ecos/docs/v_03/99_Pag_Revista_Ecos_V-03_N-01_A-2005.pdf>. Access on: 13 Oct. 2013.

BERGER, C. A reestruturação da política em tempos midiáticos. **Intexto**, Porto Alegre, v.1, n. 1, p. 1-11, jan./jun. 1997. Available in: <<http://seer.ufrgs.br/index.php/intexto/article/view/3298/3944>>. Access on: 3 Oct. 2013.

BOURDIEU, P. **O poder simbólico**. Lisboa: Difel, 1989.

CARDOSO, C. O corpo presente. In: RUBIM, A. A. C.; BENTS, I. M. G.; PINTO, M. J. (Org.). **Comunicação e sociabilidade nas culturas urbanas contemporâneas**. Petrópolis: Vozes ; Compós, 1999. p. 41-53.

CARTACAPITAL. São Paulo: Confiança, n. 615, 29 set. 2010a. 90 p.

CARTACAPITAL. São Paulo: Confiança, n. 599, 09 jun. 2010b. 74 p.

CARTACAPITAL. São Paulo: Confiança, n. 592, 21 abr. 2010c. 74 p.

DIAS, C. **Da corpografia**: ensaio sobre a língua/escrita na materialidade digital. Santa Maria: Ed. da UFSM, 2008.

ÉPOCA. São Paulo: Globo, n. 651, 8 nov. 2010a. 138 p.

ÉPOCA. São Paulo: Globo, n. 650, 1 nov. 2010b. 130 p.

ÉPOCA. São Paulo: Globo, n. 643, 13 set. 2010c. 146 p.

ÉPOCA. São Paulo: Globo, n. 621, 12 abr. 2010d. 130 p.

FOUCAULT, M. **A ordem do discurso**. Tradução de Laura Fraga de Almeida Sampaio. 20.ed. São Paulo: Loyola, 2010a.

FOUCAULT, M. **A arqueologia do saber**. Tradução de Luiz Felipe Baeta Neves. 7.ed. Rio de Janeiro: Forense Universitária, 2010b.

FOUCAULT, M. Retornar à história. In: FOUCAULT, M. **Arqueologia das ciências e história dos sistemas de pensamento**. Organização e seleção de textos, Manoel Barros de Motta. Tradução de Elisa Monteiro. 2.ed. Rio de Janeiro: Forense Universitária, 2008. p.282-295. (Ditos e Escritos; v.II).

FOUCAULT, M. Diálogo sobre o poder. In: FOUCAULT, M. **Estratégia, poder-saber**. Organização e seleção de textos, Manoel Barros de Motta. Tradução de Vera Lucia Avellar Ribeiro. 2.ed. Rio de Janeiro: Forense Universitária, 2010c. p. 253-266. (Ditos e Escritos; v.IV).

FOUCAULT, M. **Microfísica do poder**. Organização e tradução de Roberto Machado. Rio de Janeiro: Graal, 1979.

GALLO, S. L.; ROMÃO, L. M. S. Corpo e(m) discurso na rede. In: ROMÃO, L. M. S.; GALLI, F. C. S. **Rede eletrônica: sentidos e(m) movimentos**. São Carlos: Pedro & João Editores, 2011. p. 13-22.

GIDDENS, A. **A constituição da sociedade**. Tradução de Álvaro Cabral. 3.ed. São Paulo: WMF Martins Fontes, 2009.

GOFFMAN, E. **A representação do eu na vida cotidiana**. Tradução de Maria Célia Santos Raposo. 19.ed. Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes, 2013.

GOFFMAN, E. **Ritual de interação: ensaios sobre o comportamento face a face**. Tradução de Fábio Rodrigues Ribeiro da Silva. 2.ed. Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes, 2012.

GOFFMAN, E. **Comportamento em lugares públicos: notas sobre a organização social dos ajuntamentos**. Tradução de Fábio Rodrigues Ribeiro da Silva. Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes, 2010.

ISTOÉ. São Paulo: Três, ano 33, n. 2112, 5 maio 2010. 144 p.

LE BRETON, D. **Antropologia do corpo e modernidade**. Tradução de Fábio dos Santos Creder Lopes. Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes, 2001.

LIMA, V. A. Sete teses sobre mídia e política no Brasil. **Revista USP**, São Paulo, n.61, p.48-57, março/maio 2004. Available in: <<http://www.revistas.usp.br/revusp/article/viewFile/13317/15135>>. Access on: 09 Oct. 2013.

MERLEAU-PONTY, M. **Fenomenologia da percepção**. Tradução de Carlos Alberto Ribeiro de Moura. 2.ed. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 1999.

MIGUEL, L. F. **Política e mídia no Brasil: episódios da história recente**. Brasília: Plano, 2002.

RODRIGUES, A. D. **Estratégias da comunicação: questão comunicacional e formas de sociabilidade**. Lisboa: Presença, 1997.

RUBIM, A. A. C. **Comunicação e política**. São Paulo: Hacker, 2000.

SANTAELLA, L. **Linguagens líquidas na era da mobilidade**. São Paulo: Paulus, 2007.

VEJA. São Paulo: Abril, ano 43, n. 8, 24 fev. 2010a. 114 p.

VEJA. São Paulo: Abril, ano 43, n. 1, 6 jan. 2010b. 102 p.

WEBER, M. H. Híbridação de verdades políticas e midiáticas. **Intexto**, Porto Alegre, v. 2, n. 6, p. 1-38, jul./dez. 1999. Available in: <<http://seer.ufrgs.br/index.php/intexto/article/view/3388/4318>>. Access on: 03 Oct. 2013.

ZHAO, S. Reconceptualizing presence: differentiating between mode of presence and sense of presence. **ResearchGate**, [S.l.], p.1-14, 2002. Available in: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/237134548_Reconceptualizing_Presence_Differentiating_Between_Mode_of_Presence_and_Sense_of_Presence>. Access on: 18 Apr. 2014.

Received in november 2016

Approved in march 2017

