

ENVIRONMENTALIZATION LOCKED IN: DOMINATION SYSTEM AND ITS EFFECTS IN CAETÉ-TAPERAÇU, A MARINE EXTRACTIVE RESEX IN THE **AMAZON**

AMBIENTALIZAÇÃO TRAVADA: SISTEMA DE DOMINAÇÃO E SEUS EFEITOS EM CAETÉ-TAPERAÇU, UMA RESEX MARINHA NA AMAZÔNIA

AMBIENTALIZACIÓN OBSTACULIZADA: SISTEMA DE DOMINACIÓN Y SUS EFECTOS EN CAETÉ-TAPERAÇU, UNA RESERVA MARINA EXTRACTIVA EN LA **AMAZONIA**

Maria José da Silva Aquino TEISSERENC¹ e-mail: mjteisserenc@uol.com.br



Pierre TEISSERENC² e-mail: pierre-teisserenc@wanadoo.fr

How to reference this article:

TEISSERENC, M. A.; TEISSERENC, Environmentalization locked in: Domination system and its effects in Caeté-Taperaçu, a marine extractive Resex in the Amazon. Estudos de Sociologia, Araraquara, v. 28, n. esp. 2, e023016, 2023. 1982-4718. DOI: https://doi.org/10.52780/res.v28iesp.2.17591



Submitted: 15/08/2023

Required revisions: 19/10/2023

Approved: 05/11/2023 Published: 29/12/2023

> **Editor**: Profa. Dra. Maria Chaves Jardim

Editor Adjunto Executivo: Prof. Dr. José Anderson Santos Cruz

¹ Federal University of Rio de Janeiro (UFRJ), Rio de Janeiro – RJ – Brazil. PhD in Human Sciences (Sociology). ² Paris-Descartes University; École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales, Paris – France. PhD Sociology.

Estudos de Sociologia, Araraquara, v. 28, n. esp. 2, e023016, 2023. DOI: https://doi.org/10.52780/res.v28iesp.2.17591

e-ISSN: 1982-4718

ABSTRACT: This article discusses the relationships between the impasses identified in the experience of Caeté-Taperaçu Resex (Bragança-PA) and the Amazon's local power structures. The analysis perspective uses references to the system of engendering, as well as that of environmentalization, authoritarianism, and its permanence in the construction of Brazilian society and in public policies implementation. In the situation investigated, there were differences in the results in relation to two other neighboring Resex, Curuçá and São João da Ponta, where, as an instrument of public policy, the Resex offered an alternative to the development of a territory, thanks to new economic, social, and political practices, which, by their turn, produced changes in the local system of domination. In Bragança, where the players of the scientific knowledge sphere and the religious sphere have not become forces capable of confronting the political sphere, authoritarian and violent practices of its major players have remained and even more comforted in the current conjuncture experienced in Brazil since 2014.

KEYWORDS: Resex. Environmentalization. Domination System. Engendering. Amazon.

RESUMO: Neste artigo discute-se as relações entre impasses identificados na experiência da Resex Caeté-Taperaçu (Bragança-PA) e as estruturas de poder local na Amazônia. Na perspectiva de análise são acionados a referência do sistema de engendramento, assim como a da ambientalização, do autoritarismo e sua permanência na construção da sociedade brasileira e na implementação de políticas públicas. Na situação estudada foram identificadas diferenças de resultado em relação a duas outras Resex vizinhas, a de Curuçá e a de São João da Ponta, nas quais, enquanto instrumento de política pública, a Resex ofereceu condições de uma alternativa ao desenvolvimento de um território graças à aprendizagem de novas práticas econômicas, sociais e políticas, as quais, por sua vez, produziram localmente alterações no sistema de dominação. Em Bragança-PA, onde os atores da esfera do conhecimento científico e da esfera religiosa não se constituíram em forças capazes de confrontar a esfera política, as práticas autoritárias e violentas de seus principais atores permaneceram e ainda mais confortadas na atual conjuntura vivida no Brasil desde 2014.

PALAVRAS-CHAVE: Resex. Ambientalização. Sistema de dominação. Engendramento. Amazônia.

RESUMEN: Este artículo trata sobre las relaciones entre las dificultades identificadas en la experiencia de Reserva extractiva (Resex) Caeté-Taperaçu (Bragança-PA) y las estructuras de poder locales en la Amazonía. Desde la perspectiva del análisis, la referencia del sistema de engendramiento, así como la de la ambientalización, el autoritarismo y su permanencia en la construcción de la sociedad brasileña y la implementación de políticas públicas. En la situación estudiada, se identificaron diferencias en los resultados con relación a otras dos Resex vecinas, Curuçá y São João da Ponta, en las cuales, como instrumento de la política pública, la Resex ofreció condiciones para una alternativa al desarrollo de un territorio gracias al aprendizaje de nuevas prácticas económicas, sociales y políticas, que, a su vez, produjeron localmente alteraciones en el sistema de dominación. En Bragança, donde los actores en la esfera del conocimiento científico y la esfera religiosa no constituyeron fuerzas capaces de enfrentarse a la esfera política, las prácticas autoritarias y violentas de sus principales actores permanecieron y se reconfortaron aún más la situación actual que vive Brasil desde 2014.

PALABRAS CLAVE: Reserva Extrativa. Ambientalización. Sistema de dominación. Engendramiento. Amazonía.

Introduction

In a recent publication, the Caeté-Taperaçu Marine Extractive Reserve (Resex), located in the municipality of Bragança-PA (TEISSERENC; TEISSERENC, 2020), was the object of analysis as a public policy instrument (TEISSERENC, 2009) aimed at offering favorable conditions to produce territorial actions to promote the sustainable development of a territory in a context of environmentalization (LEITE LOPES, 2006). Referring to the theoretical framework proposed by Bruno Latour (2017), especially his discussion of the reasons why political ecology has not achieved a mobilization compatible with the challenges it seeks to address, leads us to realize that although environmentalization has made it possible to pose new challenges in the public space, it has not been able to ensure that populations overcome the situations in which they are threatened and destroyed in terms of their ways of life and their territorialities. This incapacity of environmentalization has made these populations retreat from certain challenges, belittle forms of solidarity and prefer deregulations in terms of the management and control of their territories, as well as leading them to share the ideas of the obscurantist elites who dominate them.

It was far from imagination how quickly Brazil would deepen into a crisis which, economic in origin, would transform, from the impeachment of President Dilma Roussef in 2016 and the election of Jair Bolsonaro in 2018, into a political crisis, before becoming a moral and constitutional crisis, with the country's top leader and his followers calling constitutionality into question by flouting the democratic rule of law³, advocating a return to dictatorship⁴. This crisis, marked by authoritarianism and intolerance, suffered a major setback in the 2022 presidential elections, with the victory of a political project based on social inclusion and democratic strengthening, represented by President Luís Inácio Lula da Silva, who was sworn in on the 1st of January 2023. But it is the socio-cultural basis of this resurgence of authoritarianism and intolerance, ostensibly in Brazil before the last presidential elections, that Lilia Moritz Schwarcz addresses in her book *On Brazilian authoritarianism (Sobre o*

Estudos de Sociologia, Araraquara, v. 28, n. esp. 2, e023016, 2023. DOI: https://doi.org/10.52780/res.v28iesp.2.17591

³ Incidentally, among the social sciences' analyses of events in Brazil during the previous government, see the article "Bolsonaro ou les térmites du Brésil" by sociologist Fréderic Vanderberghe (2021).

⁴ Significantly, positions in public environmental agencies have become more flexible as of 2019. Until then occupied by civil servants with technical competence in the environmental field, the management positions of units and sub-units, for example, of ICMBio (Chico Mendes Institute for Biodiversity Conservation), are now occupied by military personnel. This intensified with the publication of Decree n. 10.341, of 06 May 2020. In November 2021, the fourth military officer appointed since the publication of this decree took office as head of ICMBio (BRASIL, 2020).

autoritarismo brasileiro - 2019), a work whose reading greatly inspired the content of this article.

In fact, in this article we intend to analyze the experience of the Caeté-Taperaçu Resex with the aim of identifying the causes of its impasse and drawing lessons from them about the permanence of a system of domination and its effects on the functioning of the Reserve. Our diagnosis of the situation of the respective Resex is based on systematized observations of two other Resex implemented on the same stretch of coastline in the state of Pará as Caeté-Taperaçu, through which ways of confronting the effects of domination have been opened (TEISSERENC, 2016a). To this end, we will first present a framework of analysis that allows us to question the resurgence of the forms of authoritarianism described by Schwarcz (2019) when we return to a political situation that harks back to previous periods in Brazil's history marked by dictatorships. We then return to the results of research on São João da Ponta and Mãe Grande de Curuçá, the two other Resex, from which we reflect on Caeté-Taperaçu, to demonstrate aspects of the redemocratization of local life that reveal experiences capable of offering an alternative to the system of domination that prevails to this day, and thus contribute to questioning it. Then, in the third section of the article, we present the results of research on Caeté-Taperaçu, trying to demonstrate how their inability to produce territorial actions through an adequate use of the tools offered by the Reserve - in particular the work of deliberation in the Deliberative Council - is explained by a whole series of factors that have contributed to the resurgence of the system of domination and with this the way has been cleared for authoritarian practices and strategies. We will not undertake an exhaustive inventory of these practices and strategies; based on the assumptions of Schwarcz (2019), we will limit ourselves to observations about three particular spheres of local life: the political sphere in the face of the environmental challenge, the religious sphere and the sphere of scientific knowledge.

Origin of authoritarianism and domination

Schwarcz (2019) considers that if

[...] the myth of racial democracy, which has had a strong impact on the country, is therefore a good pretext for understanding how authoritarian practices and ideas are formed and consolidated in Brazil. Patriarchy, bossiness, violence, inequality, patrimonialism and social intolerance are elements that are stubbornly present in our past history and find great resonance today (SCHWARCZ, 2019, p. 26, our translation).

In her argument, the author refers to significant phenomena in which there are "some of the roots of authoritarianism in Brazil that have surfaced in the present time" (SCHWARCZ, 2019, p. 26, our translation); an opportunity to demonstrate how the country's view of its past is conditioned by a narrative that justifies violent practices inherent in a constant authoritarianism in its history. Refuting the idea of a mechanical continuity between the past and the present, Schwarcz (2019, p. 63, our translation) proposes an explanation that shows the existence of the "authoritarian root of our politics that is in danger of continuing, despite new styles of governance". As an example, the author refers to the way in which the different conservative regimes in the country have invested in disregarding the social achievements of minorities such as indigenous communities, quilombolas, LGBTQI+ etc. "turning them into foreigners in their own land", through ignorance of their history and building a mythology that "does not hold up to history, it seeks to make invisible social subjects who were in Brazil even before it was Brazil" (SCHWARCZ, 2019, p. 173, our translation). Authoritarianism, which has made a comeback in Brazil since the 2013 mobilizations, as observed by Schwarcz (2019) is manifested by the arbitrary nature of the violent practices it engenders and the impunity of its actors; numerous findings proving "how violence in Brazil and the fight against it has not only color, generation and social class, but also sex and gender" (SCHWARCZ, 2019, p. 216, our translation). This return of authoritarianism to the foreground is explained by the magnitude of the economic effects of the crisis that has hit the country in the form of a drop in purchasing power and an increase in unemployment and poverty. This return is also explained by the emergence, in the political field, of a phenomenon that the author describes as aversion. "An aversion to insecurity in the streets, an aversion to the growth of organized crime, an aversion to the disorganization of the state taken over by private interests, an aversion to physiological politicians, an aversion to intellectuals, an aversion to the new political actors, in short, an aversion to everything that does not concern 'us' or does not represent 'us'". (SCHWARCZ, 2019, p. 215-216, our translation).

Such aversions, related to many areas of social life, prove that the repudiation they express is broad and even calls society as a whole into question; a repudiation whose roots must be sought, firstly, in the way the Brazilian nation was built from Independence (1822), through the Abolition of Slavery (1888) to the Proclamation of the Republic (1889) and, secondly, in the way the nation-state was constituted throughout the 20th century, marked by urbanization and industrialization. Schwarcz (2019) justifies her interpretation by considering that, in this society that originated from colonization, analyzed by countless authors, strongly marked by

slavery, the abolition of which would not take place until the end of the 19th century, the Republic, which put an end to the Empire, would be organized on the basis of a system of domination of a slave-like nature, reigning throughout the colonial period and which, in its essentially rural bases, would last after Independence.

One of the questions that Schwarcz's (2019) historical interpretation tries to answer is why this system of domination remained in the process of creating the political institutions that make up the Brazilian state, even when wealth and power were transferred from the agrarian world to urban centers and industrialization expanded. This question about the permanence of the system of domination finds elements of an answer in André Botelho's book, O Retorno da sociedade: política e interpretações do Brasil (The Return of Society: Politics and Interpretations of Brazil), considering "the twists and turns in the spiral of democratization in contemporary Brazil" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 184, our translation), that is, in the last fifty years. From this book, we bring above all the idea of a Brazilian society always under construction, which has not experienced the same history as European and American societies. Along with Schwarcz (2019), Botelho (2019), in his insightful analysis of sociological interpretations of Brazil, shares the perspective that the absence of social rupture in the country's history - unlike what happened in the United States and France, countries that experienced their emblematic revolutions respectively - gives even more importance to referring to the past in order to understand the current state of society. Thus, "interpretations of Brazil exist and are re-read in the present, not as a supposed survival of the past, but by guiding people's choices and giving meaning to their collective experiences" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 283, our translation). A reference to the past so striking, in the case of Brazil, that the "weight of a cultural heritage" is the origin of a conservatism or traditionalism that generated "forms of socialization shaped by the regime of slavery" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 174, our translation) that would have resisted the transition from the rural to the urban world and that continue, to this day, to influence working relationships in a society that has become industrial and capitalist.

One of the characteristics of this heritage would be precisely "in the dynamics of the relations of political domination in Brazilian society" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 53, our translation). In fact, "poor free men gain sociological intelligibility within the framework of domination marked by direct, personal and violent relationships, which form a network of payments for all kinds of services rendered and favors received" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 56, our translation). Based on different theses produced by the first generations of social scientists in Brazil, Botelho (2019) recognizes in the thinking of Maria Isaura Pereira de Queiroz (1976), and Maria Sílvia

Carvalho Franco (1997), a personal dimension present in this domination, violent by nature, and exploited by political power, which dissimulates, transforms, for example, the vote expression of an opinion in democratic environments - into a commodity for exchange, thus hiding tensions and making it impossible for the dominated to become politically aware.

According to André Botelho (2019), the permanence of this personal domination played an important role in the constitution of the modern nation-state. To understand this permanence, one must admit that one of the characteristics of the nation-state is the "articulation between public authority and social solidarity" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 23, our translation). It seems that, in the case of Brazil, this social solidarity is restricted to the family "which was a central unit in society and from the position held in it came directly the status of the individual himself" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 80, our translation); a perspective identified in Queiroz (1976), for whom "the fundamental social basis of our political life 'is family solidarity', an indelible mark of our origins and which constantly emerges in the flow of the political process" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 104, our translation). In her interpretation of *coronelismo*, Maria Isaura Pereira de Queiroz (1976, p. 190, our translation) characterizes the phenomenon by a solidarity in permanent interaction with conflict "as two sides of the same coin, [...] inherent, complementary and reciprocal, however ambiguous and paradoxical the pairing may be" and which is at the origin of a violence inseparable from this interaction between solidarity and conflict. The result is a combination of these three factors, which, for the author, constitutes the basis of political domination and the reason for the "preservation of the kinship structure" and its "accommodation" to the "various political forms that successively took hold in the country colony, empire, republic" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 108, our translation).

In a historical context characterized by persistent inequalities in the social structure, such a conception of the family gives rise to "a capacity for private appropriation of public institutions" by those in power, with a single objective: "to promote their particular interests" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 72, our translation). This private/public interpenetration continued throughout the changes in political regimes in Brazil, despite the social transformations that accompanied urban-industrial modernization. The result, as demonstrated in the study in question, based on Maria Sílvia de Carvalho Franco (1997), is that the regulation of social relations operated by political institutions is done through personal domination and this results in the exercise of power as if it were the property of those who govern.

The conclusions of André Botelho's analysis (2019) include the parallelism produced by personal domination between the fragmentation of forms of solidarity and the fragmentation

of the capacity for collective action, which depends on favorable conditions for its implementation. Considering the "inscription of a privatist logic in the very functioning of state institutions and the naturalization of deep social asymmetries", these fragmentations have "redefined the forms of social participation, limiting the scope of the democratization process in Brazilian society". A society that remains "fragmented, exclusionary and autocratic" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 184, our translation).

Public Action and the permanence of the system of domination

Local power as a system of domination

The parallel between the fragmentation of forms of solidarity and the fragmentation of the capacity for collective action due to the interpenetration of the private into the public and the privatist logic in the functioning of public institutions is of particular interest to us since one of the characteristics of the Extractive Reserve (Resex) as a public policy instrument is its capacity, when local circumstances favor it, to promote collective actions that contribute to the development of the territory (TEISSERENC, 2016) based on the work of the Deliberative Council. So, let's take a closer look.

In an exercise to understand local power, based on reference to the practices of *coronelismo*, it was shown that in the Amazonian context, the domination exercised in the colonial period was updated in the rubber cycle in the form of *aviamento*⁵ (TEISSERENC, 2016b). In *aviamento*, the *rubber tapper's* situation of dependence and subjection is emblematic. A man usually working alone on latex harvesting routes in the interior of the forest, covering an average area of 300 hectares, whose contact with the outside world was mediated by his boss, the rubber plantation owner. The production was "sold" to the boss and the *rubber tapper* himself "bought" the means of subsistence for himself and his family. This exchange relationship, in which currency was never or almost never used, resulted in a permanent debt owed by the *rubber tapper* to the rubber plantation owner. A debt that led the *rubber tapper*, as

Estudos de Sociologia, Araraquara, v. 28, n. esp. 2, e023016, 2023. DOI: https://doi.org/10.52780/res.v28iesp.2.17591

⁵ The *aviamento* is a system that developed and strengthened during the short period of the Rubber Cycle. An important immigration of Syrian-Lebanese and Jewish origin, coming mainly from North Africa to the Amazon, provided many of those who organized a hierarchical chain monopolizing the distribution of manufactured goods from abroad and the disposal of rubber production. "Between the 'biggest' boss located in Manaus or Belém and the 'smallest' customer located in the deepest backlands there is a complex hierarchical chain of power, of an ethnic, social and political nature, which included among the 'aviados' and the so-called 'caboclos', but also poor Northeasterners, indigenous people and quilombolas; and among the 'aviadores' Portuguese, Spanish, Lebanese and Syrian Arabs, Jews from North Africa and also Northeastern migrants, including civil servants and the military" (MEIRA, 2018, p. 107, our translation).

a dominated person, to hold the exploiter in high regard, because "he was praised - and loved for the generosity of his small services and gifts. To the point of becoming a paternal protector and redistributor" as long as "the recipient of his generosity, whom he excludes from all autonomous access to the market, believes in him, obeys him and works for him" (GEFFRAY, 1996, p. 156, our translation). This paternalism, according to Philippe Léna (1996), grew stronger with the arrival of the Republic and then, with access to the vote for the entire population, took the form of political clientelism⁶. On the part of voters, this clientelism manifests itself in the search for advantages guaranteed by the public authorities and intermediated by those locally "well" positioned in terms of command. The emblematic figure of the colonel⁷, which has existed since the imperial period, is thus greatly strengthened.

Mayors continue to use the resources resulting from their role as intermediaries between different levels of public administration (municipal, state and federal) or between the different sectors of public life. It follows, then, that the intervention of the public manager, in most cases, still results from his ability to intervene in the private lives of his constituents, their families and their communities (family arbitrations, religious commitments etc.). Intervention materializes, for example, in a perverse use of local government contracts. Contracts for which access will be favored to those who agree to pay for them with political support. Particularly in the public education and health sectors, precarious jobs are negotiated on an annual basis through arbitrary assessments, not of the competence of those hired, but of their behavior in relation to those in power (TEISSERENC, 2016b). These compromises lead to situations of insecurity, mistrust and fear of reprisals if political support is withdrawn and denounced. In a context where having a temporary job is a "blessing" obtained from a political godfather, the uncertainty of renewing the contract is an inexhaustible source of anguish.

The feelings of mistrust and fear that characterize relationships between members of communities under domination are somewhat paradoxical. Among the members of these communities, there is a considerable capacity for collective initiative, such as joint efforts, the organization of patron saint festivals and other rituals, testimony to a sociability that gives a lot of meaning to collective life.

Estudos de Sociologia, Araraquara, v. 28, n. esp. 2, e023016, 2023. DOI: https://doi.org/10.52780/res.v28iesp.2.17591

⁶ The colonel is the person who carries out certain local functions to maintain order and acts as an intermediary between the state government and the inhabitants (LÉNA, 1996). This intermediary role, at election time, is fulfilled through promises of individual guarantees made to voters so that they vote for the candidate supported by

⁷ As Philippe Léna (1996, p. 115-116, our translation) put it: "we think that electoral clientelism, often considered by political analysts as a separate category, should be integrated into the set of mechanisms studied here [...]. History confirms its close links with other forms of domination-exploitation based on personal dependence".

Deliberation at the risk of domination

This paradox interests us above all because, as indicated in the Introduction, the Resex is a public policy instrument capable of playing an active role in the production of territorial collective actions through the appropriate use of the tools and resources at its disposal. However, the permanence of the system of domination is generally a brake on this production capacity, given the state of dependence (tutelage) that local power maintains in relation to voters and its potential to create a disintegrating social climate. In this sense, the experiences of the Resex of Curuçá and São João da Ponta have shown the importance to be attributed to the Deliberative Council, from the moment it manages to meet the conditions for functioning as a public space, a privileged place for concertation and negotiation of commitments necessary to carry out legitimate collective actions in a context of environmentalization. Research has shown that the work of the Deliberative Council can contribute to democratic experiences involving a territory as a whole, and that the members of the Council, who are mainly representatives of communities, tend to impose themselves as political actors capable of negotiating agreements (TEISSERENC, 2016a).

In fact, with the constitutional recognition of participation through consultative or deliberative councils⁸, the work of a Resex Council has become a political activity (TEISSERENC, 2016), thus contributing to the renewal of local democracy. This renewal of practices, in the form of collective learning⁹, has had the particular effect of challenging the strategies of local power, calling into question the system to which they belong.

The experience of the Curuçá and São João da Ponta Resex confirms that two factors played a decisive role in creating favorable conditions for the Council's deliberative work: firstly, the mobilization of communities around collective environmental actions resulting from the Council's work; and secondly, the politicization of local challenges based on situations in which the Council became involved in building solutions based on environmental requirements. Under the effect of these two factors, community mobilization has been strengthened. This was achieved by taking environmental issues into account and giving legitimacy to the segments of the local population, as traditional communities, involved with the Resex. Mobilization has thus been enriched in terms of innovations of various kinds that concern both the mode of production developed by these populations, fishermen and shellfish gatherers, and their ways of life, as

(cc) BY-NC-SA

Estudos de Sociologia, Araraquara, v. 28, n. esp. 2, e023016, 2023. DOI: https://doi.org/10.52780/res.v28iesp.2.17591

⁸ See Pedro R. Jacobi (2002).

⁹ It is worth repeating here the observations made by Callon, Lascoumes and Barthe (2001) on the importance of collective learning for the proper conduct of socio-technical debates and for facilitating the contribution to social, technical and political change.

well as the forms of democracy implemented in the territory; in particular, the deliberative work within the Council.

As for the politicization of local situations¹⁰, this was seen as a consequence of the increasingly political role taken on by the Deliberative Council in a context of affirmed environmentalization. As such, the Council's work, guided by the negotiation of agreements, the drafting of projects, the production of rules, the organization of collective work, the design of control devices etc., has materialized in recognized decisions, taken in deliberative practices, as political activities, since, in both Curuçá and São João da Ponta, an implicit agreement was established between elected politicians and Council members (TEISSERENC, 2016). The legitimacy of these decisions is based on the recognition of the deliberative nature of the Council's work and, in a favorable context, on the environmental requirements that inform them; this legitimacy proves the recognition of communities as a group of citizens with rights and duties regarding the use and management of the resources of a space. This recognition is made through a legal device called a Concession Contract for the Real Right of Use (CCDRU), thus binding the state as Contractor and the communities as Contractors. The experience of these two Resex shows that these changes in political practices open the way to confronting the system of domination¹¹ (TEISSERENC, 2016a.), in the form of new types of alliances between the main power players and the emergence of new players seeking to promote and experiment with an alternative territorial development framework, since it is guided by environmental requirements¹².

Estudos de Sociologia, Araraquara, v. 28, n. esp. 2, e023016, 2023. DOI: https://doi.org/10.52780/res.v28iesp.2.17591

¹⁰ The politicization in question is the result of "a practical agreement between social agents" - those elected and their partners - inclined to transgress traditional rules that codify the functioning of the local order, with the aim of reclassifying all sorts of social practices into political activities and transforming social relations, their forms of exchange and communication, some of their commitments so that they become "elements or rules of the political space" (LAGROYE, 2003, p. 360, our translation).

¹¹ Of course, calling this into question does not mean the pure and simple disappearance of such a system. It means that the implementation of these new practices contributes to the redefinition of relations between the different local protagonists in the form of a denunciation of previous power relations.

¹² This new context is none other than environmentalization. The paths opened to denounce the system of domination by the deliberative experiments underway echo the debates that accompany the emergence of a new model of socio-environmental development, its respective challenges to "environmental territorial governance" (TEISSERENC, 2016, p. 239-240, our translation).

A territory tested by the strategies and practices of domination

Compared to the Curuçá and São João da Ponta Resex, the Caeté-Taperuçu Resex in Bragança-PA contains all the ingredients required to be successful, like its neighbors. The three Resex cover mangrove territory that stretches along the northeastern coast of the state of Pará to the state of Amapá and west to the state of Maranhão¹³. Moreover, unlike its neighbors, Caeté-Taperaçu has the comparative advantage of being located in a municipality that has a university center, a reference in environmental biology, and of being linked to an expanding medium-sized city. In order to address the issue of the failure of this experiment, since the Resex did not manage to challenge the system of domination in a context of environmentalization, we will highlight three forms of domination:

- A domination maintained by power in the transition from rural to urban in a context of environmentalization.
- Domination through the mastery of knowledge.
- Domination through control of the instruments of public action.

A domination maintained by the power system in the transition from rural to urban in a context of environmentalization

In order to characterize the Caeté-Taperaçu Marine Extractive Reserve¹⁴ in some detail, it is essential to situate it in close relation to Bragança-PA, a municipality of 115,000 inhabitants that during the 20th century received significant migration from the states of Maranhão and Ceará, especially fishermen attracted by the marine wealth of this mangrove region. Many of the migrants settled in rural areas and organized themselves into communities, while others settled in the city to develop their fishing activities, occupying three neighbourhoods that were integrated into the Reserve's perimeter. This history has resulted in a tradition of both geographic and professional mobility, which translates into population movements between the city center and its secondary villages or other villages in the region, and changes in temporary professional activities depending on whether they live in the countryside or in the city.

¹³ It is a continuous stretch of coastline that stretches for more than 700 kilometers. These mangroves are considered to be the most extensive and best preserved in the world today. 9,900km² of which around 85% are in the legal Amazon. (AGUILERA, 2021).

¹⁴ The Caeté-Taperaçu Marine Extractive Reserve (REMCT) is a Federal Sustainable Use Conservation Unit. Its perimeter covers 20%, approximately 42,000 hectares, of the area of the municipality of Bragança, 215 kilometers northeast of Belém, the capital of the state of Pará.

The expansion of Bragança-PA over the course of the 20th century, like the rest of the country and the Amazon¹⁵, was accompanied by an expansion of the middle classes, social categories that are generally demanding in terms of services, including leisure. In fact, this rapid and intensified expansion in recent years is considered by some authors to be an essential factor in understanding the political crisis that the country is going through 16. In this coastal region, which is home to the largest continuous strip of mangrove forest in an adequate state of conservation, the attraction of ocean beaches has become the object of development policies via tourism; in Bragança, this attraction led to the construction of a road, which began in the 1970s (OLIVEIRA; HENRIQUE, 2018), to enable access to the beach. This operation brought instability to mangrove conservation and sparked controversy when the Resex was created in the early 2000s¹⁷. On the economic front, in this mangrove territory crossed by the Caeté River, by streams and connected to the ocean, fishing and shellfish extraction is one of the most important activities in the state of Pará. In fact, Bragança is home to one of the largest fleets of boats equipped to access the high seas. The fishing practices carried out by this fleet are considered predatory and have so far been poorly controlled, affecting ecosystems and posing a threat to the coastal areas of northeastern Pará as a whole and to the artisanal fishermen and marine extractivists whose livelihoods depend on aquatic environments. The reputation of fishermen from the municipality of Bragança-PA as invaders of other territories is well known, whether in the immediate vicinity or further afield, such as the island of Marajó-PA¹⁸.

In this municipality, which is undergoing urban expansion, the implementation of the Resex constituted a new stage contributing to the environmentalization of the local context, manifested in the change in the discourse of the leaders of the communities of traditional populations, as well as their professional practices. Marcelo do Vale Oliveira (2017) explains this change in discourse and practices by the desire of these populations to break out of isolation and gain recognition in the form of visibility, which they have not been able to benefit from

Estudos de Sociologia, Araraquara, v. 28, n. esp. 2, e023016, 2023. DOI: https://doi.org/10.52780/res.v28iesp.2.17591

¹⁵ It is worth remembering that almost 85% of the Brazilian population lives in areas considered urban (0.63% of the national territory) and in the northern region of Brazil, where a large part of the Brazilian Amazon is located, this percentage exceeds 70%. (EMBRAPA, 2017; FARIAS *et al.*, 2017).

¹⁶ We are referring here, above all, to Leonardo Avritzer's (2016) analysis of the political crisis that Brazil is going through, giving importance to the changes that have taken place in the middle classes in recent years and the changes of opinion that they have manifested on a social and political level.

¹⁷ The Caeté-Taperaçu Resex was created on 23 May 2005, after the initial perimeter, which included Ajuruteua beach and fishing communities, was changed.

¹⁸ In addition to the weakness in controlling fishing practices, there is a lack of fiscal control of the products of this activity, which helps to understand how, despite the wealth produced, Bragança-PA has few resources for the management of the municipality, since it is one of the poorest in the country with a population of between 80,000 and 120,000 inhabitants.

until now, through cultural events, their way of life, their extractive know-how resulting from the originality of their relationship with nature. According to Oliveira (2017), this need for recognition and the search for visibility played an important role in mobilizing the communities in the process of implementing the Reserve and their participation in the debates related to this action¹⁹.

The mobilization of the communities benefited, as it did in all the Amazon territories (TEISSERENC, 2009), from the active support of a Catholic Church under the influence of Liberation Theology; support that had important effects on the organization of the villages into communities and the training of their leaders. In Bragança-PA, this support came about through the activism of one of the local leaders closely involved in the movement to create the Resex, a priest from the diocese, a militant of the Workers' Party (PT), who managed to be elected mayor of the municipality in 2012. The administration that followed led to a distancing between the religious and political spheres²⁰, resulting in the demobilization of the communities at a time when the Resex's management instrument (Management Plan) was to be implemented that year.

We realized the importance of this demobilization of the communities when, during our research, we met people like the wife of a former leader, deceased at the time, of the association linked to the Catholic Church that played an active role in favor of the creation of the Extractive Reserve and its implementation. She told us about her enthusiasm at the time for the fishing families living in the community to be recognized as users of the Reserve and how, over time, the behavior of community members changed to arrive at the current situation in which attendance at meetings is increasingly random and depends on the results that each person personally expects, in a context in which the National Institute for Colonization and Agrarian Reform (INCRA), the government agency responsible for implementing housing policy for users of the Reserves, has not respected the funding commitment for those integrated into communities located in urban areas.

-

¹⁹ On the local government side, one of the effects of this environmentalization materialized in 2006 in the form of a Master Plan (Law n. 3.875, of 10 October 2006) contemplating the implementation of the local Agenda 21, thus manifesting a political willingness for public management in line with environmental requirements; to this end, however, the municipality has not yet given itself the means to carry it out.

²⁰ One of our interlocutors recognizes that as a priest in one of the parishes in Bragança-PA he was a "great leader" and that he greatly supported the creation of Resex. To this end, mobilizing communities through a social vision of work, at the same time supporting family farming and making people aware of the organization of daily life. His election raised, according to the interlocutor, great hope in relation to the promises made before and during the campaign, but the disappointment, as well as the hope, was great. He was expected to resolve corruption problems. "But he was a victim of the political environment" (Association leader, interviewed in October 2016, our translation).

The loss of mobilization is partly explained because users who reach retirement are not replaced by younger people; The Reserve's many conflicts and demands frighten potential candidates. Such a loss would be the cause of a deterioration in the collective life of the community, which is limited to organizing joint efforts for the parish and demanding that the City Council create a sanitation system and measures to prevent waste and sewage from being dumped into the river. In a few years, this community lost its ability to constitute itself, lost its potential for mobilization²¹ and transformed into an urban neighborhood made up of a population with a classic profile.

The aforementioned testimony is in line with the perspective of the president of a community association that was strongly mobilized by the creation of the Resex and which later turned its attention to the issue of waste management, as well as the problems of insecurity linked to drug trafficking. He notes the association's inability to make commitments in a context in which the city council has not presented any projects to remedy the problems of pollution and insecurity. For him, every time the issue to be dealt with in the association concerns the group's interests, people do not show up, and when they do, they leave every time the issue is raised.

The paralysis of mobilization, the lack of solidarity among the inhabitants and the commitment linked only to the satisfaction of a personal benefit, identified by our interlocutors, and explained by them in cultural terms - " it is the mentality of the people" - are significant of a situation of dependence, already described here, characteristic of the system of domination (GEFFRAY, 1996) that manifests itself in the individual and personal relationships between the dominated and the dominant. This is personal domination, well analyzed by Queiroz (1976); the dominated person has so internalized the factors of domination that they never question the dominant in explaining their misfortunes²². What our interlocutors interpret as resulting from the culture of the people is nothing more than the internalization of dependence to the point of naturalizing it²³.

The absence of collective commitments around issues that concern all the inhabitants of the neighborhood is, moreover, symptomatic of fear, a characteristic effect of the local power

Estudos de Sociologia, Araraquara, v. 28, n. esp. 2, e023016, 2023. DOI: https://doi.org/10.52780/res.v28iesp.2.17591

²¹ On a corresponding situation, but in a different context, see the analysis by Horácio Antunes de Sant'Ana Jr. and Ana Carolina Pires de Miranda (2013).

²² As already indicated, the tensions inherent in these relationships "are deeply hidden" and in this way the "emergence of the consciousness of the dominated" is prevented (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 95).

²³ We can interpret in the same sense the point of view of several of our interlocutors about the priest who was elected mayor, not disapproved of for the disappointment caused by his administration, nor judged responsible for the failure of his mandate insofar as he would have been a victim of the political environment dominated by interests that prevailed to the detriment of his campaign commitments.

system on the populations (TEISSERENC, 2016b). The fear of being denounced by neighbors holds back public stances, which confirms the permanence of domination exercised by local authorities.

Elsewhere in Bragança-PA, at the Ajuruteua seaside resort, an interview with the president of the nearby Fishermen's Village revealed the ambiguous position adopted by the interviewee, a member of the Caeté-Taperaçu Resex Deliberative Council, on the project to modernize the Ajuruteua waterfront with a view to developing tourism. A project involving the Town Hall, a few large landowning families, technical services from the state of Pará, experts, including the university center of the Federal University of Pará in Bragança, etc.; a project that the community fought against given the compulsory relocation of the Fishermen's Village justified when the Extractive Reserve excluding Ajuruteua was created. To justify his position, the president of Vila dos Pescadores presented the complementarity of interests between the seaside resort through the direct sale of local produce to visitors, and the opportunity for young people and women to work during peak periods due to vacations and the summer. The president "forgot" to mention that, despite its geographical proximity, the village has neither a bar nor a hostel or restaurant to welcome tourists, nor does it have a water supply, sanitation or waste management service; that fishermen see their activities frequently disrupted by tourists, people who leave their waste in the tide, while problems of insecurity, drug trafficking and prostitution increase.

In order to achieve their objectives, the City Council and its allies took advantage of the ambiguous stance adopted by Vila dos Pescadores and its president, advancing their tourism project for Ajuruteua without considering environmental requirements. And the monitoring carried out by the Town Hall during the preparation of the Reserve's Management Plan showed that the perimeter of the protected area did not affect Ajuruteua beach. By acting in this way, the Municipality has unambiguously jeopardized the environmentalization of its territory, paradoxically with the support of the Vila dos Pescadores community, where Resex users live, and its president.

Domination through knowledge domain

Let's remember that one of the advantages of Bragança-PA and its Resex is that it can benefit from a campus of the Federal University of Pará (UFPA). The UFPA campus in Bragança-PA at the end of the 1990s was directly linked to the Management and Dynamics in Mangrove Areas Program (1995-2005), also known as the Madam project. This program was

an initiative integrated into a conservation policy aimed at the coastal ecosystems in the north of the states of Pará and Amapá where, extending east to the state of Maranhão, 20% of Brazil's mangrove forests are concentrated. Madam's activities began in 1996, following a cooperation agreement between Brazil and Germany, with the support of the National Council for Scientific and Technological Development (CNPq) and the Center for Marine and Tropical Ecology at the University of Bremen, which greatly boosted the Postgraduate Program in Environmental Biology at the UFPA/Bragança Campus. The aim at that time was to produce knowledge about coastal ecosystems and their sustainability, taking into account the ways of life, knowledge and practices of the so-called traditional populations of mangroves and estuarine areas (OLIVEIRA, 2017). This initiative provided an important set of studies that fueled the debate when the Resex was created and allowed for a more comprehensive knowledge of the territory and its resources. It is undeniable that the debates between the communities and the experts, technicians and scientists enriched by the research encouraged the mobilization of community members and contributed decisively to the environmentalization of the territorial context.

The university's commitment, however, came up against its limits as the implementation of the Resex progressed. The academic nature of its productions and misunderstandings about their use have been decisive in this regard - academic being understood here to mean the epistemological and methodological limits that make it difficult to compromise in order to meet the conditions for the participation of the populations in the development of tools, such as the different diagnoses, or the administration and management instruments, which stipulate exchanges and reciprocity in the production of research and its dissemination. This difficulty reveals the way in which the university assumes its mission of valuing the knowledge of traditional populations and the problems encountered in recognizing it in academic, technical and political circles²⁴. In Bragança-PA, this difficulty appeared in the form of a disagreement between communities and the University on the occasion of a scientific event 25 which, among other things, marked two decades since the start of the Madam Program, with an effort to show the results of the research carried out, especially to Resex users. At the time, it was noted that the issue of recognition had been presented as the result of work based on the understanding

Estudos de Sociologia, Araraquara, v. 28, n. esp. 2, e023016, 2023. DOI: https://doi.org/10.52780/res.v28iesp.2.17591 (cc) BY-NC-SA

²⁴ This recognition is one of the foundations of the Resex as a public policy instrument implemented through a contract (Real Right of Use Concession Contract) between the state and segments of the population, authorizing them to use a territory and recognizing the right of these segments to live in it. In return, these segments collaborate with their knowledge and practices in managing this territory in accordance with environmental requirements (TEISSERENC, 2009).

²⁵ The theme of the scientific event was the recognition of this *native knowledge* in the context of the management of the Caeté-Taperaçu Resex..

that *native knowledge* is equivalent to academic knowledge and that, in order to have the latter contribute to the enrichment of the former, it was a matter of formalizing (formatting?) it. During the event, this misunderstanding did not become a clearly stated object of demand. It did, however, emerge in the form of unease among representatives of the communities that use the Resex, who saw how this way of presenting the problem was based on a hierarchy between academic knowledge and *native knowledge*, that knowledge inscribed in practices and not written about. A hierarchy not only between the types of knowledge, but also between their holders, which as a consequence led to the exploitation of native knowledge for what it represents; namely, a state of experience of community members - in the case of all social experience produced in a particular environment - which makes them holders of a social competence in terms of knowledge, *savoir-faire* and skill (*savoir-être*) which, as a result, they are invited to value in a convenient context²⁶. The result is that the production arising from this conception of *native knowledge* does not allow its holders - the so-called traditional populations - to take advantage of this recognition, to benefit from research on the subject in order to organize the Resex, as was verified when its Management Plan was drawn up.

The second misunderstanding concerns the use made by researchers of the exploitation of this *native knowledge*. At the aforementioned scientific event, organized partly as a review of the Madam Program, only a few community leaders (although all were invited) spoke. In their speeches, some accountability was demanded about the treatment given to *native knowledge*, the appreciation and recognition of which has legitimized scientific knowledge in a context of environmentalization, and about the use made by researchers in their professional careers of research carried out with the participation of local communities. In response to the questions, two or three doctoral theses defended at universities in Germany, a partner country in the Madam Program, were mentioned, as well as numerous master's dissertations and undergraduate final papers carried out at the Federal University of Pará, in Belém and Bragança. This misunderstanding is representative of the symbolic value of the resources exchanged between communities and researchers; resources that, in the academic world, acquire a market value and allow research producers to obtain diplomas, degrees, functions, etc. regardless of the benefits that traditional populations are likely to expect in terms of appreciation and

Estudos de Sociologia, Araraquara, v. 28, n. esp. 2, e023016, 2023. DOI: https://doi.org/10.52780/res.v28iesp.2.17591

(CC) BY-NC-SA

e-ISSN: 1982-4718

²⁶ To understand the difference between native knowledge and scientific knowledge, we share the perspective of Michel de Certeau (1980). For this author, the boundary between these two forms of knowledge "no longer separates two hierarchical knowledges, one speculative, the other linked to particularities, one occupied with reading the order of the world and the other composing with the detail of things in a register fixed by the first, but it opposes practices articulated by discourse to those that are not (yet)" (CERTEAU, 1980, p. 131, our translation). Thus, valuing native knowledge lies in offering them the discourse that is appropriate for their recognition.

recognition of their *native knowledge*. Incidentally, the exchange in question constitutes an unequal exchange; and one of the reasons for the misunderstanding that produces this unequal exchange of symbolic goods between researchers and traditional populations is that, for the latter, this exchange should be appreciated not only in the academic sphere but also in the political sphere, since one of the expected effects of this research is that it will constitute contributions to a new type of debate within the Resex Deliberative Council on socio-technical and environmental challenges (CALLON; LASCOUMES; BARTHE, 2001). It is also significant that the university students present did not respond to these issues, which they considered to be controversial, and that they received support from representatives of the City Council and one or other partner body.

These misunderstandings illustrate the permanence of a form of domination in the sphere of knowledge that is manifested by the exploitation of knowledge as symbolic resources (BOURDIEU, 1992) by those who hold the legitimacy of its recognition and the power that goes with it. This situation interferes in the political sphere since the productions resulting from the exploitation of these resources by the legitimate holders of power in the sphere of knowledge contribute to changes in practices that affect the organization and management of local society; and, as such, the functioning and work of the Deliberative Council.

As Pierre Bourdieu (1992) has shown, the use of these symbolic resources must be evaluated in terms of their effectiveness as a result of committed actions, but also in terms of their contribution to concealing relations of domination (BOURDIEU, 1976); we have dealt with these relations earlier in this article with regard to the *aviamento*. From this point of view, the absence of formal opposition on the part of the communities to the treatment of *native knowledge* by the academic world and the fact that they limit their reactions to a feeling of unease that does not materialize into demands are significant signs of consent on the part of those who do not perceive that the treatment imposed on their *savoir-faire* corresponds to a way of keeping them in a dependency from which the dominant party profits. Marcelo do Vale Oliveira (2017, p. 87, our translation) makes no mistake when he presents this relationship as originating in a "conflicting division between university and communities, which highlights the asymmetrical relationship between scientific knowledge and traditional knowledge, where there are academic groups and scientists who seek to disqualify traditional knowledge".

Amid the consequences of the difficulties encountered by the University in giving the right value to the *native knowledge* of traditional populations, let's consider the following fact. The research produced by academia did not contribute to the debates that accompanied the

drafting of the Management Plan and did not allow them to be transformed into socio-technical debates to respond to environmental challenges (CALLON; LASCOUMES; BARTHE, 2001) and to support the work of deliberation. The distancing from academia in this case left the way open for disputes, conflicts and political uses that led to the paralysis of the Deliberative Council, thus jeopardizing environmentalization.

Domination through control of public action instruments

Among the tools made available to the Resex for managing its territory, in terms of proper use of resources, the Deliberative Council, a public space for debates animated by representatives of the communities and their technical and political partners, chaired by a person from the technical staff of the Chico Mendes Institute for Biodiversity Conservation (ICMBio) as a representative of the State, is undoubtedly the most important steering tool. Here, our main interest is in the Council's work on drawing up the Management Plan - another important tool - with a view to addressing the reasons that led to the paralysis of its operation, ten years after the creation of the Reserve.

Considering that it was clear at the time that the quantity of fish was decreasing, that there was no control over fishing in the waters of the territory reached by fleets from other states, especially Ceará, using fishing techniques that did not respect the rules in force (OLIVEIRA, 2017), resulting in conflicts with local fishermen, this paralysis of the Deliberative Council should come as a surprise, since the Management Plan as a privileged tool for environmental management of the territory was expected as an essential step to guarantee its future existence by controlling the use of its resources based on a recognized priority: "the environmental issue, the idea of sustainability, cooperation, awareness of the finiteness of resources and the collective action of groups, whose way of life is intrinsic to the mangrove" (OLIVEIRA, 2017, p. 76, our translation). This situation offered the ideal conditions for producing a Management Plan adapted to the expectations of Resex users.

However, contrary to expectations, the drafting of the Management Plan gave rise to numerous conflicts. Initially, the representatives of the communities on the Council were opposed to the second ICMBio technician who took on his duties in 2014; another conflict was between the Association of Users of the Caeté-Taperaçu Marine Extractive Reserve (Assuremacata) and the same technician, who was criticized for unjustified arbitration, without considering the assessments of the representatives of the communities, and for taking on a

party-political role (OLIVEIRA, 2017, p. 127).²⁷. These disagreements manifested themselves especially when it came to the rules for using the "corral"²⁸:

[...] the discussions tended to be conflictual and tense in relation to the amount of wood needed to build this fishing technology, which is directly proportional to the size, resulting in smaller corrals or the division of fishermen into a corral, or a fishing ground, or a fishing territory (OLIVEIRA, 2017, p. 165, our translation).

It also manifested itself in discussions about crab extraction practices, where criticism was directed at the fact that the proposals made very little reference to traditional *savoirs-faire*, although this was the case during the data collection carried out by the experts. In both cases, the clash between knowledges manifested itself in accusations from the holders of traditional knowledge and practices about their marginal position in the Management Plan, from which academia was absent. According to the Secretary of the Environment of Bragança at the time, 2016, this resulted in a lack of understanding between the representatives of the communities and their technical partners, thus making conflicts of all kinds visible²⁹, both personal and political, involving people from Assuremacata, whose roles were played in such a way as to favor some to the detriment of others, thus deviating from an institutionality that represents collective interests, which resulted in the discontinuation of the work of the Reserve Council, which at the time had not met for three years.

The response to the environmental challenge within the Reserve, which required collective engagement in territorial actions, gradually gave way to conflictual and competitive relationships at all levels of organization in local society, between the communities and their representatives on the Deliberative Council, between these representatives and ICMBio technicians, or between these representatives and those from the municipal government, between the members of the Association and its president, between the Association and ICMBio, all of whom were accused, in turn, of being responsible for the Reserve's lack of results and/or the detour of resources for personal ends. In this situation, as the Secretary for the Environment pointed out, from the moment that the environmental challenges call into

²⁷ The importance of these conflicts explains why it took three different attempts to draw up the Management Plan without significant results, which led to death threats to the second ICMBio technician who took over the management of the Reserve, and who was forced to resign (SILVA, 2018).

²⁸ "The corral is a fixed trap, in the form of a fence made of wooden sticks, set up on the edge of beaches or sandbanks, in the middle of rivers or the sea, approximately 20 to 30 meters long. It has an opening through which the fish enter during high tide and are trapped at low tide, when the fishermen proceed to harvest them" (MORAES, 2007, p. 56, our translation).

²⁹ For more details on these conflicts, see Marcelo Oliveira's thesis (2017).

question individual advantages, the conflicts have a double effect: that of initially transforming all interpersonal relationships into conflictual relationships and then changing the personal conflicts into institutional and political conflicts. In this case, we can see that when the religious and scientific spheres retreated, the political sphere was free to implement its strategies to control the tools and resources that were implanted in the territory with the creation of the Resex, thus imposing its domination. This influence was exerted both by the direct intervention of politicians - particularly the town hall - in interpersonal relations between community members, their representatives on the Deliberative Council and their partners, and by intermediaries from outside the Reserve, emanating from political parties. This was particularly true in the case of the Ajuruteua waterfront tourism development project. It's understandable why most of the elected representatives are rarely local leaders, but rather those sent by political parties who finance their campaigns with the support of the town hall, members of parliament or power networks. Note in particular the case of the president of Assuremacata at the time, as well as his predecessor, with the result that many communities remain dependent on elected representatives against whom community resistance is powerless. This gives a broader understanding of the conflictual relations between Assuremacata, certain members of the Deliberative Council and its President. In an Association divided by the contradictory interests of its members or schisms between the communities and their representatives, there is the influence of local power and political leaders, weakening its institutional role. In this way, the paralysis of the Council and its inability to deliberate can also be properly understood as a result of the lack of recognition of the legitimacy of traditional populations - above all due to the difficult recognition of their native knowledge - and the disguised non-recognition of the environmentalization boosted by the creation of the Resex. In this context, unlike the processes of creating and implementing Resex in São João da Ponta and Curuçá, the political imposed its game, its disputes, its rules and its system of domination.

Conclusions

(CC) BY-NC-SA

The story of the Caeté-Taperaçu Marine Extractive Reserve could be written in the form of a detective novel to explain how a territory that has so many resources and opportunities at its disposal when an environmentally protected area such as the Reserve is set up, has been conceding space to what Bruno Latour (2017, p. 30-31, our translation) calls "obscurantist elites [...] who decided to quickly get rid of all the burdens of solidarity" and, in particular, everything that could facilitate the environmentalization of this territory, thus accepting a situation in which

the traditional power system is imposed in the form of domination that is exercised through authoritarian practices - threats, violence and conflicts of various kinds. We have tried to show that, unlike the two other reserves in neighbouring municipalities, Curuçá and São João da Ponta, Bragança-PA has experienced a progressive retreat of partners capable of playing a regulatory role in favour of transforming its territory into a new space in which management would challenge the system of domination and authoritarian practices that characterize it. In Bragança-PA, the legitimized actors in the sphere of knowledge are university students who, despite their proximity to environmental issues, have been unable to adapt their legitimate competencies to play a desirable social and political role in a context in which environmentalization is being imposed not in clearly defined contours, but as a challenge to be clarified and overcome collectively. In this sense, the role of this university actor is so important that its legitimacy allows it to take on an essential role in valuing *native knowledge* and recognizing traditional populations, and that it is an interlocutor recognized by technical and scientific partners; moreover, many of these partners were trained by the university and respect the knowledge and competence acquired there.

The second actor called upon to play an important role in regulating the power games was the Catholic Church, given its advantageous position at the time. A priest was elected mayor of the municipality. An election in which the support of the movement for the creation of the Reserve, in which the priest took an active part, was decisive, garnering a great deal of respect, especially from the communities. However, his problematic mandate (2013-2016) and the absence of a convincing alternative led to a decrease in the Church's regulatory power and the impact in terms of support and the expected innovation of its evangelical message.

The retreat of these two major partners and the spheres they represent - scientific and religious - is not the only factor explaining the scenario that ended up being established. However, this retreat allows us to understand how this Reserve, having lost sight of the environmental aims of its project, was unable to appropriate the new tools put at its service to better manage its resources, and was unable to go as far as recognizing traditional populations as full citizens of a territory undergoing sustainable development, as there has gradually been a breakdown in collective commitments in favor of individual strategies by actors to obtain the benefits of the resources offered by the Reserve, obeying imperatives informed by the idea of individual freedom, as the spirit and practices of social and environmental solidarity contained in the Reserve's project have been abandoned, giving way to mistrust, threats and various conflicts. The result has been an attack on the legitimacy of the main actors, who are accused

of defending their personal interests to the detriment of the general interest and of acting in accordance with the dictates of the political sphere, which is taking advantage of the new situation to expand its territorial influence and thus impose its domination.

This experience corroborates the thesis developed by André Botelho (2019) according to which there is a parallel between the fragmentation of forms of solidarity and the fragmentation of the capacity for collective action, which increasingly needs favorable conditions for its operationalization. This double fragmentation, in turn, is explained by the preeminence of "a privatist logic in the very functioning of state institutions and the naturalization of deep social asymmetries" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 235, our translation). By paving the way for these fragmentations with the retreat of the religious and scientific spheres, the situation of the Reserve affects "the forms of social participation, limiting the scope of the democratization process of Brazilian society" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 235, our translation), which thus continues to impose itself as "fragmented, exclusionary and autocratic" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 236, our translation). In the last two administrations - from 2017 until now - the projects prioritized by the municipality have not taken environmental requirements into account, such as the "modernization" for tourism in Ajuruteua; their interventions have contributed to the intensification of conflicts, thus contradicting the interests of the communities. This way of acting on the part of the public authorities, the result of the failure of the previous project, illustrates "the twists and turns of the democratization spiral in contemporary Brazil" (BOTELHO, 2019, p. 184, our translation).

REFERENCES

AGUILERA, J. Manguezais mais preservados do mundo sofrem com atividades predatórias e plástico. **Jornal Modefica**, 10 ago. 2021. Available: https://www.modefica.com.br/amazonia-manguezais-clima/. Access: 19 Sept. 2023.

AVRITZER, L. Impasses da democracy no Brasil. Rio de Janeiro: José Olympio, 2016.

BOTELHO, A. **O retorno da sociedade**. Política e interpretações do Brasil. Petrópolis: Vozes, 2019.

BOURDIEU, P. Les modes de domination. **Actes de la Recherche en sciences sociales**, [S. l.], n. 2-3, p. 122-132, jun. 1976.

BOURDIEU, P. **O poder simbólico**. Tradução de Fernando Tomaz. Rio de Janeiro: Bertrand Brasil, 1992.

BRASIL. Decreto n. 10.341, de 06 de maio de 2020. Autoriza o emprego das Forças Armadas na Garantia da Lei e da Ordem e em ações subsidiárias na faixa de fronteira, nas terras indígenas, nas unidades federais de conservação ambiental e em outras áreas federais nos Estados da Amazônia Legal. Brasília, DF: Presidência da República, 2020. Available: Available: https://www.in.gov.br/web/dou/-/decreto-n-10.341-de-6-de-maio-de-2020-255615699. Access: 20 Sept. 2023.

CALLON, M.; LASCOUMES, P.; BARTHE, Y. Agir dans un monde incertain. Essai sur la démocratie technique, Paris, Seuil, 2001. (La couleur des idées).

CERTEAU, M. L'invention du quotidien. Paris : UGE, 1980. (1. Arts de faire).

EMPRESA BRASILEIRA DE PESQUISA AGROPECUÁRIA (EMBRAPA). Mais de 80% da população brasileira habita 0,63% do território nacional. 2017. Available: https://www.embrapa.br/busca-de-noticias/-/noticia/28840923/mais-de-80-da-populacaobrasileira-habita-063-do-territorio-nacional. Access: 19 Sept. 2023.

FARIAS, A. R.; MINGOTI, R.; VALLE, L. B.; SPADOTTO, C. A.; LOVISI FILHO, E. Identificação, mapeamento e quantificação das áreas urbanas do Brasil. Comunicado Técnico. Campinas, SP: Embrapa, 2017. Available: https://www.embrapa.br/busca-depublicacoes/-/publicacao/1069928/identificacao-mapeamento-e-quantificacao-das-areasurbanas-do-brasil. Access: 19 Sept. 2023.

FRANCO, M. S. C. Homens livres na ordem escravocrata. São Paulo: Unesp, 1997.

FREYRE, G. Casa-grande e senzala. São Paulo: Global, 2006.

GEFFRAY, C. Le modèle de l'exploitation paternaliste. Lusotopie, L'oppression paternaliste au Brésil, n. 3, p. 153-162, 1996. Available: https://www.persee.fr/issue/luso 1257-0273 1996 num 3 1?sectionId=luso 1257-0273 1996 num 3 1 1027. Access: 20 Sept. 2023.

JACOBI, P. R. Políticas sociais locais e os desafios da participação citadina. Ciência & **Saúde Coletiva**, [S. l.], v. 7, n. 3, p. 443-454, 2002.

LAGROYE, J. (org.). La politisation. Paris: Belin, 2003.

LATOUR, B. Où atterrir? Comment s'orienter en politique? Paris: La Découverte, 2017.

LEITE LOPES, J. S. Sobre processos de "Ambientalização" de conflitos e sobre dilemas da participação. Horizontes Antropológicos, Porto Alegre, ano 12, n. 25, jan./jun. 2006.

LÉNA, P. Les rapports de dépendance personnelle au Brésil. Permanence et transformations. **Lusotopie**, L'oppression paternaliste au Brésil, n. 3, p.111-122, 1996. Available: https://www.persee.fr/issue/luso 1257-0273 1996 num 3 1?sectionId=luso 1257-0273 1996 num 3 1 1027. Access: 20 Sept. 2023.

MEIRA, M. A persistência do Aviamento: Colonialismo e História Indígena no noroeste Amazônico. São Paulo: EDUFSCar, 2018.

MORAES, S. C. **Uma arqueologia dos saberes da pesca**: Amazônia e Nordeste. Belém: EDUFPA, 2007.

OLIVEIRA, M. V. C.; HENRIQUE, M. C. No meio do caminho havia um mangue: impactos socioambientais da estrada Bragança-Ajuruteura, Pará. **História, Ciências, Saúde** – **Manguinhos**, Rio de Janeiro, v. 25, n. 2, p. 497-514, abr.-jun. 2018.

OLIVEIRA, M. V. **Plano de Manejo da RESEX Marinha Caeté-Taperaçu**: coprodução de uma ação pública em um território em recomposição. 2017. Tese (Doutorado em Sociologia) – Universidade Federal do Pará, Belém, 2017.

QUEIROZ, M. I. P. **O mandonismo local na vida política brasileira e outros ensaios**. São Paulo: Alfa-Ômega, 1976.

SANT'ANA JUNIOR, H. A.; PIRES MIRANDA, A. C. Conflitos ambientais na Amazônia e a construção de categorias sociológicas e jurídicas: análise da expressão "povos e comunidades tradicionais. **Revista Pós Ciências Sociais**, [*S. l.*], v. 10, n. 20, p. 103-120, jul/dez. 2013.

SCHWARCZ, L. M. **Sobre o autoritarismo brasileiro**. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2019.

SILVA, T. I. **Conflitos sociais e partilha de políticas públicas**: A atuação da associação dos usuários da RESEX Caeté-Taperaçu; Bragança-PA. 2018. Dissertação (Mestrado em Sociologia e Antropologia) — Universidade Federal do Pará, Belém, 2018.

TEISSERENC, M. J. S. A. Politização, ambientalização e desenvolvimento territorial em Reservas Extrativistas. **Caderno CRH**, Salvador, v. 29, n. 77, p. 229-242, maio-/ago. 2016.

TEISSERENC, M. J. S. A.; TEISSERENC, P. Capítulo 7: Terrestre, ambientalização e poder: uma reflexão sobre a experiência de Caeté-Taperaçu, uma RESEX marinha na Amazônia. *In*: TEISSERENC, P.; TEISSERENC, M. J. da S. A.; ROCHA, G. de M. (org.). **Gestão da água**: desafios sociopolíticos e sociotécnicos na Amazônia e no nordeste brasileiros. Belém: NUMA/ UFPA, 2020. p. 195-233.

TEISSERENC, P. Les RESEXs: Un instrument au service des politiques de développement durable en Amazonie brésilienne. **Revista Pós-Ciências Sociais**, São Luís, v. 6, n. 12, p.41-68, 2009.

TEISSERENC, P. As vias de integração da mobilização social no campo político. **Caderno CRH**, Salvador, v. 29, n. 77, p.243-259, maio/ago. 2016a.

TEISSERENC, P. Poder local e condições de sua renovação na Amazônia. **Novos Cadernos NAEA**, [S. l.], v 19, n. 1, p. 47-70, jan./abr. 2016b.

VANDERBERGHE, F. Bolsonaro ou les térmites du Brésil. **AOC**, 29 mar. 2021. Available: https://aoc.media/opinion/2021/03/28/bolsonaro-ou-les-termites-du-bresil/. Access: 20 set. 2023.

VIANNA, F. J. O. **Populações meridionais do Brasil**. 6. ed. Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra/Governo do Estado do Rio de Janeiro/UFF, 1973.

Processing and editing: Editora Ibero-Americana de Educação.

Proofreading, formatting, normalization and translation.

