# EVALUATION OF THE INSTITUTIONAL TRAJECTORY OF SCIENCE WITHOUT BORDERS PROGRAM AT THE FEDERAL UNIVERSITY OF CEARÁ

## AVALIAÇÃO DA TRAJETÓRIA INSTITUCIONAL DO PROGRAMA CIÊNCIA SEM FRONTEIRAS NA UNIVERSIDADE FEDERAL DO CEARÁ

## EVALUACIÓN DE LA TRAYECTORIA INSTITUCIONAL DEL PROGRAMA CIENCIA SIN FRONTERAS EN LA UNIVERSIDAD FEDERAL DE CEARÁ

Márcia Monalisa de Morais Sousa GARCIA<sup>1</sup>
Alcides Fernando GUSSI<sup>2</sup>

ABSTRACT: This article aims to evaluate the institutional trajectory of the Science without Borders Program (CsF) at the Federal University of Ceará (UFC), seeking to understand the perception of managers about the Program based on the hermeneutic perspective of public policy analysis, proposed by Lejano (2012). Using a qualitative approach, semi-structured interviews were carried out with deans, pro-deans of graduation, coordinator of international affairs and coordinators of nine undergraduate courses at the University, contemplating the period of implementation of the Program. As a result, we found different interpretations about the CsF and its relationship with the internationalization, which enabled a broader understanding of the Program at the UFC, considering the different subjects involved in its implementation, allowing the production of evaluation indicators, which contribute to the assertion of higher education as a right and a public good in the midst of political-institutional tensions that qualify it as a commodity.

**KEYWORDS**: Institutional trajectory. Internationalization. Science without Borders Program.

RESUMO: Este artigo tem como objetivo avaliar a trajetória institucional do Programa Ciência sem Fronteiras (CsF) na Universidade Federal do Ceará (UFC), buscando compreender a percepção dos gestores sobre o Programa a partir de uma perspectiva hermenêutica de análise de políticas públicas, proposta por Lejano (2012). Nessa pesquisa, de abordagem qualitativa, foram realizadas entrevistas semiestruturadas com reitores, próreitores de graduação, coordenador de assuntos internacionais e coordenadores de nove cursos de graduação da Universidade, contemplando o período de implementação do Programa. Como resultados, encontramos distintas interpretações acerca do CsF e sua relação com a internacionalização da UFC, o que possibilitou uma compreensão mais ampla acerca do Programa na UFC, considerando os distintos sujeitos envolvidos em sua implementação, permitindo produzir indicadores de avaliação sobre o Programa e internacionalização, que

**RIAEE** – Revista Ibero-Americana de Estudos em Educação, Araraquara, v. 17, n. esp. 3, p. 2194-2213, Nov. 2022 e-ISSN: 1982-5587 DOI: https://doi.org/10.21723/riaee.v17iesp.3.16579 2193

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Federal University of Ceará (UFC), Fortaleza – CE – Brazil. PhD student in Education. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5799-733X. E-mail: marciamonalisa@yahoo.com.br

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Federal University of Ceará (UFC), Fortaleza – CE – Brazil. Professor linked to the Graduate Program in Education (PPGE/UFC) and the Graduate Program in Public Policy Evaluation (PPGAP/UFC). Doctorate in Education (UNICAMP). ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5510-5286. E-mail: alcidesfernandogussi@gmail.com

contribuem para a afirmação da educação superior como um direito e um bem público em meio a tensões político-institucionais que a qualificam como mercadoria.

**PALAVRAS-CHAVE**: Trajetória institucional. Internacionalização. Programa Ciência sem Fronteiras.

RESUMEN: Este artículo tiene como objetivo evaluar la trayectoria institucional del Programa Ciencia sin Fronteras (CsF) de la Universidad Federal de Ceará (UFC), buscando comprender la percepción de los gestores sobre el Programa, basada en la perspectiva hermenéutica del análisis de políticas públicas, según Lejano (2012). En esta investigación cualitativa, fueron realizadas entrevistas semiestructuradas a los decanos, prorrectores de graduación, coordinador de asuntos internacionales y coordinadores de nueve carreras de grado de la Universidad, abarcando el período de implementación del Programa. Como resultado, encontramos diferentes interpretaciones sobre el CsF y su relación con la internacionalización de la UFC, lo que permitió una comprensión más amplia del Programa, considerando los diferentes sujetos involucrados en su implementación, permitiendo la producción de indicadores de evaluación sobre el Programa y la internacionalización, que contribuyen a la afirmación la educación superior como derecho y bien público en medio de tensiones político-institucionales que la califican como mercancía.

**PALABRAS CLAVE**: Trayectoria institucional. Internacionalización. Programa Ciencia sin Fronteras.

#### Introduction

This article presents the institutional trajectory of the Science without Borders Program (CsF in the Portuguese abbreviation) at the Federal University of Ceará (UFC) in the context of the internationalization of higher education, from the perception of multiple institutional actors who participated in its implementation<sup>3</sup>. To this end, it is based on the hermeneutic perspective of public policy analysis, developed by Lejano (2012), focusing on the experience of the subjects and the search for senses and meanings of the policy for those who formulate, implement or experience it, within a given sociopolitical and institutional context.

Internationalization has been a recurring theme in discussions about higher education in Brazil, especially with the introduction of neoliberalism in Brazil in the 1990s, whose public policies, especially in education, began to be fostered by multilateral organizations, such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund (IMF). However, it was as of 2011 that the

RIAEE – Revista Ibero-Americana de Estudos em Educação, Araraquara, v. 17, n. esp. 3, p. 2194-2213, Nov. 2022 DOI: https://doi.org/10.21723/riaee.v17iesp.3.16579

(CC) BY-NC-SA

2194

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>This research consists of a part of my dissertation named "Trajectories of Internationalization at the Public University: evaluation of the Science without Borders Program in the light of the experience of the Federal University of Ceará", defended in March 2020, as a partial requirement for obtaining the title of Master, and oriented by Professor Alcides Fernando Gussi.

internationalization of Brazilian universities gained greater evidence through the Science without Borders Program (CsF) (ALMEIDA, 2014).

The CsF Program was created in the first term of the Dilma Rousseff Government (2011-2014), with Decree No. 7642, of December 13, 2011, under its terms, with the purpose of boosting the internationalization of higher education through the training of highly qualified people in universities of excellence, in addition to attracting to Brazil young talents and highly qualified foreign researchers in areas of knowledge defined as priorities (BRASIL, 2011).

However, the political and economic crisis, which began in the second term of the Dilma Rousseff government (2014-2016), culminated with the impeachment in 2016, affected the continuity of the Program. After the impeachment, in a context of affirmation of a neoliberal government agenda of interim president Michel Temer (2016-2018), characterized by fiscal adjustment, undergraduate scholarships were suspended and the Program was gradually suppressed until it was extinguished in 2017.

To understand the scope of the CsF, in the period from 2012 to 2016, data from the Program's control panel show that 92,880 thousand scholarships were implemented to undergraduate and graduate students throughout Brazil, of which 78.97% were destined to undergraduate students. The Federal University of Ceará (UFC), locus of this evaluation, stood out as one of the 10 Brazilian universities that sent the most students to the Program, with a total of 2,123 scholarships implemented, 87% of which were destined to undergraduate students (CIÊNCIA SEM FRONTEIRAS, n.d.).

With such expressive numbers, we intend here to analyze the meaning of these data for the internationalization of higher education, especially when we consider two types of conception about internationalization: one with an academic-institutional bias, as suggested by the United Nations Educational Organization (UNESCO, 1998), whose actions are aimed at solidarity cooperation; and another with a market bias, aimed at the training of human resources to meet the demands of the global labor market, as proposed by the World Bank (WB) and the World Trade Organization (WTO).

To this end, we sought to evaluate how the CsF Program was experienced and perceived in a specific institutional locus, the UFC, from its different institutional actors, especially with regard to the internationalization processes that the university was undergoing.

To this end, methodologically, we propose to construct the institutional trajectory of the CsF Program in the UFC from five analytical axes:

- i) The personal trajectories and international experience of the actors involved in the CsF program, since, based on their life trajectories and the experiences of the managers, it is possible to understand the meanings they gave to the CsF program in the UFC;
- ii) National and institutional contexts, understanding that the UFC is inserted in the public policies of higher education and, from this, understanding institutional configurations that make it possible to apprehend the sets of interests and the actions of the subjects involved in the implementation of the CsF;
- iii) Conceptions of internationalization, in which we sought to understand the conceptions of internationalization that guide the program implementers;
- iv) the perception of the Science without Borders Program, which sought, based on the reports, to understand the perception of managers about the process of formulation, planning, implementation and the results of the program for the University;
- v) Relationship between the internationalization of the UFC and the CsF Program, in which it was possible to analyze to what extent managers relate the CsF Program and the internationalization of the University.

The construction of the institutional trajectory is a tool for evaluating the implementation of the CsF Program in the UFC, enabling a broader and more detailed understanding of how the policy has worked in the UFC's institutional paths, from the different individuals involved with the CsF Program.

For better organization, this article is structured in six sections, the first of which is this introduction. The second section discusses definitions of internationalization by authors and international organizations. The third section presents the theoretical and methodological paths used to construct the research. The fourth section presents the results of the institutional trajectory of the CsF in the UFC. In the fifth section, an analysis of the trajectory is made and the evaluation indicators produced are presented. And finally, in the last section, there are considerations about the research.

### Views on the internationalization of higher education

There is a variety of definitions and views on the meaning of internationalization of education. Knight (2003, p. 2), a reference on the subject, understands internationalization as a "process of integrating an international, intercultural or global dimension with the purpose, functions or delivery of postsecondary education. Wit et al. (2015) extends Knight's (2003)

concept, including in its purpose the improvement of the quality of higher education and research, bringing a significant contribution to society.

From another perspective, for Van der Wende (1997, p. 18, our translation), internationalization is "any systematic effort aimed at making higher education respond to the requirements and challenges related to the globalization of societies, the economy, and markets. Morosini (2006) also understands that internationalization consists of a systematic effort aimed at making higher education more responsive to the requirements and challenges related to the globalization of society, the economy and the labor market.

Amidst the diversity of conceptions, international organizations have been the ones to guide the directions of the internationalization of higher education, especially with regard to student mobility. From the perspective of the United Nations Educational Organization (UNESCO, 1998), internationalization is one of the strategies for using higher education to contribute to the improvement of life in society, to ensure genuine and sustainable development and to reduce economic, social and political disparities in developing countries through the exchange of knowledge.

However, UNESCO's efforts to ensure the values of higher education have not been enough to stop the logic of the capitalist system, driven by globalization. From another perspective, in 1995, the World Trade Organization (WTO) in the context of the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS), defined new rules and principles for higher education, contrary to UNESCO's conception, including education as a commodity, in order to eliminate barriers to trade in this area, making it possible to combine greater access to university with profitability (WTO, 1998).

There are, therefore, two distinct visions of the internationalization of higher education: one with an academic-institutional bias, along the lines suggested by UNESCO, whose actions are aimed at cooperation and solidarity, giving us a more academic and sociocultural view of the process; and another with a mercadological bias, aimed at the training of human resources to serve the global labor market, as proposed by the World Bank and the WTO. These discrepant conceptions in the analytical field about internationalization reveal the dispute of interests that exists in higher education, which imposes a very tenuous value on education as a social good or as merchandise (SOBRINHO, 2004).

On this issue, Bourdieu (1976) already said that the scientific space is a place for capital disputes, since science becomes a commodity, produced in universities and appropriated by capital. It is in this context of clash of ideas that Brazil has developed policies of internationalization of higher education, whose national milestone was the Science without Borders Program (2012-2016). This is an academic mobility program, created to promote the consolidation, expansion and internationalization of science and technology, innovation and Brazilian competitiveness, on which this article is based on research conducted in the institutional context of the UFC.

# Theoretical and methodological assumptions of the research on the Science without Borders Program

To evaluate the CsF Program in the UFC, we sought an approximation with the hermeneutic paradigm of public policy analysis of Lejano (2012), which points out that the same policy can suffer varied interpretations, outlining an institutional trajectory, as it enters the different institutional spaces. For Lejano (2012, p. 114, our translation),

When meaning is in question, reality is like a text that is subject to analysis and interpretation. If no one can legally claim to be the author, or if the exact notion of authorship is questioned, then politics will be subject to a possibly endless series of interpretations.

Thus, in Lejano's (2012) hermeneutic conception, there is no exact result about a policy, because the same policy can be implemented differently in different institutions, what he calls "institutional coherence", when a policy needs, in some way and in different aspects, to "fit" into an institution, as he explains below:

Coherence, to some extent, means that the original text should be adapted to each place. So essentially, while politics is, after all, text and is after all carried from one place to another by those in power, it still requires to be physically put into each place, and this means, by virtue of the need for at least some degree of coherence, that politics will not be identical in each situation. That is, the engagement of the text with the real induces changes in the way in which the policy is put into action. What results is not isomorphism, but polymorphism (LEJANO, 2012, p. 229, our translation).

Linked to the notion of coherence of a policy, we approach the concept of trajectory developed by Gussi (2008). The author starts from Bourdieu's (1996) notion of life trajectory in his essay "The Biographical Illusion", for whom trajectory is "a series of positions successively occupied by a single agent or by a single group in a space itself in flux and subjected to incessant transformations" (BORDIEU, 1996, p. 81, our translation). That is, life does not follow a logical order, but moves in the social space and is linked to different social agents. In the same way, for Gussi (2008), public policies occur when they enter institutional

spaces: they are circumscribed to re-significations and change as they are implemented, according to the actions of social agents.

Moreover, when one enters an institution to try to understand the development of a policy, that is, its institutional trajectory (GUSSI, 2008), one must pay attention that an institution goes beyond the boundaries of the formal model, because "real institutions are not just rules and organizational structures, but are intertwined with culture, histories, personalities and other contextual contingencies" (LEJANO, 2012, p. 261, our translation). This web of relationships that departs from the formal model of an institution, Lejano (2012) termed the "topology of institutions."

Therefore, we maintain here that in order to understand the trajectory of the CsF in the UFC, it is necessary to understand how this university is organized, who the people responsible for its implementation are and how they think, and what relevance the program has had in the process of internationalization of the UFC, that is, in the words of Lejano (2012), to understand the "topology of the institution".

To this end, methodologically, semi-structured interviews were conducted covering both the managers of the UFC's upper administration and the course coordinators responsible for the operationalization of the program and the relationship with participating students. Thus, seeking to cover the managements that contemplated the beginning of the program (2012-2014) and its end (2014-2016), we interviewed 2 deans, 2 undergraduate pro-rectors, 1 coordinator of international affairs and coordinators of 9 courses, being: 2 courses of the Science Center, 3 courses of the Technology Center and 4 courses of the Institute of Culture and Art, totaling 17 UFC managers<sup>4</sup>.

From the data analysis, as we will see below, it was possible to understand how the managers interpret the CsF Program in the UFC, articulating it with the university's internationalization processes.

## The institutional trajectory of the Science without Borders Program through the eyes of the managers of the Federal University of Ceará

Based on the concepts of Coherence and Topology of Institutions by Lejano (2012) and the notion of trajectory by Gussi (2008), it was possible to construct the institutional trajectory of the CsF Program in the UFC, whose results will be presented based on five analytical axes,

2199

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The interviews were conducted between September 2019 and February 2020 and all managers signed the Informed Consent Form.

which guided the research: a) personal trajectory and international experience; b) national and institutional contexts; c) conceptions of internationalization; d) perception of the Science without Borders Program; and e) relationship between the Science without Borders Program and the internationalization of the UFC.

## a) Personal trajectory and international experience of the managers

Regarding the first analytical axis, it is observed that the reports of academic and professional trajectories dialogue with time and social space, revealing their historical, collective and social dimension, thus enabling to formulate a better understanding of the context in which the interviewed managers are inserted (GUSSI, 2005). Their trajectories, therefore, intertwine with these contexts and, consequently, influence the way they experience the university and see public policies, as summarized in Chart 1:

Chart 1 – Overview: personal trajectories and international experience

Managers	Personal Trajectories	International Experience
Higher Administration (deans, undergraduate deans, and international affairs coordinator) and course coordinators	- The life trajectories of the managers are interwoven with the history of the UFC and historical contexts, influencing their perception of higher education policies and CsF Program in the UFC and its implementation.	-All upper administration managers have had international experience, while among the 12 coordinators, only four have not; - The managers were unanimous in stating that it is a very enriching experience for education, in which the student comes into contact with other cultures, other worldviews, new languages, new technologies and different ways of doing research; - The international experience of the managers contributed to the recognition of the relevance of mobility, which certainly allowed the UFC to have a greater ownership of the CsF when it comes to the implementation of the Program.

Source: Prepared by the authors

It can be seen that the fact that university managers had lived an international experience contributed to their recognition of the relevance of mobility for CsF scholarship students, which certainly allowed the UFC to have a greater institutional ownership of the CsF with regard to the implementation of the Program, because according to Lejano (2012, p. 122), "we are inevitably influenced by our personal predilections, training, histories, and beliefs".

### b) National and institutional context

In relation to the second analytical axis, under this evaluative perspective, it is understood that there is no way to analyze the trajectory of a policy without considering the State configurations and the Government agendas in which it is inserted. The managers' understanding of the national and institutional contexts are summarized in Chart 2:

Chart 2 – Overview: national and institutional context

Managers	National Context	International Context	
Higher Administration (deans,	-Highlighted the investments in	- Among the course coordinators, a	
undergraduate deans, and	higher education from 2003 to	greater fear of addressing the UFC	
international affairs coordinator)	2016;	context was observed as a result of	
and course coordinators	-Presented insecurity about the	the political-institutional moment	
	future of public universities in the	that the University has been	
	current context, especially the	experiencing, especially in 2019;	
	coordinators of the Institute of	-The adoption of neoconservative	
	Culture and Art (ICA), an area that	and neoliberal measures affect the	
	has been attacked by the Bolsonaro	UFC and transform the meanings	
	government;	of training and the trajectory of	
	-A coordinator of the Mechanical	internationalization.	
	Production Engineering course		
	showed optimism about the new		
	directions of higher education.		

Source: Prepared by the authors

Regarding contexts, it is observed that managers were unanimous in recognizing the investment in higher education public policies between 2003 and 2016. However, they expressed uncertainties about the future of public universities, especially in the current context of neoconservative and neoliberal measures<sup>5</sup>, that affect universities and transform the meaning of training and the trajectory of internationalization, except for a coordinator of the Mechanical Production Engineering course, who showed optimism in relation to the new directions of higher education. Among the course coordinators, there was a greater fear of approaching the UFC context due to the political polarizations in which the country finds itself and, in particular,

RIAEE - Revista Ibero-Americana de Estudos em Educação, Araraquara, v. 17, n. esp. 3, p. 2194-2213, Nov. 2022 e-ISSN: 1982-5587 DOI: https://doi.org/10.21723/riaee.v17iesp.3.16579

2201

(cc) BY-NC-SA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> As of 2019, in the Bolsonaro Government (2019-2022), with the adoption of the political current of neoconservatism, characterized as liberal in the economy and conservative in customs (CASTRO, 2018), public universities were the ones that suffered most from the attacks, not only ideological, but economic of the Government, resulting in the largest cut of resources resulting from the fiscal adjustment policy, initially announced as 30% of the total funding and then 30% of the discretionary budget (i.e., of non-obligatory spending), equivalent to more than R\$ 1.5 (BBC, 2019).

due to the political-institutional moment that the University has been experiencing, especially since  $2019^6$ .

## c) Conceptions of internationalization

Considering the two aspects of internationalization addressed in this research, understanding what managers think about the internationalization of universities and how they conduct this process is fundamental to understanding how the CsF was implemented in the institution. To this end, we sought to understand the managers' perception of the place that internationalization currently occupies in universities and how they perceive the internationalization of the UFC. The results are summarized in Chart 3:

Chart 3 – Overview: Conceptions of internationalization

Managers	Conception of internationalization	Perception about the UFC's Internationalization	
Higher Administration (deans, undergraduate deans, and international affairs coordinator)	-They present the same conception of internationalization defined by UNESCO, focused on mutual cooperation and solidarity among institutions.	-They attribute the internationalization highlight in the period from 2012 to 2016 to mobility through CsF; -Assess the internationalization of the UFC based on the prominence of the University in international rankings and the creation of the Pro-Rectory of International Relations (PROINTER).	
Course Coordinators	-Most present the same conception of internationalization defined by UNESCO, focused on mutual cooperation and solidarity among institutions; -A coordinator of the Mechanical Production Engineering course presented the conception of internationalization defined by WTO, focused on educational service.	-Most believe that the internationalization of the UFC still needs to develop; -It still consists of a one-way street in which it only sends students (passive mobility) and receives few foreign students (active mobility); -Difficulties with foreign languages are an obstacle to the internationalization of the CBU.	

Source: Prepared by the authors

It can be observed that the upper administration managers have the same conception as UNESCO, of an internationalization based on the principles of solidarity and exchange of knowledge between universities. Among the course coordinators, we also observed the same conception of internationalization close to that of UNESCO, with the exception of a coordinator

2202

RIAEE – Revista Ibero-Americana de Estudos em Educação, Araraquara, v. 17, n. esp. 3, p. 2194-2213, Nov. 2022 e-ISSN: 1982-5587 DOI: https://doi.org/10.21723/riaee.v17iesp.3.16579

(CC) BY-NC-SA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>In 2019, the consultation for Dean occurred, whose choice by the university community was not considered by the president of the republic, breaking with the democratic tradition that had been implemented since 1995 in the UFC, of appointing the Dean with the most votes.

of the Mechanical Production Engineering course, who agrees with the WTO conception of an internationalization focused on meeting market demands.

On the internationalization of the UFC, the deans and the pro-rector of graduation, in the period 2015 to 2019, evaluate the internationalization of the UFC based on the highlights in the rankings and the creation of the Office of International Relations (PROINTER); the coordinator of international affairs attributes the highlight of internationalization to the rise of mobility by CsF; the pro-rector of graduation in the period from 2012 to 2015, while recognizing that the internationalization of the UFC has been growing in recent years, believes that it is still a timid process, in a one-way street, because the UFC sends many students, but still receives few foreign students; the course coordinators, in turn, corroborate this same perception.

## d) Managers' perception of the CsF Program

In the fourth analytical axis, questions were asked that contemplated the perception of managers about the process of formulation, planning, implementation and the results that the SwB brought to the UFC, whose summary is presented in Chart 4:

Chart 4 – Overview: the managers' perception of the CsF Program

Managers	Formulation	Planning	Implementation	CsF results for the UFC
Managers of the Higher Administration (deans, undergraduate deans, and coordinator of institutional affairs)	-It has broadened the possibilities in the students' education; -It has contributed to the democratization of higher education; -It has structured the process of internationalization of the UFC.	-It was elaborated very quickly; -It disregarded the participation of the universities and their local specificities.	-Lack of monitoring of students by the UFC; -Difficulty in taking advantage of the subjects upon students' return; -CsF students took longer to graduate; -Lack of student feedback to the CFCU upon return from the CsF; -Lack of institutionalization of the UFC affected the implementation of the Program.	-It contributed to the education of the students;  - Contributed to identifying the rigidity of the UFC's curricula; -Increased the UFC's visibility on the national and international scene; -It has strengthened the internationalization process; -It has positively influenced the Casas de Cultura.
Course Coordinators	-It has broadened the possibilities in the students' education.	-It was elaborated very quickly; -It disregarded the participation of the universities and	-Lack of monitoring of students by the UFC; -Difficulty in taking advantage of the	-It contributed to the education of the students.

their local	subjects upon	
specificities;	students' return;	
-The selection	-CsF students took	
process did not	longer to graduate;	
select the best	-Lack of	
students;	counterpart	
-Lack of language	contribution from	
proficiency	the students to the	
compromised the	UFC upon their	
students'	return from the CsF.	
performance on the		
exchange.		

As far as formulation is concerned, the managers were unanimous in stating that the CsF Program has expanded the educational possibilities for students. In addition, the Program has also strengthened the democratization of higher education by giving students from different social classes the possibility of academic mobility, something that was previously restricted to class A in society. For the upper administration managers, institutionally, the CsF has contributed to structuring the internationalization of the UFC, which was not perceived by the course coordinators.

Regarding the planning of the policy, both higher education managers and course coordinators unanimously perceived the speed with which the CsF was created, without any more elaborate planning that would have involved the universities and considered their local specificities. This meant that the institutional actors faced limitations in their decision-making to lead to a better implementation of the policy.

Still on CsF planning, the course coordinators also mentioned that the selection process did not select the best students, making it possible for students who, in their perception, should not participate in the Program. They also criticized the issue of language deficiency, since many students traveled without knowing the language of the destination country, compromising their performance in foreign universities.

With regard to the implementation of the CsF in the UFC, numerous difficulties were reported, mainly felt by the coordinator of international affairs and the course coordinators, who are responsible for putting the policy into practice. Among these, the following stand out the lack of a broader structure to meet the demands arising from the CsF, which was significant; the lack of monitoring of students by the UFC, since this was an assignment of the Coordination for the Improvement of Higher Level Personnel (CAPES) and the National Council for Scientific and Technological Development (CNPq); the lack of foreign language proficiency, which limited the destination of the students; the difficulty in taking advantage of the subjects

upon the students' return due to the rigidity of the curricula of the UFC courses, making the students take longer to finish their graduation; and the lack of compensation for the University upon their return from mobility.

The issue of the results of the CsF for the UFC was the aspect of greatest disagreement between upper management managers and course coordinators. For the upper administration managers, although the CsF did not intensify ties with foreign universities, the Program gave the University greater visibility both nationally and internationally, strengthened the internationalization process, positively influenced the Casas de Cultura, helped identify the rigidity of the UFC course curricula and expanded the possibilities for student education. For the course coordinators, the CsF contributed in a personal way to the education of the students, since there were no changes in the curricula or in the teaching methodologies.

It can be observed, therefore, that the managers of the upper administration and the course coordinators presented convergent points, especially on the issue of planning and implementation of the CsF in the UFC. However, they differed significantly in relation to the results that the Program brought to the University.

### e) Relationship between the CsF Program and the internationalization of the UFC

Since one of the objectives of the CsF Program, according to Decree No. 7642 of December 13, 2011 (BRAZIL, 2011), was to boost the internationalization process of universities, it is necessary to understand to what extent the CsF Program was related to the internationalization of the UFC. Thus, when asked about the relationship between the CsF and the internationalization of the UFC, the managers presented different interpretations, as shown in Chart 5:

Chart 5 – Overview: the CsF Program and the internationalization of the UFC

Managers of the Higher Administration (deans, undergraduate deans, and international affairs coordinator)	Course Coordinators
-The CsF represented the internationalization of the UFC; -The CsF has sensitized the academic community to internationalization; -The CsF has influenced the internationalization rankings; -The CsF has contributed to the increase in (passive) academic mobility in the UFC; -The CsF has not increased partnerships and cooperation between universities.	-The CsF was part of the internationalization of the UFC.

It can be seen that for the upper administration managers, the CsF, despite not contributing to the increase in partnerships between higher education institutions, represented the internationalization of the UFC in that period, sensitized the academic community to internationalization, influenced the internationalization rankings and contributed to the increase in (passive) academic mobility in the UFC. For the course coordinators, the CsF Program was part of the internationalization of the University.

# Institutional trajectories of Science without Borders at the Federal University of Ceará and its qualitative indicators

The representations of the managers involved in the implementation of the CsF lead us to a comprehensive field of analysis in that they give new meaning to the trajectories of the CsF in the UFC, from the Rector's Office, through the bodies that implemented the Program, such as the Dean's Office for Undergraduate Studies (PROGRAD) and the Coordinator of International Affairs (CAI), to the course coordinators at the Center for Technology, the Center for Sciences and the Institute of Culture and Arts of the UFC.

Based on the analysis of the five analytical axes, we have results that point to the construction of new qualitative indicators about the trajectories of the CsF and the internationalization of the UFC, as shown in Chart 6.

2206

e-ISSN: 1982-5587

**Chart 6** – Institutional trajectories of the CsF Program and the internationalization of the UFC: indicators

Dimensions	Indicators	Results
Personal Trajectory	International experience of the managers.	-Managers' and life trajectories are intertwined with the history of the UFC and historical contexts, influencing their perception of higher education policies and the CsF Program in the UFC and its implementation;  -The 5 upper management managers have had international experience; while among the 12 coordinators, only 4 have not;  - The managers were unanimous in stating that it is a very enriching experience for education, in which the student comes into contact with other cultures, other worldviews, new languages, new technologies and different ways of doing research;  -The international experience of the managers contributed to the recognition of the relevance of mobility, which certainly allowed the UFC to have a greater appropriation of the CsF when it comes to the implementation of the Program.
National and Institutional Contexts	Managers' perceptions of the national and institutional contexts	-For all, it is notable the investment in public policies of higher education between 2003 and 2016; -Managers of the higher administration and course coordinators presented uncertainties and insecurities in the academic scope regarding the future of public universities and scientific development in the current context, especially the coordinators of the Institute of Culture and Art (ICA), an area that has been attacked by the Bolsonaro Government, except for a coordinator of the Mechanical Production Engineering course, who showed optimism regarding the new directions of higher education; -Among the course coordinators, it was observed a greater fear in addressing the context of the UFC as a result of the political polarizations in which the country finds itself and, in particular, by the political-institutional moment that the University has been experiencing, especially in 2019.

**Chart 6** Institutional trajectories of the CsF Program and the internationalization of the UFC: indicators

Dimensions	Indicators	Results
Internationalization	Managers' conceptions about internationalization	-In general, it was aligned with that indicated by UNESCO, focused on solidarity between institutions, with the exception of the coordinator of the Mechanical Production Engineering course, who restricted training to meeting market demands, as indicated by the WTO.  -Managers of the higher administration positively evaluate the internationalization of the UFC based on the creation of the Pró-Reitoria de Internacionalização (PROINTER) and with the prominence of the University in the international rankings;  -Course coordinators see that internationalization still needs to be developed, as it faces barriers such as language and the presence of few foreign students in the UFC.
The CsF Program in the UFC	Managers' perception of the formulation, planning,	-As far as formulation is concerned, the managers are unanimous in affirming that the Program has expanded the possibilities for student education. Moreover, for the upper administration managers, the CsF contributed to the democratization of higher

RIAEE – Revista Ibero-Americana de Estudos em Educação, Araraquara, v. 17, n. esp. 3, p. 2194-2213, Nov. 2022

DOI: https://doi.org/10.21723/riaee.v17iesp.3.16579

	implementation and results of the CsF Program in the UFC	education and structured the internationalization process of the UFC; -Regarding planning, all the managers agreed that the CsF was designed too quickly and did not take into account the participation of the universities and their local specificities. However, for the course coordinators, the selection process lacked more rigor and the lack of language proficiency compromised the students' performance in the exchange program;
		-About the implementation, all mentioned the lack of monitoring of students by the CBU during the exchange and the difficulty in taking advantage of the subjects upon the students' return. They also cited that students participating in CsF took longer to graduate as a result of the rigid curricular designs of the UFC and the lack of reciprocity from students to the UFC upon return from CsF;
		-As for the results of the Program for the UFC, both the upper management and the course coordinators agree that the CsF has contributed to broadening the students' education. However, the upper administration managers perceive institutional contributions for the UFC. For them, the CsF also contributed to identifying the rigidity of the UFC's curricula, gave greater visibility to the UFC on the national and international scenes, positively influenced the UFC's Houses of Culture and strengthened the UFC's internationalization process, which was not mentioned by the course coordinators.
The CsF Program and the internationalization of the UFC	Managers' perception of the relationship between the CsF Program and the internationalization of the UFC	-Managers of the senior administration understand that, although the CsF did not increase partnerships between universities, the Program represented the internationalization of the UFC, made the academic community aware of internationalization, influenced the internationalization rankings of the University, contributed to the increase in (passive) academic mobility in the UFC -For the course coordinators, the CsF was part of the internationalization of the UFC.

In summary, the trajectory of the CsF Program in the UFC points to distinct understandings about the CsF Program and internationalization in the UFC. These distinctions are clearly manifested, especially among upper management managers and course coordinators, since both the position they hold and their theoretical affiliations and values influence how they perceive the Program and put it into practice in the UFC (OLIVEIRA, 2014).

It was observed that the upper administration managers presented a conception very close to that of UNESCO, of an internationalization based on the principles of solidarity and exchange of knowledge between universities. Among the course coordinators, the same approach was also observed, with the exception of a coordinator of the Mechanical Production Engineering course, who agrees with the WTO conception, that of an internationalization focused on meeting market demands.

About the internationalization of the UFC, the deans and a pro-rector of graduation evaluate it based on the highlights in the rankings and the creation of the Pro-Rectory of International Relations (PROINTER); In turn, the coordinator of international affairs attributes the highlight of internationalization to the rise of mobility by CsF; The other undergraduate pro-rector, while recognizing that the internationalization of the UFC has grown in recent years, believes that it is still a timid process, because the UFC sends many students, but still receives few foreign students; the course coordinators, in turn, corroborate this same perception.

In relation to the CsF Program in the UFC, the managers saw the CsF as an expansion of opportunities in the education of students, as a program that strengthened the policies of democratization of higher education, since it allowed students from any social class to have an exchange program outside the country. Besides, for them, the program contributed to the structuring of internationalization in the university.

The managers were unanimous in stating that the Program was created very quickly and without the participation of the universities themselves, limiting their actions in the implementation, which made it difficult to monitor the students during the exchange period and to take advantage of the subjects upon their return, since some curricula were different. Moreover, the managers also mention the lack of counterpart on the return to the UFC, something not foreseen in the planning of the Program.

It was observed that the upper administration managers perceived the institutional results of the CsF for the UFC. For them, the CsF contributed to the training of students and to identifying the rigidity of the UFC's curricula. Besides, the Program gave more visibility to the UFC in the national and international scenario, strengthened the internationalization process of the university and positively influenced the Foreign Culture Houses. For the course coordinators, the results of the CsF for the students were considered to be of a personal nature, as it did not contribute to changing the curricular design of the courses, nor the teaching methodologies.

Another aspect that presented different meanings was the relationship between the CsF and the internationalization of the UFC. For the senior managers, the CsF represented the internationalization of the UFC in that period, sensitized the academic community to internationalization, influenced the internationalization rankings and contributed to the increase in (passive) academic mobility in the UFC. For the course coordinators the CsF Program consisted of a part of the internationalization of the University.

Therefore, the analysis of the institutional trajectory highlights nuances regarding the dispersion of the CsF program in the UFC, helping to understand the different perceptions that the program had among the managers who implemented the policy, demonstrating that the CsF Program mobilized the institution to structure its internationalization process.

The trajectory produced qualitative indicators that show how the CsF Program was experienced by the institutional actors of the UFC. The international experience of the managers indicates a greater appropriation of the implementation of the Program at the University. The perception of the national and institutional contexts shows the field of tensions in which public universities, and therefore internationalization, are circumscribed, and how they take on new trajectories as the contexts and managers change. The managers' conceptions of internationalization indicate that, despite the existence of an internationalization project based on market logic, there are players in the UFC who resist and modify the implementation of the policy, guided by their own conceptions of internationalization.

Regarding the managers' perception of the CsF and its relation to the internationalization of the UFC, despite the institutional obstacles faced in the planning and implementation of the policy, these indicators show that the Program has boosted the internationalization of the University, contributing to its institutionalization process.

#### **Final Remarks**

This article aimed to evaluate the institutional trajectory of the Science without Borders Program (CsF) at the Federal University of Ceará (UFC) in the context of the internationalization of higher education, seeking to understand the managers' perception of the SWB Program at the University, considering the contexts and subjects involved in the implementation of the Program.

The trajectory of the CsF Program in the UFC pointed out how the Program "fitted in", in the terms of Lejano (2012), in different academic areas and at different hierarchical levels of the University, showing how its institutional actors gave new meaning to the policy. Therefore, we find different representations of the CsF in the UFC, showing, through the indicators produced, how the Program induced the internationalization of the UFC and how this internationalization was taking on new meanings and trajectories in the University, both in terms of the reconfiguration of the formal dimensions of the institution, and in informal

dimensions, bringing about new perspectives and representations among different institutional actors regarding the international experience.

It also reveals the field of tensions that involves higher education, because despite the existence of an internationalization policy oriented towards mercantile logic, whether it is directed by the state, by international organizations or even by institutional actors, there are managers who oppose it and affect the trajectory of the policy, giving it institutional coherence (LEJANO, 2012).

Finally, this work reveals, through the production of indicators, produced from the perspective of different subjects involved, how the CsF has induced the internationalization of the University, affirming higher education as a right and a public good.

#### REFERENCES

ALMEIDA, S. M. C. A Internacionalização da Educação superior e Suas Muitas Fronteiras. *In*: JORNADA DO HISTEDBR, 12.; SEMINÁRIO DE DEZEMBRO, 10., 2007, Caxias-Ma. **Anais** [...]. Caxias, MA: HISTEDBR-MA; CESC, 2014.

BOURDIEU, P. Le champ scientifique. Actes de la Recherche en Sciences Sociales, n. 2/3, p. 88-104, jun. 1976.

BOURDIEU, P. A ilusão biográfica. *In*: AMADO, J.; FERREIRA, M. M. Usos e abusos da História oral. Rio de Janeiro: Fundação Getúlio Vargas, 1996.

BRAZIL. **Decreto n. 7642, de 13 de dezembro de 2011**. Institui o Programa Ciência sem Fronteiras. Brasília, DF: Presidência da República, 2011. Available at: http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil\_03/\_ato2011-2014/2011/decreto/d7642.htm. Access on: 23 Apr. 2018.

CASTRO, F. A. Precisamos falar sobre o (NEO)conservadorismo no Brasil. **Justificando**, 06 nov. 2018. Available at: http://www.justificando.com/2018/11/06/precisamos-falar-sobre-o-neoconservadorismo-no-brasil/. Access on: 08 July 2019.

CIÊNCIA SEM FRONTEIRAS. **O Programa**. n.d. Available at: http://www.cienciasemfronteiras.gov.br/web/csf/o-programa. Access on: 14 May 2018.

GUSSI, A. F. **Pedagogias da experiência no mundo do trabalho**: Narrativas biográficas no contexto de mudanças de um banco público estadual. 2005. Tese (Doutorado em Educação) – Faculdade de Educação, Universidade Estadual de Campinas, Campinas, 2005. Available at: https://www.fe.unicamp.br/gepedisc/monografias-teses.html. Access on: 13 Aug. 2018.

GUSSI, A. F. Apontamentos teóricos e metodológicos para a avaliação de programas de microcrédito. **AVAL Revista Avaliação de Políticas Públicas**, ano 1, v. 1, n. 1, p. 29-39, jan./jun. 2008. Available at: https://repositorio.ufc.br/handle/riufc/22513. Access on: 05 Oct. 2018.

KNIGHT, J. Updated Internationalization Definition. **International Higher Education**, Boston; v. 33, 2003. Available at: https://ejournals.bc.edu/index.php/ihe/article/view/7391. Access on 10 Jan. 2022.

LEJANO, R. P. **Parâmetros para análise de políticas públicas**: A fusão de texto e contexto. Campinas, SP: Arte Escrita, 2012.

MOROSINI, M. C. Estado do conhecimento sobre internacionalização da educação superior: Conceitos e práticas. **Educar**, Curitiba, n. 28, p. 107-124, 2006. Available at: https://www.scielo.br/j/er/a/k4qqgRK75hvVtq4Kn6QLSJy/?format=pdf&lang=pt. Access on: 10 Jan. 2022.

OLIVEIRA, B. R. A Implementação do Programa Bolsa Família sob a perspectiva da condicionalidade educacional: Uma análise a partir dos agentes públicos de base. **Revista do Serviço Público**, Brasília, v. 65, n. 4, p. 517-544, out./dez. 2014. Available at: https://revista.enap.gov.br/index.php/RSP/article/view/527. Access on: 03 July 2019.

OS seis números que resumem os seis meses da Educação na gestão Bolsonaro. **BBC Brasil**, 30 jun. 2019. Available at: https://www.bbc.com/portuguese/brasil-48699037. Access on: 08 July 2019.

SOBRINHO, J. D. Avaliação ética e política em função da educação como direito público ou como mercadoria? **Educ. Soc.**, Campinas, v. 25, n. 88, p. 703-725, out. 2004. Available at: https://www.scielo.br/j/es/a/mmDFy9Sk6vHzq7R4hJxWKNk/abstract/?lang=pt. Access on: 18 Feb. 2022.

UNESCO. **Declaração Mundial sobre Educação superior no Século XXI:** Visão e ação. Paris: UNESCO, 1998. Available at: http://www.direitoshumanos.usp.br/index.php/Direito-a-Educa%C3%A7%C3%A3o/declaracao-mundial-sobre-educacao-superior-no-seculo-xxi-visao-e-acao.html. Access on: 05 Dec. 2018.

VAN DER WENDE, M. Missing links: The Relationship between National Policies for Internationalisation and those for Higher Education in General. *In*: KALVERMARK, T.; VAN DER WENDE, M. (ed.). **National Policies for the Internationalization of Higher Education in Europe**. Hogskoleverket Studies. Estocolmo: Agência Nacional para la Educación Superior, 1997.

WIT, H. et al. L'Internationalisation de l'Enseignement Supérieur. Direction Générale des Politiques Internes. Département Thématique B: Politiques Structurelles et de Cohésion. Parlement Européen, 2015. Available at: http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2015/540370/IPOL\_STU(2015)540370\_EN.pdf. Access on: 15 June 2018.

WTO. World Trade Organization. **Education Service**: Nota documental de la secretaria. 1998.

### How to reference this article

GARCIA, M. M. M. S.; GUSSI, A. F. Evaluation of the institutional trajectory of Science Without Borders Program at the Federal University of Ceará. **Revista Ibero-Americana de Estudos em Educação**, Araraquara, v. 17, n. esp. 3, p. 2194-2213, nov. 2022. e-ISSN: 1982-5587. DOI: https://doi.org/10.21723/riaee.v17iesp.3.16579

**Submitted**: 06/03/2022

Revisiosn required: 19/06/2022

**Approved**: 25/09/2022 **Published**: 30/11/2022

Processing and publication by the Editora Ibero-Americana de Educação.

Correction, formatting, standardization and translation.



e-ISSN: 1982-5587