EDUCATION: GUIDING THREAD FOR OVERCOMING SOCIAL DIFFERENCES IN BRAZIL

EDUCAÇÃO: FIO CONDUTOR DA SUPERAÇÃO DAS DIFERENÇAS SOCIAIS NO BRASIL

EDUCACIÓN: HILO CONDUCTOR PARA SUPERAR LAS DIFERENCIAS SOCIALES EN BRASIL

Aureliana da Silva TAVARES[1]
Janine Marta Coelho RODRIGUES[2]

ABSTRACT: An attitude of intolerance is something that is getting worse every day in our social environment, including school spaces. As society develops, new groups emerge with their way of thinking, acting and relating. Based on that the education must follow such changes. Thus, we will discuss the perception of prejudice in Brazil, deconstructing stereotypes related to the races and ethnicities experienced in Brazil of the 21st century. Throughout this article we will present some characteristics of Brazilian society that transpose the theme of intolerance and the inclusion of everyone in society. The laws and formal documents that offer subsidies for the construction of a more inclusive society permeated the discursive bias of the text. The struggle for an inclusive society that grows from the heart of schools is one of the fundamental points that we defend and present throughout the article.

KEYWORDS: Intolerance. Society. Inclusion.

RESUMO: *Atitude de intolerância é algo que está se agravando a cada dia em nosso meio social incluindo os espaços escolares. À medida que a sociedade se desenvolve novos grupos surgem com sua forma de pensar, agir e se relacionar e para isso a educação dever acompanhar tais mudanças. Assim, discutiremos a percepção sobre o preconceito no Brasil, desconstruindo estereótipos relacionados às raças e etnias vivenciadas no Brasil do século XXI. Ao longo do discurso apresentaremos algumas características da sociedade brasileira que transpõem o tema intolerância e a inclusão de todos na sociedade. As leis e documentos formais que oferecem subsídios da construção de uma sociedade mais inclusiva perpassaram pelo viés discursivo do texto. A luta por uma sociedade inclusiva que cresce desde o seio das escolas é um dos pontos fundamentais que defendemos e apresentamos no decorrer do artigo.*

PALAVRAS-CHAVE: *Intolerância. Sociedade. Inclusão.*

---

[1] Federal University of Paraíba (UFPB), João Pessoa – PB – Brazil. PhD student in the Postgraduate Program in Education (PPGE/UFPB). Member of the Nucleus of Studies, Projects and Research on Teacher Education – NEPESF. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1434-8089. E-mail: tavares.aureliana@gmail.com
[2] Federal University of Paraíba (UFPB), João Pessoa – PB – Brazil. Full Professor in the Department of Pedagogical Qualifications, at the Education Center of UFPB, and accredited by the Postgraduate Program in Education (PPGE/UFPB). Coordinator of the Center for Studies, Projects and Research on Teacher Education – NEPESF. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9457-9070. E-mail: jmcoelho@ig.com.br

RESUMEN: *Una actitud de intolerancia es algo que se agrava cada día en nuestro entorno social, incluidos los espacios escolares. A medida que la sociedad se desarrolla, surgen nuevos grupos con su forma de pensar, actuar y relacionarse y por eso la educación debe acompañar dichos cambios. Así, discutiremos la percepción del prejuicio en Brasil, deconstruyendo los estereotipos relacionados con las razas y etnias vividas en Brasil en el siglo XXI. A lo largo del discurso presentaremos algunas características de la sociedad brasileña que trasponen el tema de la intolerancia y la inclusión de todos en la sociedad. Las leyes y documentos formales que ofrecen subsidios para la construcción de una sociedad más inclusiva permearon el sesgo discursivo del texto. La lucha por una sociedad inclusiva que nazca del corazón de las escuelas es uno de los puntos fundamentales que defendemos y presentamos a lo largo del artículo.*

PALABRAS CLAVE: *Intolerancia. Sociedad. Inclusión.*

Introduction

The article discussed the perception of prejudice in Brazil, deconstructing stereotypes related to races and ethnicities since ancient times.

Although we live under the aegis of capitalism, competition, the centralizing hegemony of power, insecurity, the struggle for survival, in addition to alarming data on unemployment, lack of infrastructure in schools and lack of investments in health, we cannot cultivate hopelessness it is the hope that makes us believe in a new profile of Brazilian society, humane, fair, inclusive. So, we can say that

> The hopelessness of alienated societies is replaced by hope when they begin to see themselves with their own eyes and become capable of projecting. When they are interpreting the real desires of the people. As they integrate with their time and space and when, critically, they discover themselves unfinished (FREIRE, 2007, p. 62, our translation).

Hope strengthens the people to believe in overcoming, building the vision of a better world, but in a conscious way. Social change will occur through the struggle, exposing what we are experiencing every day.

Brazil faces different types of prejudices every day, ranging from high rates of denunciations aimed at prejudices against women (machismo, misogyny or sexism), men (misandry), ethnic groups, Jews (anti-Semitism), the physically disabled, the age group, the appearance (stereotypes), the weight (fatphobia), as among others.

Prejudice exists latently in Brazil, even though we are always fighting for a society with opportunities and equality. There are decades of struggle to respect the rights and duties of the Brazilian people.

If we analyze further, we realize that this struggle for respect, dignity, appreciation of being as a person, being the subject of one's own actions, presents the first legal formalities since 1948 with the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. This struggle gained strength in Brazil in 1988 with the Federal Constitution when, between its lines, it clarifies, reinforces and expands the fundamental rights of the Brazilian people, reaffirming that individual rights cannot be reduced, not even through Constitutional Amendments. Thus, the 1988 Constitution of the Federative Republic of Brazil presents in its preamble that it is

> [...] designed to ensure the exercise of social and individual rights, freedom, security, well-being, development, equality and justice as the supreme values of a fraternal, pluralistic and unprejudiced society, founded on social harmony and committed, in the internal and international order, with the peaceful solution of the controversies, we promulgate, under the protection of God [...] (BRASIL, 1998, our translation).

Although there are some gaps in some of its articles, becoming non-transparent and with ambiguous interpretations, other documents gradually gave support determining the rigor of the superior law.

Prejudice preceded by discrimination, intolerance and disrespect for hostile attitudes presented by some people who live in small groups that are socially, economically and culturally marginalized, receive aggressive and morally disparaging attitudes.

Analyzing in which spaces people suffer the most prejudice, it was identified that the school would be at the top with 96.5%. Such data were obtained through a survey carried out by the Foundation Institute of Economic Research (Fipe), at the request of the National Institute of Educational Studies and Research Anísio Teixeira (Inep) in 2009.

This survey was carried out in 501 public schools across the country, which interviewed more than 18,500 students, fathers and mothers, teachers and employees. The prejudices presented were of several origins, such as ethnic-racial, socioeconomic, people with disabilities, gender, sexual or territorial orientation.

Thus, we realize how our children and young people are transforming the school space in an unfavorable environment for education, socialization, respect and communion. Such results also interfere in the teaching-learning process, in the self-esteem and in the growth of violence in the school environment. Thus, Imbernon (2016, p. 24, our translation) clarifies these changes by saying that

> [...] In my opinion, education cannot be changed without seriously proposing a new concept and a new mentality to analyze it, and this is already more difficult and requires political options that are often not found. Many

> changes are needed to change education, forgive the obviousness. This means asking yourself how to establish relationships with the community and with teachers; the modification of structures, educational policies, the curriculum, the role of students, the new way of learning beyond schooling, etc. [...].

The school eventually goes through serious situations of discrimination and intolerance and to change this reality is to fight for the construction of a new society, a new look for the other to be able to love, express, relate and socialize with their own identity thus constituting inclusion Social.

The bias that permeates socio-educational inclusion actions, providing democratic and effectively constructed inclusive attitudes, is an educational process that extends the capacity of students considered different beyond the school, favoring a social, receptive and welcoming environment to diversity. In this way, the Salamanca Declaration (1994, p. 06, our translation), reaffirms such perceptions saying that

> It reaffirms the right to education for all individuals. as it is inscribed in the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, and renewing the guarantee given by the world community at the 1990 World Conference on Education for All to ensure that right, regardless of individual differences.

The right to education is for everyone regardless of individual differences, unfortunately years of struggle were needed for this right to be reaffirmed through social and behavioral actions. In the school space, it is also an environment constituted, at first, for the construction of ruptures of existing borders between human beings, building interaction, respect and acceptance of others.

The support and services of the Education area, of the continuous formation, of the use of resources and inclusive didactic materials so that the school, through its professionals, can, with competence, comply with the Laws, Resolutions, Decrees, among others that govern the theme. Thus, the constitutional commitment to refuse any kind of prejudice or discrimination of groups considered minorities, are positive attitudes that favor the construction of a new educational aspect - broad, safe, with respect and affinities, passing the theme of inclusion to a learned, social, dynamic and educational process that needs to be continuously constructed and evaluated.

Brazil, cultural wealth: causes and consequences

The judgments of values constructed over the years by the "perfect" social groups that fit their standards of the majority of society diverge from the construction of the new society

to the detriment of social class, culture, religion, ethnicity, skin color, linguistics, sexual preference, among others, gains space every day.

Brazil, a country rich in cultural diversity, demonstrates several forms of treatment that, to the detriment of its diversity, are treated in a similar way. Cultural hegemony ends up creating an intolerance for the condition of one culture when it feels superior to another, such as cases of ethnocentrism and xenophobia. Ethnocentrism describes the attitudes of certain individuals who consider their habits and behaviors to be superior to those of other cultures, reinforced by xenophobia that determines aversion to foreigners, and generally arises due to several historical, cultural and religious factors.

In Brazil, we highlight different cultures, which at times overlap with another due to prejudices, due to the ethnic miscegenation existing in the country. The fact that we have a cultural variety, we emphasize that each ghetto is constituted with its values and its identity. Thus, Silva (2000, p. 25, our translation) explains these factors by saying that

> The identities that are constituted by culture are challenged in particular ways in the contemporary world - in a world that can be called post-colonial. This is a historical period characterized, however, by the collapse of the old certainties and the production of new forms of positioning.

We are living in a time of social, political, economic and cultural transactions. Brazil with its cultural wealth could not be left out of these struggles for space and respect.

The way in which each region was colonized, industrially developed, influences the culture of each region. Such facts are one of the factors that enrich prejudices and intolerances, believing, many times, that they believe that one culture is superior to others.

Religious prejudices are also important factors that grow by imposing their laws and deculturing a nation. Strictness, order, the detriment of autonomy, doctrine are strong characteristics that influence the lives of the people who follow them. Different religions must be respected regardless of which social group they may follow - Buddhism, Christianity, Catholicism, Protestantism, Adventism, Mormonism, Orthodox Church, Jehovah's Witnesses, Spiritism or Afro-Brazilian Religions. After all, everyone's free will must be respected when we are part of a democratic society. So we say that

> The coexistence of the wide ethnic, linguistic and religious diversity on Brazilian soil raises the possibility of a plurality of alternatives. In a way, it is as if the plural found, whether in direct contact, or through other mediations, highlights and expands the plural that potentially is in each one. Thus, the principle of freedom is affirmed in the multiple possibilities of each one, in the subjective polysemy that allows choices and new encounters (BRASIL, 1997, p. 17, our translation.

We know that, behind religiosity, is intolerance when one person does not accept the other's religious diversity and ends up building value judgments on other beliefs, often without foundation, finding their religion superior to the others. Such attitudes create several conflicts, and, in some countries, they end up influencing a country's socio-political-economic organization in relation to religious wars.

Brazil, known for its cultural plurality, also suffers from racial prejudices related to ethnicity. Race and its physical aspects, for example, are reasons for disrespect and devaluation of skin color, physical traits, hair, among others. This can occur among people with different skin color aspects, being more common among whites and blacks, where the former, due to historical aspects, feel superior to the others. So,

> cultures are produced by social groups throughout their histories, in the construction of their forms of subsistence, in the organization of social and political life, in their relations with the environment and with other groups, in the production of knowledge, etc. The difference between cultures is the result of the uniqueness of these processes in each social group (BRASIL, 1997, p. 16, our translation).

Due to the colonization process, another aspect also draws our attention, influenced by great prejudice and intolerance, it is the linguistic issues of our country. Certain social and regional groups with their different accents and vocabularies.

In Brazil, we notice a lot of linguistic prejudice between the different regions of the country, and even within each of the macro regions, including between residents of the capitals and interiors, since there are different accents from different immigrants and ethnicities, in each of these spaces. Paulo Freire (2016) said that there is not a wrong culture, but a different culture.

Over the years, we have evidenced more frequently the formation of new family groups not only in Brazil, but in the world. Analyzing this thematic of sexual relations, of the most varied forms of family construction, we realize that the sexual prejudice seen by some as a taboo, is still a reason for comments, rejections, intolerance.

The sexual preferences of each individual - homophobia or heterophobia - are reasons for great social, verbal, attitudinal prejudices, reaching some cases in physical aggregations. We can describe that the first, homophobia, refers to the prejudice developed about people who have homo affective relationships, that is, between people of the same sex. According to the Child and Adolescent Statute, the criteria for starting adoption are

> 197-A. Applicants for adoption, domiciled in Brazil, will present an initial petition stating:
> I - complete qualification;
> II - family data;
> III - certified copies of the birth or marriage certificate, or declaration regarding the period of stable union;
> IV - copies of the identity card and registration in the Individual Taxpayer Register;
> V - proof of income and domicile;
> VI - certificates of physical and mental health
> VII - criminal record certificate;
> VIII - negative certificate of civil distribution (BRASIL, 1990, our translation).

In Brazil, there is still no law for the legal liberation of the adoption of children by homosexuals, but a proposal for a Family Statute law - 6,583-A/2013 by Mr. Anderson Ferreira is in the House of Representatives.

> A free, just and solidary society and the dignity of the human person, without prejudice of origin, race, sex, color, age and any other forms of discrimination, as advocated by the Federal Constitution, as well as the principles of equality and freedom, reveal a system which must be seen in the light of the transformations faced in society, in order to recognize new family models.
> The homosexual is not a second-rate citizen. Sexual orientation or condition does not diminish rights, let alone the dignity of the human person. Homo affective unions, it cannot be denied, are part of the social reality and, therefore, they should receive the same protection guaranteed to hetero affective unions (BRASIL, 2013. p. 134, our translation).

Much still needs to be done to grant the release of adoption by a group of same-sex family members. Although we see new family backgrounds on a daily basis, the legalization of adoption by this group does not yet exist in Brazil.

As there are strong prejudices regarding the relationship of people of the same sex, heterophobia expresses the prejudice of certain groups that present opposition between heterosexual relationships, that is, between people of the opposite sex.

Based on this explanation, we realized that many of these factors have influenced the school space causing major internal and external conflicts. The new look of the school is linked to several minority groups that are gaining space every day and fighting for visibility, time and voice. So,

> Historically, there has been difficulty in dealing with the issue of prejudice and racial/ethnic discrimination. The country avoided the theme for a long time, being marked by "myths" that conveyed an image of a homogeneous Brazil, without differences, or, in another hypothesis, promoter of an alleged

> "racial democracy". At school, there are often manifestations of racism, social and ethnic discrimination on the part of teachers, students, the school staff, even if involuntarily or unconsciously. These attitudes represent a violation of the rights of discriminated students, teachers and employees, bringing obstacles to the educational process, due to the suffering and embarrassment to which these people are exposed (BRASIL, 1997, p. 20, our translation).

School needs to be prepared to deal with this social situation, seeking to balance differences, allowing for a rich, creative, productive and inclusive space, for differences to become subsidies for growth, respect and possibilities to go further in personal and social relationships.

Social participation in the fight against intolerance

Analyzing the term society as a synonym for movement, changes, search and adaptation to the new, we perceive the instability or accelerated strengthening of social groups. With this, more studies are growing that help to accept this new form of affective constitution in human relationships.

The new trends in family relationships, the appreciation of social classes, globalized culture, the multifaceted nature of Brazilian religions, the races and other minority groups, face the struggles for more space in society, claiming their rights and duties as a Brazilian citizens. Such facts require an in-depth study through the development of research that adds to this "new" characteristic of society. One of the relevant points in this struggle for inclusion, so that diversity is a positive sum of growth, exchange of experiences, creativity, wisdom, appreciation and satisfaction, would be the construction of an inclusive education.

Inclusive education emerged in Brazil in the 1990s with the guiding documents of the World Special Education Conferences and in 1994 the Salamanca Declaration was proclaimed. Such documents influenced Law 9394/96 - Guidelines and Bases of Education - LDB, which states that

> Art. 5 Access to compulsory basic education is a subjective public right, and any citizen, group of citizens, community association, union organization, class entity or other legally constituted and, even, the Public Prosecutor's Office, can call on the public power to demand it (BRASIL, 1996, our translation).

Education is one of the fundamental points for social inclusion to leave the paper becoming an ideological firmament of the construction of a society for all, where we can actually exercise our role as citizens.

It is working in classrooms with the appreciation of minority groups, carrying out reflective activities, dialogued, where each student can express what they feel, what they think and, in a group, seek to work a new ideology of acceptance, respect, trust and commitment development of inclusive actions.

The inclusive actions that we highlight are born from the micro to the macro. It is accepting the people who are closest to us, valuing their potential, regardless of their way of being or believing, that prevent personal issues from becoming an ideological barrier to exclusion.

The participation of debates not only in educational centers of Basic Education, the effective participation of Higher Education, call for prominence when we aim for a more forceful participation for an acceptance of differences. The instruction, formation, academic knowledge will dazzle in a thoughtful way a rich, precise and scientific dialogue. Diversity has existed for centuries, understanding and respecting this excluded public is an opportunity to build inclusion socially.

Historicity, clarification of one's roots will help to understand how much this public that is part of minority groups, suffer and cry for acceptance, respect and a dignified space in society to show their capacity, enjoying their right as a Brazilian citizen.

Working based on this perspective, to promote debates at all levels of education, we believe that disseminating inclusive processes is a primary factor to minimize with the latent prejudice in Brazil. Education is still the only weapon we have to fight and build a society for all.

Teamwork with educators, management staff, support for inclusive laws and the effective participation of academic debates will advance, giving rise to centered studies that reveal the importance of social classes coming together in the sphere of socialization, participation and social production and reproduction.

The breaking of attitudinal barriers, contemplating the existence of other co-extensive relationships, favored the invisibility of these minority groups, accentuated the prejudices and exclusions in the social spaces, among them the school. Such attitudes materialized in multiple forms the violence reaching school dropout and other individual traumas generating the revolt of some.

The development of a work that aims at an increasing sensitivity of inclusive, problematizing education that enables the understanding of the multiple ways of living in society is what these groups want with the support of social movements.

The discussions developed in a critical way to violence, prejudice, intolerance that we see in our daily life, including those that occur in the streets, in our homes, at school, at work and in the media in a broad way can be carried out.

With the visibility of violence, prejudice, and intolerance towards minority groups, we perceive the proliferation of social movements of identity consolidation in societies that lived silencing differences, particularisms and singularities.

The participation of social movements offers support so that such groups do not lose their ideals and fight objectively for more space in society.

Final considerations

We cannot fail to realize the importance of developing essays on the theme of prejudice and intolerance that surround our daily lives. We realized during reading, that our society is subdivided into several groups that fight for visibility. Unfortunately, violence is present in various sectors of life, mainly in the school environment, which prevents these minority groups from being more active and participatory in society.

Strikingly, the violence suffered by these groups, in some cases, is generating other violent acts. Prejudice is an action that causes harm to other people by denying the autonomy of being a citizen of a country.

We perceive between the lines of the article that prejudiced action can generate psychological problems that will accompany individuals victimized by prejudice throughout their lives, leaving them repressed or aggressive. The damage caused by prejudiced attitudes watered by intolerance can cause material, physiological or psychological damage to the victim. Thus, at times it is not so difficult to witness inhuman attitudes, with acts of rejection, depreciation, indifference, discrimination, disrespect, exaggerated punishments generating serious acts of violence.

Is paramount the development of an inclusive, effective and broad discourse not only in Basic Education, so that people or minority groups who feel offended may express their desires and raise awareness to practice inclusion in the face of so much diversity.

Teamwork raising awareness will certainly provide an opportunity for the debate against small gestures of violence that are sometimes tolerated, but which may be extended and that makes it possible to reverse such attitudes of exclusion, building a discourse that would reverse alternatives based on breaking prejudice.

People who make up a society need to propose inclusive attitudes from the maturity of a posture in which differences are respected. We should not only think about preventing situations of violence or how to make the school environment more welcoming and supportive. We need to build a vision that a person regardless of belief, race, sex, socioeconomic status, culture or even age, needs to fight for their rights, given the idea that every human being is a subject of rights and deserves be respected and this vision can only be built through a true, critical, problematizing education.

REFERENCES

APPLE, M. W. **Educando à direita**: mercados, padrões, Deus e desigualdade. Trad. Dinah de Abreu Azevedo; ver. técnica de José Eutáquio Romão. São Paulo: Cortez, 2003.

BANDEIRA, L.; BATISTA, A. S. Preconceito e discriminação como expressões de violência. **Rev. Estud. Fem.**, Florianópolis, v. 10, n. 1, p. 119-141. 2002. ISSN 1806-9584. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1590/S0104-026X2002000100007

BAUMAN, Z. **Em busca da política**. Trad. Marcos Penchel. Rio de Janeiro: Jorge Zahar, 2000.

BRASIL. Constituição (1988). **Constituição da República Federativa do Brasil**. Brasília, DF: Senado, 1988.

BRASIL. Lei n. 8.069, de 13 de julho de 1990. Dispõe sobre o Estatuto da Criança e do Adolescente e dá outras providências. **Diário Oficial da União**: Seção 1, Brasília, DF, p. 13563, 16 jul. 1990.

BRASIL. Lei n. 9.394, de 20 de dezembro de 1996. Lei de Diretrizes e Bases da Educação Nacional. **Diário Oficial da União**: Seção 1, Brasília, DF, n. 248, p. 27833, 23 dez. 1996.

BRASIL. **Projeto de lei Estatuto da Família n. 6.583-A, de 2013 do Sr. Anderson Ferreira**. 2013. Available: https://www.camara.leg.br/proposicoesWeb/prop_mostrarintegra;jsessionid=47FC186CDB5C 27E515DF6EEB0712A562.proposicoesWeb2?codteor=1398893&filename=Avulso+-PL+6583/2013. Access: 16 Aug. 2020.

BRASIL. Secretaria de Educação Fundamental. **Parâmetros curriculares nacionais**: pluralidade cultural, orientação sexual. Brasília: MEC/SEF, 1997. Available: http://portal.mec.gov.br/seb/arquivos/pdf/livro101.pdf. Access: 15 Aug. 2020.

FREIRE, P. **Educação como prática da liberdade**. 30. ed. Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra, 2007.

FREIRE, P. **Pedagogia da autonomia**: saberes necessários à prática educativa. 34. ed. São Paulo: Paz e Terra, 1996. (Coleção Leitura)

FREIRE, P. **Pedagogia da esperança**: um reencontro com a pedagogia do oprimido. 3. ed. Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra, 1992.

FREIRE, P. **Pedagogia da tolerância**: organização, apresentação e notas Ana Maria Araújo Freire. 5. ed. São Paulo: Editora Paz e Terra, 2016.

Fundação Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica – FIPE. Available: http://www.fipe.org.br/. Access: 10 Aug. 2020.

RICHARDSON, R. J. (Org.). **Exclusão, inclusão e diversidade**. João Pessoa: Editora Universidade da UFPB, 2009.

RODRIGUES, I. E. **Educação inclusiva**: um desafio para o século XXI. Série Estudos Reunidos. Jundiaí, Paco Editorial. 2016. v. 16.

RODRIGUES, J. M. C. (Org.). **Formação docente**: contribuição do ideário de Paulo Freire. João Pessoa: Sal e Terra, 2006.

RODRIGUES, J. M. C.; GEGLIO, P. C. (Org.). **Contribuições das ideias de educadores brasileiros para a formação docente**. João Pessoa: Editora do CCTA, 2016.

RODRIGUES, J. M. C.; SIMÕES, M. L. (Org.). **Um passado sempre presente no fazer pedagógico**. João Pessoa: Fox Editora, 2015.

SILVA, T. T. (Org.). **Identidade e diferença**: a perspectiva dos estudos culturais. Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes, 2000.

TAVARES, A.; BARREIRO, A. M. O papel do educador na sociedade pós-moderna. **Revista on line de Política e Gestão Educacional**, Araraquara, v. 21, n. esp. 2, p. 1227-1238, nov. 2017. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.22633/rpge.v21.n.esp2.2017.10162

How to reference this article