THE EFFECT OF TEACHER TURNOVER ON STUDENTS’ LEARNING

O EFEITO DA ROTAÇÃO DO PROFESSOR NA APRENDIZAGEM DOS ALUNOS

EL EFECTO DE LA ROTACIÓN DE PROFESORES EN EL APRENDIZAJE DE LOS ESTUDIANTES

Ibragim D. IBRAGIMOV¹
Elena G. MATVIEVSKAYA²
Tatjana V. EZHOVA³
Akkenzhe K. SULEIMANOVA⁴
Lyubov V. KOCHNEVA⁵
Larisa I. TARARINA⁶
Ekaterina I. SOKOLOVA⁷

ABSTRACT: Most teachers understand that attrition has been a dilemma in the profession for years. However, the problem of teacher turnover has lately provoked more widespread public attention. Those circumstances also lead multiple teachers to quit altogether, resulting in high rates of turnover in schools. This revolving door of teachers is embarrassing for schools. Plus, teacher turnover damages student performance, dissuades educators, and is costly for districts. To enhance student achievement and decrease teacher protests, we must advance long-term solutions to support schools in retaining effective teachers. The purpose of the study is to analyze the state of staff turnover in the modern teaching staff, identify its causes and develop recommendations for decision-making aimed at reducing its undesirably high level. As a research method, we used a questionnaire survey as a method that allows us quickly, effectively to investigate the features and problems that arise in the process of psychologically economic assessment of teaching staff turnover. The article considers the problems, dynamics, and causes of staff turnover in the teaching staff. The study novelty and originality lie in the fact that the factors affecting the personnel turnover in the teaching staff are considered (psychological, professional-pedagogical and economic factors are identified). It is shown that job satisfaction is the main psychological factor affecting the turnover of teaching staff.

¹ Pyatigorsk State University, Pyatigorsk – Russia. PhD in Education, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Oriental Languages and Cultures. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0235-0285. E-mail: ibragimid@mail.ru
² Orenburg State Pedagogical University, Orenburg – Russia. Doctor of Education, Professor of the Department of Preschool, Correctional, Additional Education and Problems of Education. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4182-1297. E-mail: ospu@ospu.ru
³ Orenburg State Pedagogical University, Orenburg – Russia. Doctor of Education, Professor, Dean of the Faculty of Foreign Languages. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7985-3417. E-mail: ortalmin@mail.ru
⁴ Private Comprehensive School with Philosophical Bias Headmaster, Uralsk – Republic of Kazakhstan. Teacher. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2039-7784. E-mail: suleimanova1810@mail.ru
⁵ Moscow Aviation Institute (National Research University), Moscow – Russia. PhD in Psychology, Associate Professor of the Department of Sociology, Psychology and Social Management. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7439-7798. E-mail: shafrans@mail.ru
⁶ Russian State Social University, Moscow – Russia. PhD in Education, Associate Professor of the Department of Linguistics and Translation. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0280-135X. E-mail: lt31@mail.ru
⁷ Plekhanov Russian University of Economics, Moscow – Russia. PhD in Philology, Associate Professor of the Department of Foreign Languages. ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9102-8663. E-mail: sokolova.ei@rea.ru

RESUMO: A maioria dos professores entende que o atrito tem sido um dilema na profissão há anos. No entanto, o problema da rotatividade de professores tem despertado recentemente a atenção do público. Essas circunstâncias também levam vários professores a desistir completamente, resultando em altas taxas de rotatividade nas escolas. Essa porta giratória de professores é constrangedora para as escolas. Além disso, a rotatividade de professores prejudica o desempenho dos alunos, dissuade os educadores e custa caro para os distritos. Para melhorar o desempenho dos alunos e diminuir os protestos dos professores, devemos apresentar soluções de longo prazo para apoiar as escolas na retenção de professores eficazes.

O objetivo do estudo é analisar o estado da rotatividade do pessoal docente moderno, identificar as suas causas e desenvolver recomendações para a tomada de decisões que visem a redução do seu nível indesejado. Como método de pesquisa, utilizamos o inquérito por questionário como método que nos permite investigar de forma rápida e eficaz as características e problemas que surgem no processo de avaliação psicológicamente econômica da rotatividade do pessoal docente. O artigo considera os problemas, a dinâmica e as causas da rotatividade do corpo docente. A novidade e originalidade do estudo reside no fato de serem considerados os fatores que influenciam a rotatividade do pessoal docente (são identificados os fatores psicológicos, profissional-pedagógicos e econômicos). Mostra-se que a satisfação no trabalho é o principal fator psicológico que afeta a rotatividade do corpo docente.


RESUMEN: La mayoría de los profesores comprenden que la deserción ha sido un dilema en la profesión durante años. Sin embargo, el problema de la rotación de profesores ha suscitado últimamente una atención pública más generalizada. Esas circunstancias también implican un alto porcentaje de rotación en las escuelas. Esta puerta giratoria de maestros es vergonzosa para las escuelas. Además, la rotación de maestros dañan el desempeño de los estudiantes, disuade a los educadores y es costosa para los distritos. Para mejorar el rendimiento de los estudiantes y disminuir las protestas de los maestros, debemos promover soluciones a largo plazo para ayudar a las escuelas a retener maestros eficaces. El objetivo del estudio es analizar el estado de la rotación de personal en el profesorado moderno, identificar sus causas y desarrollar recomendaciones para la toma de decisiones encaminadas a reducir su indeseablemente alto nivel. Como método de investigación, utilizamos una encuesta por cuestionario como método que nos permite investigar de forma rápida y eficaz las características y problemas que surgen en el proceso de evaluación psicológicamente económica de la rotación del profesorado. El artículo considera los problemas, la dinámica y las causas de la rotación de personal en el profesorado. La novedad y originalidad del estudio radica en que se consideran los factores que inciden en la rotación de personal en el profesorado (se identifican factores psicológicos, profesional-pedagógicos y económicos). Se demuestra que la satisfacción laboral es el principal factor psicológico que incide en la rotación del profesorado.

Introduction

In recent years, there has been some change in the growth of production in our country. Several serious social problems that significantly complicate the further development of enterprises accompanies this economic trend. The most significant ones include the shortage of personnel in working professions and the high turnover of personnel in industry and in the teaching sphere. For our country, the current situation of staff turnover is new, due to the transition to market relations, since the years of the centralized economy were characterized by a low labor mobility (BORISOVA, 2003; GLAGOLEVA, 2002; MISHIN, 2002; ZHANG et al., 2019).

Today, very little attention is paid to this problem, despite its complexity and lack of development. For a long time, the Soviet economy was dominated by a technocratic approach to management at the enterprise level, when technology, production budgets, and administrative orders were put at the forefront, and the role of employees was given a second plan. The movement of personnel outside of specially organized flows was considered in the Soviet economy as a negative phenomenon that disrupted the orderly course of planned production (ZHELTUKHINA et al., 2020). The entire system of material and moral incentives, both in the workplace and in educational organizations, has traditionally been focused on consolidating the professional and qualified position of the employee in their field. A significant part of the social benefits was distributed free of charge or at a reduced price directly from the organization's funds, which partially compensated for low wages and provided employees with some material and cultural benefits (MILYAEVA, 2005; TORSHINA, 2000; CHERDYMOVA, 2015; FATKHUTDINOV, 1999).

If in Soviet times, the turnover of personnel in organizations of different industries was quite low, within the normal range, now it usually exceeds ten percent, and even can go off the scale for fifty percent. It is clear that such a high turnover of personnel destabilizes organizations, negatively affects the social situation at enterprises and in teams and leads to a decrease in the quality of work.

Literature Review

Russian researchers most intensively studied the problems of staff turnover in the late sixties and early eighties of the twentieth century, which was associated with an increased interest in the role of the human factor in organizations. The scientific literature of those years
reflected the results of numerous theoretical and empirical studies (KHAKHULINA, 1974; VESNIN, 1998; VOLGIN, 1977; ZASLAVSKY, 1992; MOZYREVA, 1986).

The staff is not something frozen and stable, it is in constant motion due to the hiring of some and the dismissal of other employees. The process of updating the team because of the departure of some of its members and the arrival of new ones is called the change or turnover of personnel. Turnover is associated not only with social and domestic disorder, but also with the difficulties of self-realization or self-affirmation (VLADIMIROVA, 2002; VASINA, 2010).

The beginning of labor activity is the period when a person chooses a profession and begins to work independently. This period is one of the most difficult and responsible because the properly chosen profession influences the value of the worker, his/her productivity, and, on the other hand, social well-being of a person. This means that the problem of turnover is particularly acute for young employees (MAGURA, 2003; POLOVINKO, 2002).

In its consequences, the process of personnel movement is not unambiguous. An organization that loses personnel almost always regards turnover as an extremely negative phenomenon, except for voluntary dismissals, which, in fact, are veiled dismissals at the request of the administration. Of course, the increased turnover of personnel, whatever the reason for it, leads to certain negative consequences: generates additional costs associated with the recruitment and temporary replacement of personnel and their training, the growth of product defects, under-production of products; reduces the staffing of workplaces by performers; distracts highly qualified specialists who are forced to help newcomers to adapt to new conditions; worsens the moral and psychological climate of the organization; there is a drop in discipline; labor productivity decreases for those who are going to leave, which as a result causes economic losses etc. (ARMSTRONG, 2004; BAYANOVA et al., 2019; CHERDYMOVA, 2017; DOLZHENKOVA, 2007; GAVRILLOVA, 2011).

Nevertheless, we must also recognize the positive consequences of this phenomenon: it makes it easier to get rid of outsiders, it makes it possible to attract people with new views and ideas, it makes it possible to rejuvenate the composition of employees, stimulate changes, increase internal activity and flexibility of employees etc. Along with actual, real turnover, there is potential turnover. It often happens that the potential turnover is implemented in intra-organizational transitions. This is one of the reasons that the size of the potential turnover is higher than the actual one. Many researchers consider it normal to exceed the size of the potential turnover over the actual one, because the desire of employees to change their place of work always encounters all sorts of restrictions and obstacles. Moreover, they are, in one way
or another, considered when making the final decision (BONDAREVSKAYA, 1995; MUKHAMETZIANOVA, 2005; SANKO, 2000).

Job satisfaction is the most important indicator of employee turnover. This is the first stage of the mechanism of staff turnover formation, which is characterized by the fact that the employee has a feeling of dissatisfaction with work in his/her workplace; he/she is not satisfied with various aspects of professional activity (SUBETTO, 2000; KHAMITOV, 2002; ALIEVA, 2013). Dissatisfaction with work can create a desire to change jobs, which means that such an employee is in a state of potential turnover. The pleasure derived from work, in which personal abilities are realized and developed, is very important for a person; it determines his/her entire life. Working conditions - the impact of a combination of various professional factors that affect the employee's physical and mental state perceived by the employee during the work process.

The Study Objectives and Structure

Employees of the educational organization are granted all legal rights: medical insurance, pension provision, paid annual leave, and are given three days for the funeral of close relatives and marriage etc. There are also relaxation rooms where you can listen to music during your lunch break or just relax in a cozy atmosphere.

To protect the health of teaching staff, there are whole complexes of health-improving measures. Vouchers are provided to employees in the sanatorium-dispensaries of the organization. Medical examinations are carried out, as well as all those who get a job in a pedagogical organization are examined without fail.

However, staff turnover in teaching teams is quite high, so identifying its causes is of great practical importance. In the present study, a quantitative strategy was used to study the turnover of teaching staff. In this teaching staff, most employees are women (87%); men make up 13%, which is explained by the specifics of the pedagogical organization. Attention is drawn to the high proportion of young people in the company - more than 47% and a low proportion of employees of retirement age.

To conduct a psychological and economic assessment of teaching staff turnover, we used the following questions.

What category of teaching staff do you belong to?

How long have you been working in this teaching team (if you are accepted into this organization for the second time, then specify the work experience since the last work in the teaching organization and what kind of work it was)?
Are you generally satisfied with your current job?
To what extent are you satisfied with the following aspects of your work: material support, equipment etc.?
Is there an opportunity to improve your professional skills?
Is professional growth possible?
What is your relationship with your direct supervisor (director, head teacher)?
What is your relationship with your work colleagues?
Are you satisfied with the activities of the administration of the pedagogical organization to improve the organization of labor and production?
Would you like to change your job?
If you answered yes to the previous question, do you intend to remain in the teaching field?
What was the amount of your earnings for the last month after taxes, i.e., net? Specify in rubles.
Based on your specialty, qualification, working conditions, and work experience, what kind of earnings do you consider normal and decent? Specify in rubles.
Do you know what the main tasks your organization needs to solve in the near future in order to ensure successful results?
Are you ready to take the initiative to improve the situation in your teaching organization?
Would you advise your acquaintances, friends and relatives to get a job in your teaching organization?

Results

Psychological and Economic Assessment of Teaching Staff Turnover

This study examined the overall satisfaction of teaching staff with their current place of work and obtained the following results. The respondents are mostly satisfied with their work. One should consider the state of private satisfaction: satisfaction with the content of labor, satisfaction with the condition of equipment, the uniformity of work provision, wages, working conditions, and others. Employees are mostly satisfied with the state of the equipment in the teaching organization (88%). This is because the school under study is relatively new and it is equipped with the most modern equipment of good quality.
However, almost 12% of teachers are not satisfied with the uniformity of providing professional work. This is due to the specifics of pedagogical activity, its high intensity and psychologically difficult working conditions (work in the field of man-man, work with adolescents and the younger generation). This characteristic has a significant impact on the physical and psychological well-being and emotional mood of the teaching staff (ability to work, fatigue) requires high tolerance, professional durability and endurance. According to the survey data, a third of employees (32%) receive a salary of slightly more than the subsistence minimum, a little more than a third (38%) - in the amount of 1 to 1.5 subsistence minimums, every fifth (20%) - from 1.5 to 2 subsistence minimums, and every tenth (10%) - more than two subsistence minimums. Various kinds of part-time work, additional classes, bonuses and allowances help.

If employees do not have the opportunity to embody themselves in their work, they will not be able to improve their professional skills, will not bring elements of creativity and innovation, and this is stagnation and professional degradation. Moreover, it is unlikely that such an employee will be a valuable specialist in a pedagogical organization. To what extent are the respondents satisfied with the possibility of applying their knowledge, experience, and creative abilities? Less than half of the respondents are satisfied with the possibilities of using their creative abilities in work (47%), which is explained by the specifics of the production process, since there is currently a high workload of paperwork. Teaching staff must write many reports, fill out various forms.

Professional promotion and professional development play an important role for the stability of the teaching staff. In the studied pedagogical organization, most of the teaching staff are satisfied with the opportunities for professional development and professional growth (88%). After all, the pedagogical leadership of the organization cannot solve the problem of uniformity of employment (hours), which is reflected in the low level of satisfaction with the administration of the educational organization to improve the organization of labor for this production.

The psychological atmosphere in the team influences job satisfaction: the relationship of teaching staff with the direct supervisor and the relationship of employees with each other. At the same time, there is a high satisfaction of respondents with the relations in the team (77%). It should be noted that in the studied team, teaching staff are well aware of the tasks facing the team, they are informed about what the immediate future of the enterprise is (97%).

However, most of the employees are indifferent to the performance of these tasks. Only a third of the respondents says that it matters to them whether the main tasks facing the teaching
organization will be solved in order to ensure successful results of the work. Only those teachers who are interested in solving the problems facing the pedagogical organization are ready to help their organization free of charge, to take the initiative. The rest are ready to help their company only for money. Data from a survey of teaching staff showed a high level of potential staff turnover. Every fourth employee (25%) would like to change their workplace. Almost a third (29%) found it difficult to say anything definite about this; however, it is obvious that they can hardly be attributed to a stable staff. Less than half of employees (46%) do not want to change their place of work.

At the same time, it should be noted that almost one in four (24%) of those who want to change their place of work would like to do it inside the organization. This makes it possible to retain some of the staff who want to change their place of work if these teaching staff are provided with a suitable workplace within the organization.

It is interesting to note that the proportion of respondents who would not recommend their teaching organization for employment to acquaintances, friends and relatives is comparable to the proportion of those who would like to change their workplace.

Thus, the level of potential staff turnover in a pedagogical organization is quite high and amounts to almost twenty-five percent of all the teaching staff of the organization under study.

Discussion

The study of staff turnover is one of the urgent problems that modern researchers pay undeservedly little attention to. The state of the economy is currently characterized by a certain stabilization and recovery of production. In these conditions, the stability of the staff is one of the keys to the success of professional activity.

Turnover is the voluntary official departure of an employee from a given team to another based on a self-made decision. If there is a high turnover of personnel, it can signal a lack of satisfaction with their work among employees or be a threat to the stability and integrity of the organization. Now, staff turnover can be called one of the many problems that modern enterprises and organizations can face.

In any case, the state of dissatisfaction with work negatively affects the work behavior of teaching staff. Although there is an exception to the rule here, if dissatisfaction with work plays the role of creative dissatisfaction, that is, a person who is not satisfied with something wants to improve the situation. The content of work functions and working conditions play a huge role in satisfaction.
Two groups of factors cause the change of place of work: professional and personal. The first is associated either with changes in production volumes and an increase in labor productivity, or with the process of improving production and further division of labor under the influence of technological progress.

The second group of factors is related to the degree of compliance of workplace with the interests of employees. After all, not only a pedagogical organization or production makes its demands on the employee, but the employee also makes its demands on them. At the same time, it should be noted that the change of workplace at the initiative of employees largely prevails over the change of place at the initiative of the administration.

Conclusions

The actual turnover rate is quite high, so almost every fourth employee leaves teaching organizations. The structure of the staff leaving allows us to conclude that the bulk of the current staff consists of employees who have worked in the pedagogical organization for less than three years.

The study highlights the psychological, professional-pedagogical and economic factors that affect the turnover of teaching staff. Study of the mechanism of potential turnover in teaching staff began with identifying the relationship of workers to various facets of professional life, it was necessary to identify problem areas, to understand how a negative attitude to the workplace forms and the desire to change it comes.

These data suggest that the main economic factors affecting the turnover of teaching staff are low wages, shortcomings in the uniformity of job provision. The employees also gave a low rating to the activities of the administration of the pedagogical institution to improve the organization of labor and production. The potential turnover was almost twenty-five percent of the total number of employees. This means that every fourth employee of a teaching organization would like to change his or her place of work. Almost a quarter of them would like to change workplace within a teaching organization. This allows the company's management to take certain measures to transfer these employees within the organization by finding suitable hours for them.

As for the professional-pedagogical and psychological factors that affect the turnover of teaching staff, it is necessary to highlight job satisfaction, peculiarities of adaptation in the team, the attitude of teachers to extracurricular assignments. Thus, job satisfaction is the main indicator of employee turnover. Reducing the level of dissatisfaction with certain elements of
the professional situation allows you to reduce the undesirably high turnover of teaching staff. It should be noted that every fifth employee does not consider their teaching organization an attractive place to work and would not recommend it for employment to their friends, relatives or acquaintances. Moreover, the vast majority of respondents found it difficult to say anything at all about this, which can hardly be regarded as a positive attitude to their organization. Thus, we can say that, judging by the high turnover of personnel, the company's management does not take specific measures to stabilize the team and adapt the newly arriving teaching staff. It is enough to note that most of the employees who left this organization for reasons of staff turnover did not work for it for even three years. Moreover, we can assume that the turnover rate could be higher (if you consider that the proportion of those who found it difficult to answer the question about the desire to change jobs is a third of the respondents), but in the city to find a new suitable job is not so easy. Therefore, people are forced to remain working in this pedagogical organization, but almost two-thirds of them are practically not interested in the tasks facing the pedagogical organization and they would not selflessly take the initiative if necessary.

REFERENCES


How to reference this article


Submitted: 07/04/2021
Required revisions: 12/08/2021
Approved: 26/11/2021
Published: 30/12/2021

Processing and publication by the Editora Ibero-Americana de Educação.
Correction, formatting, standardization and translation.