

IMPROVEMENT OF THE QUALITY OF EDUCATION, APPROACHES, AND METHODS FOR ASSESSING THE QUALITY OF EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

MELHORIA DA QUALIDADE DA EDUCAÇÃO, ABORDAGENS E MÉTODOS PARA AVALIAÇÃO DA QUALIDADE DOS SERVIÇOS EDUCACIONAIS

MEJORA DE LA CALIDAD DE LA EDUCACIÓN, ENFOQUES Y MÉTODOS DE EVALUACIÓN DE LA CALIDAD DE LOS SERVICIOS EDUCATIVOS

Mariya I. TARASOVA¹
Evgeniya M. BRONNIKOVA²
Olga S. KULYAMINA³
Lidia A. VASILEVA⁴
Anastasia S. PONYASHOVA⁵

ABSTRACT: The article reveals the theoretical aspect of the formation of prerequisites for improving the quality of education, approaches, methods, and criteria for assessing the quality of educational services. In preparing the article were used Russian and foreign scientific publications, international ratings of educational organizations. The analysis of the assessment of the quality of educational services in foreign countries allowed systematically considering the process of reforming the educational sphere, considering the needs of society and the requirements of state standards, identify urgent methodological problems and formulate proposals that determine the practical significance of the study. The article highlights the patterns of the potential development of students, touches on the issues of assessing the quality of educational services through state accreditation, audit, statistical reporting, and standardization of the quality of educational services. The article reveals methods to evaluate the quality of educational services used in Russia and abroad.

KEYWORDS: Educational services. Education. Educational organizations. Students.

¹ Russian State Social University, Moscow – Russia. Senior Researcher. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2179-9336>. E-mail: education.com.ru@gmail.com

² Russian State Social University, Moscow – Russia. Senior Researcher. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5409-9726>. E-mail: bronnikova.em@gmail.com

³ Russian State Social University, Moscow – Russia. Head of Interdisciplinary Research Laboratory. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7715-5551>. E-mail: kuljamina.os@gmail.com

⁴ Russian State Social University, Moscow – Russia. Researcher. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5311-7099>. E-mail: lidia2@gmail.com

⁵ Russian State Social University, Moscow – Russia. Director of the Institute. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0732-2702>. E-mail: ponjashova.as@gmail.com

RESUMO: O artigo revela o aspecto teórico da formação de pré-requisitos para a melhoria da qualidade da educação, abordagens, métodos e critérios de avaliação da qualidade dos serviços educacionais. Na preparação do artigo foram utilizadas publicações científicas russas e estrangeiras, classificações internacionais de organizações educacionais. A análise da avaliação da qualidade dos serviços educacionais no exterior permitiu considerar sistematicamente o processo de reforma da esfera educacional, levando em consideração as necessidades da sociedade e as exigências das normas estaduais, identificando problemas metodológicos urgentes e formulando propostas que determinem o significado prático do estudo. O artigo destaca os padrões do desenvolvimento potencial dos alunos, aborda as questões de avaliação da qualidade dos serviços educacionais por meio do credenciamento estadual, auditoria, relatórios estatísticos e padronização da qualidade dos serviços educacionais. O artigo revela métodos para avaliar a qualidade dos serviços educacionais usados na Rússia e no exterior.

PALAVRAS-CHAVE: Serviços educacionais. Educação. Organizações educacionais. Estudantes.

RESUMEN: El artículo revela el aspecto teórico de la formación de requisitos previos para mejorar la calidad de la educación, enfoques, métodos y criterios para evaluar la calidad de los servicios educativos. En la preparación del artículo se utilizaron publicaciones científicas rusas y extranjeras, clasificaciones internacionales de organizaciones educativas. El análisis de la evaluación de la calidad de los servicios educativos en países extranjeros permitió considerar sistemáticamente el proceso de reforma del ámbito educativo, tomando en cuenta las necesidades de la sociedad y los requerimientos de los estándares estatales, identificando problemas metodológicos urgentes y formulando propuestas que determinen la importancia práctica del estudio. El artículo destaca los patrones de desarrollo potencial de los estudiantes, aborda los temas de evaluación de la calidad de los servicios educativos a través de la acreditación estatal, auditoría, informes estadísticos y estandarización de la calidad de los servicios educativos. El artículo revela métodos para evaluar la calidad de los servicios educativos utilizados en Rusia y en el extranjero.

PALABRAS CLAVE: Servicios educativos. Educación. Organizaciones educativas. Estudiantes.

Introduction

The organization of the education system plays an important role in the development of society, both in the cultural and economic environment, and the assessment of the quality of educational services influences the implementation of progressive reforms in this area. The education system is based on providing citizens with high-quality educational services, formed considering the needs and capabilities of the population. The development of the state and society determines the support of the education system at the proper level and the constant improvement of the quality of educational services.

Currently, Russia is actively reforming the education system, the main goal of which is to improve its quality, considering the needs of society and the requirements of international standards. The process of reforming the educational sphere necessitates the search for new approaches to assessing the quality of educational services. Depending on social needs and methods for assessing the quality of educational services are being developed abroad, which contribute to effective changes in the educational level of the population. Thus, indicators were identified that can be used to assess the quality of educational services in Russia and to further develop a unified methodology for assessing the quality of educational services.

Materials and Methods

To conduct a detailed analysis of foreign experience in assessing the quality of educational services, the study used the methods of idealization, induction, deduction, comparative and comparative analysis. The combination of general scientific methods has made it possible to identify mechanisms for assessing the quality of educational services, which may be reflected in the Russian education system.

The article is an analysis of the scientific works of Russian and foreign authors studying the issues of assessing the quality of educational services. The factors of the formation of educational services and their influence on the consumer are highlighted in the work of C. A. Gronroos, (1991) some methods for assessing the quality of educational services are formed in the studies of R.A. Likert (1932). I. A. Waldman in his works covered the features of the organization of monitoring of educational achievements in foreign countries, considered the assessment of progress in education (WALDMAN, 2014; RUPOVA, 2020). Features of the organization of monitoring of educational processes in some countries affect their economic development (JAMES, 2015; DRONDIN, 2020).

For many years, scientists have studied educational processes, identified patterns, analyzed and evaluated educational services. At the World Conference on Higher Education, held in France in 1998, it was noted for the first time that improving the quality of education is a key task of educational organizations.

The issues of the impact of the quality of education on science-intensive activity were considered by J. Domenech, R. Escamilla, N. Roig-Tierno, according to the results of their research, it was noted that it contributes to the economic development of the country (DOMENECH *et al.*, 2016). Also, in foreign studies by several scientists, the dependence of the economic well-being of the state on the effectiveness of the educational system was

emphasized (SCHULTZ, 1961; LUCAS, 1988). Assessment of the quality of education was considered at various levels. Scientific developments V. Charles, G. Diaz, S. Polat, A. A. Bakar, M.M. Osman, S. Bachok, M. Ibrahim showed that it is advisable to assess the quality of educational services based on an analysis of the number of faculty, students, and graduates (CHARLES; DIAZ, 2017; POLAT, 2017; BAKAR *et al.*, 2016; KOVTUNETS; LONDAR, 2019).

The main goal of the study is to develop recommendations for improving the assessment of the quality of educational services based on a comprehensive analysis of its methods, approaches, and criteria, considering the methods and approaches used in foreign countries.

Results

In our opinion, it is important to distinguish between the concepts of "quality of education" and "quality of educational services". Since, without a clear understanding of the difference in their definitions, the effectiveness of the use of specific methods and approaches in carrying out assessment activities can be questionable. So, the quality of educational services is understood as the quality of educational activities, which is aimed at meeting the needs in the development of the educational level of the student. Also, taking into account the material and technical, educational, methodological, and information technology security, and the quality of education is the totality of the qualities of the educational service and the student (intellectual potential, personal characteristics, and the desire for cognitive activity).

Thus, the understanding of the quality of educational services consists of several components that have qualitative characteristics: educational programs, faculty, educational technologies, educational and methodological and material and technical support, management of educational processes, etc.

We suppose that a fairly effective and conceptual basis of methods for assessing the quality of educational services is formed by a three-dimensional Likert scale, based on identifying the integral level of quality of the education process by identifying stages for each analyzed quality parameter (LIKERT, 1932). With such an assessment, the following methods are used: differential - implies a comparison of quality indicators and the basic criterion of service, and also allows you to highlight the properties of service for making further management decisions, complex - consists in the use of an integral (generalized) quality indicator, and mixed, which is carried out in stages, where first, single quality indicators are grouped, for which a complex indicator is established, and then a differential method is applied.

So, depending on the purpose of quality assessment, indicators are determined by their characteristic features.

The next method for assessing the quality of educational services is their compliance with state standards. Federal state educational standards establish the level and amount of content needs for educational services that educational organizations must provide. It should be borne in mind that the alleged needs tend to change depending on the material and social situation.

Evaluation of the quality of educational services abroad, as a rule, is carried out through a complex of tests carried out by specialists to achieve the final result - an expert assessment. International ratings of educational organizations are based on an assessment of the quality of educational services. For example, in the QS rating (Quacquarelli Symonds) such indicators as the status of the employer and the scientific potential of the educational organization are important, in the Shanghai Ranking - the criterion of the academic level, and in THE (Times Higher Education) - the educational environment, which includes an assessment of the performance educational organization.

In Brazil, testing of graduates (National assessment of courses) makes it possible to assess the level of knowledge of each student, due to which the revealed average assessment of the quality of educational services of an educational organization indicates the graduation of mid-level specialists (SEREGINA, 2012). However, by providing average quality services, an organization can often educate consumers with different initial intellectual capacities. Thus, by graduating specialists of the same level, an educational organization makes a significant contribution to the development of society, but at the same time does not find an objective assessment of the educational services provided.

In many foreign countries, the main method for assessing the quality of educational services is an audit, which includes both an external audit conducted by a third-party organization and an internal one carried out at the expense of our resources. In several countries, such as England, China, and the Republic of Ecuador (ESCOBAR-JIMENEZ *et al.*, 2019), audit acts as the main format for verifying the provision of educational services, and in Finland and the United States, audits are carried out as an additional format (KRECHETNIKOV; SILISCHEVA, 2015; WALDMAN, 2014). In general, the audit allows you to determine the main characteristics of the educational organization and trends towards the development and maintenance of the required level of education. However, in countries with a large number of educational institutions, accreditation is the most effective method for assessing educational services. For example, in the Czech Republic, thanks to an external audit of the quality of

educational services with the involvement of experts, a comprehensive methodology for assessing the quality of educational services was developed (NENADAL, 2015). It should also be noted that in most foreign countries, as a rule, the quality of education is assessed, while the issue of the quality of educational services is covered rather poorly.

Thus, the considered methods of assessing the quality of educational services have their specificity, due to the characteristics of the educational system and ways of meeting the intellectual needs of society.

An independent assessment of the quality of education is one of the ways of effective interaction between the state and society in this area. It is possible to assess both the level of training of students in the process of implementing educational services and the quality of the conditions for the implementation of educational activities.

Participation in various ratings has become an integral feature of the modern education system. A place in the ranking can have an impact on the development of an educational organization, as well as the level of government funding and the prestige of an educational institution, depends on it.

The distribution of criteria for assessing the quality of educational services in different countries has similar principles, but the study revealed some differences. Based on the results of the analysis of the list of criteria for assessing the quality of education in Europe, the USA, and Russia (SERGEEVA, 2019), the following main criteria for assessing the quality of educational services can be distinguished:

- personal development (formation of practical skills in professional activity);
- content and quality of educational programs;
- teaching staff (quantitative and qualitative composition);
- providing the educational process with organizational resources (material support, classrooms, and equipment, library stock, infrastructure of new technologies, access to the Internet).

A comparative analysis of the criteria for assessing the quality of educational services in Europe, the USA, and Russia showed that there are some discrepancies in the organization of work with students. So, for example, in Russia, there is a developed system of distribution of graduates in the labor market depending on the efficiency of receiving educational services, while in the USA and Europe the priority direction in the organization of educational services is the qualitative development of the university environment.

The next important criterion for assessing the quality of educational services is the approach to education. In Russia, as a rule, the development of personal growth depends on the

education received. In Europe, the assessment of the quality of educational services is carried out through practical orientation and degree of education. In the United States, the approach to education is associated with a system for evaluating the educational service received and is focused on obtaining a license for students.

The classification of educational organizations allows consumers of educational services to receive basic information about their types and quality of provision, the degree of use of teaching methods and technologies, international programs, material, technical and informational security, as well as the development and demand for graduates in the labor market. Accordingly, to the contribution to the development of society, in Europe and the United States, when assessing the quality of educational services, international cooperation with the corporate sector is taken into account. In the educational environment of the Russian Federation, interaction with foreign organizations is not designed to increase integration agreements and, therefore, is not assessed by a centralized check.

The legislation of the Russian Federation stipulates that education as a whole is a process that includes both upbringing and training, aimed at meeting the interests of a person, family, society, and the state to obtain a specific amount of knowledge, skills, skills, as well as human value attitudes (intellectual, spiritual and moral, creative, physical development, professional development) and meeting educational needs.

Thus, the legislation predetermines that when assessing the quality of educational services, all categories of consumers, whose interests are affected in the course of educational activities, should be taken into account.

Based on the requirements of Federal State Educational Standards, the quality of educational services is assessed by the Federal Service for Supervision in Education and Science of the Russian Federation. It carries out state accreditation of educational organizations, while the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Russian Federation accumulates information on educational organizations, for their part, in the context of several reports covering statistical information on scientometric indicators of educational organizations. If according to the results of the assessment, educational organizations have not reached certain thresholds, then measures are taken to reduce financial support or its deprivation, and non-compliance with state accreditation may lead to the revocation of the license to provide educational services. Note that state accreditation is carried out considering the subjectivity of an expert and is carried out by monitoring the quality of the educational process, which includes an assessment of the compliance of programs with minimum quality standards, which is a static approach, within which the dynamics are emitted by planned indicators. On the other hand, the

consumer of educational services is society represented by a citizen who is directly receiving education, and an employer who is a consumer of the knowledge, skills, and abilities of an employee. Such an assessment does not allow to fully objectively assess the quality of educational services.

In developed countries, the presence of a quality management system is recognized as a significant competitive advantage for any organization. Therefore, for successful promotion in the market of educational services in modern conditions, it becomes obvious to introduce an internal audit system into the activities of an educational organization, which will allow it to take the necessary measures promptly in the field of improving its activities for the long term by satisfying consumer requests and fulfilling the requirements of the legislation.

Assessment of the quality of the provision of educational services involves the analysis of the following indicators (ASANOVA; SYRTSEV, 2019):

- the final results of program implementation (overall effectiveness and interim assessment);
- personal achievements of students;
- compliance with the requirements of state standards;
- study of the organization of work of the support personnel and the teaching staff;
- assessment of the degree of customer satisfaction.

Internal audit both in Russia and abroad makes it possible to determine the basic level of the intellectual development of the consumer, the degree of consumer perception of the teaching staff, and the priority idea of the components of educational services. It should be noted that the satisfaction of consumers of educational services also ensures the stability of recruitment and the competitiveness of an educational organization in a strategic perspective, which determines the feasibility of surveying applicants, students, and graduates as part of an internal audit.

The survey methodology includes the identification and analysis of satisfaction with the quality of the provision of educational services. Correlation analysis of satisfaction allows you to determine the factors and establish between them the degree, presence, or absence of a relationship.

The work of auditors should be based on the principles: consistency, legality, objectivity, and effectiveness. It is advisable to conduct an internal audit annually according to previously developed programs on topics of interest to the organization, for example, professional educational programs; informational and logistical support of the educational

process. However, for each educational organization, the indicators will have their characteristics.

Thus, the analysis of the assessment of the quality of educational services at all stages of training, as well as the quantitative and qualitative characteristics of the potential consumer of services, aspects, and effectiveness of the learning process, is carried out within the framework of the main approaches on the part of the state and the educational organization.

Discussion

The effectiveness of managerial decision-making in educational organizations depends on the results of assessing the quality of educational services (ASANOVA SYRTSEV, 2019). Monitoring the results of such an assessment emphasizes the feasibility of conducting an internal audit regularly, which makes it possible to determine the degree of compliance of educational services with the requirements of all-Russian educational standards.

It should be noted that improving the mechanism for assessing the quality of educational services, taking into account the use of advanced experience of foreign countries, is an important factor in the development of society in the Russian Federation. To achieve positive dynamics of indicators characterizing the provision of educational services, it is necessary to assess the level of their quality, which is the basis for the implementation of an effective management algorithm in the quality management system of educational services.

Taking into account the dynamics of the development of the Russian education system, it seems appropriate to determine the prerequisites for the development of an up-to-date methodology for assessing the quality of educational services. At the same time, it is necessary to comply with the requirements for the quality of the provision of educational services, stipulated by legislative provisions in terms of state control of the system of organizing educational activities. In addition, it is necessary to take into account the individual characteristics of consumers, in connection with which it is necessary to determine the criteria for the requirements of students and make their assessment (CHARLES *et al.*, 2017; POLAT, 2017; BAKAR *et al.*, 2016).

The assessment of the quality of educational services must also be carried out according to the following types of classification: the proportion of students by types of educational programs, the level of literacy of the direct consumers of educational services, the level of workload on the teaching staff, the qualifications of the teaching staff (BAKAR *et al.*, 2016).

In addition, it is advisable to carry out measures to improve the efficiency of educational services depending on the territorial needs of specific specialists, since the economic well-being of the region potentially depends on the level of their qualifications (JAMES, 2015).

Thus, for each criterion, it is advisable to use different types of methods, defining the target settings of the educational organization. When assessing the quality of educational services, it is necessary to properly plan the assessment, prioritize and outline the prospects in the long term.

Conclusion

In the course of the study, an analysis of Russian and foreign experience in assessing the quality of educational services was carried out. In foreign countries, priority is given to audits, including the involvement of experts. There is a need to improve the Russian system for assessing the quality of educational services, in which it is advisable to use successful practices, taking into account the Russian mentality.

Thus, the need to create a unified methodology for assessing the quality of educational services has been identified, which will determine the development of the student's personality, his competence, and the possibility of career growth, as well as the cultural component for society and the prospects for providing the state with qualified personnel.

The comparative analysis of the assessment of the quality of education in Russia and abroad made it possible to identify the main criteria for assessing the quality of educational services, which are necessary for an effective analysis of indicators. After analyzing the different points of view of scientists, the following indicators can be distinguished that can be used to assess the quality of educational services:

- the ratio of the number of students and graduates;
- qualification of the teaching staff;
- provision of an educational organization;
- rating of an educational organization based on scientometric data;
- load on the teaching staff.
- compliance of the quality of educational services with state standards;
- some assessment methods.
- The practical significance of the study is the possibility of using its results when

assessing the quality of educational services in Russia.

REFERENCES

- ASANOVA, I. M.; SYRTSEV, A. N. **Internal audit methodology**. 2019. Available: https://akvobr.ru/metodika_vnutrennego_audita.html. Access: 10 Jan. 2021.
- BABAKAEV, S. *et al.* New approaches to assessing consumer preferences. **International Journal of Innovation, Creativity, and Change**, v. 8, n. 10, p. 153-170, 2019.
- BABAKAYEV, S. V. *et al.* The influence of personal characteristics on the formation of consumer preferences for goods and services. **International Journal of Management and Business Research**, v. 8, n. 1, p.108-119, 2018.
- BAKAR, A. A. *et al.* Investigating Rationales of Malaysia Quality of Life and Wellbeing Components and Indicators. **Procedia–Social and Behavioral Sciences**, v. 222, p. 132-142. 2016.
- CHARLES, V.; DIAZ, G. A Non-radial DEA Index for Peruvian Regional Competitiveness. **Social Indicators Research**, v. 2, n. 134, p. 747-770, 2017.
- DRONDIN, A. L. Independent assessment of the quality of Russian higher education: What is the point and what can be improved. **Vyshee Obrazovanie v Rossii**, v. 29, n. 2, p. 41-49, 2020.
- ESCOBAR-JIMENEZ, C.; DELGADO, A. Quality and Quality in Higher Education: A Theoretical Discussion in Ecuadorian Higher Education System. **Revista de Docencia Universitaria**, v. 17, n. 2, p. 159-175, 2019.
- GRONROOS, C. A service quality model and its marketing implications. **European Journal of Marketing**, v. 4, n. 18, p. 36-44, 1991.
- IVANOV, A. V. *et al.* Development of volitional qualities of adolescent in the pedagogy of consciousness. **Eurasian Journal of Analytical Chemistry**, v. 13, n. 1, 2018. DOI:10.29333/ejac/102252.
- IVANOV, A. V. *et al.* Ethical concepts of pedagogy of consciousness as a foundation for the development of the school for the future. **Astra Salvensis**, v. 6, p.453-462, 2018.
- IVANOV, A. V. *et al.* Pedagogical conditions for developing a sense of responsibility in adolescents and youth. **International Journal of Civil Engineering and Technology**, v. 9, n. 11, p. 1809-1821, 2018.
- JAMES, A. **Is Education Underfunded in Resource-Rich Economies?** Evidence from a Panel of U.S. States. UAA, Department of Economics Working Papers, 2015.
- KOVTUNETS, V.; LONDAR, S. Evaluation of higher education services cost. **Economic Annals-XXI**, v. 178, n. 7-8, p. 57-6, 2019.
- KRECHETNIKOV, K. G.; SILISCHEVA, A. I. **The education market in China Education and upbringing: methods and practice** 2015. Available: <https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/rynok-obrazovaniya-v-kitae>. Access: 10 Jan. 2021.

LIKERT, R. A. **Technique for the Measurement of Attitudes**. N.Y.: McGraw-Hill, 1932.

LUCAS, R. E. On the Mechanics of Economic Development. **Journal of Monetary Economics**, v. 1, n. 22, p. 3–42, 1988.

NATIONAL information center on the recognition of education and (or) qualifications, academic degrees, and titles obtained in a foreign state FSBI "Glavexpertcenter". Great Britain: Education systems by country.

NATIONAL INFORMATION CENTER. Finland: **Education management system**.

NENADAL, J. Comprehensive quality assessment of Czech higher education institutions. **IJQSS**, v. 7, n. 2/3, p. 138–151, 2015.

POLAT, S. The Expansion of Higher Education in Turkey: Access, Equality, and Regional Return to Education. **Structural Change and Economic Dynamics**. V. 43, p. 1–14. 2017.

RUPOVA, R. M. Development of the international market for educational services: socio-philosophical and marketing analysis. **Social policy and sociology**, v. 2, n. 135, p. 149–157, 2020.

SCHULTZ, TH. W. Investment in Human Capital. **The American Economic Review**, v. 1, n. 51, p. 1–17, 1961.

SEREGINA, V. **Education in Brazil**. 2012.

SERGEEVA, S. Y. Modern approaches and methods for assessing the quality of education. **Young scientist**, v. 37, n. 275, p. 162-165, 2019.

WALDMAN, I. A. Features of the organization of monitoring of educational achievements in the countries of the world: a national assessment of progress in education in the United States. **Problems of modern education**, n. 5, p. 13–34, 2014.

How to reference this article

TARASOVA, M. I.; BRONNIKOVA, E. M.; KULYAMINA, O. S.; VASILEVA, L. A.; PONYASHOVA, A. S. Improvement of the quality of education, approaches, and methods for assessing the quality of educational services. **Revista on line de Política e Gestão Educacional**, Araraquara, v. 25, n. esp. 7, p. 4075-4087, Dec. 2021. e-ISSN:1519-9029. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.22633/rpge.v25iesp.7.16167>

Submitted: 13/03/2021

Required revisions: 26/07/2021

Approved: 28/11/2021

Published: 31/12/2021

Processing and editing: Editora Ibero-Americana de Educação.
Correction, formatting, normalization and translation.

